



Planning & Development Services

Boise City Hall, 2nd Floor
150 N. Capitol Boulevard
P. O. Box 500
Boise, Idaho 83701-0500

Phone: 208/384-3830
Fax: 208/384-3753
TDD/TTY: 800/377-3529
Website: www.cityofboise.org/pds

2

Planning Division Staff Report

File Number	DRH08-00097
Applicant	George Booth
Property Address	1209 North 16 th Street
Public Hearing Date	April 28, 2008
Heard by	Historic Preservation Commission
Analyst	Julie Archambeault
Checked By	Sarah Schafer

Public Notification

Radius notices mailed to adjacent properties: **April 15, 2008**
Staff posted notice on site on: **April 11, 2008**

Table of Contents

1. Project Data and Facts	2
2. Land Use	2
3. Project Proposal	3
4. Ordinance / Standards	4
5. Analysis / Findings	4
6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions	4

1. Project Data and Facts

Applicant/Status	George Booth / Owner
Architect/Representative	Ryan McCaene / Cabal Architects
Location of Property	1209 North 16 th Street
Size of Property	7,930 sq. ft.
Present Zoning and Land Use	R-1CH (Single-Family Residential)
Historic District	North End
Date of Construction	Pre 1912
Style	Queen Anne
Status	Contributing
Square Footage of Existing House	2,529 sq. ft.

Description of Applicant's Request

The applicant is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish a rear addition and a rear dormer and construct a two-story addition on the rear of the main dwelling.

2. Land Use

Description and Character of Surrounding Area

The surrounding area has a mix of house styles and sizes. The houses to the north of the subject house are single-story structures, while the house to the south is another 1 ½ story house. The houses across the street are mainly 1 ½ story structures.

Site Characteristics

The site is a large parcels made up of two 25' lots and 15' of another lot. The house sits at the north side of the parcel. Landscaping consists of smaller trees, lawn and ornamental grasses.

Special Considerations

None

History of Previous Actions

Pre 1912-Construction of house
1953-Construct garage
1964-Brace flooring of front porch
2002-Replace porch pillars, other front porch restoration work; replace side window with doors

3. Project Proposal

Site Design

Land Use	Existing	Proposed
Percentage of the site devoted to building coverage:	23%	25%
Percentage of the site devoted to paving:	11%	10%
Percentage of the site devoted to landscaping:	66%	65%
TOTAL	100%	100%

Setbacks

Yard	Required	Proposed for Building	Proposed for Garage
Front (east)	15' (bldg.) 20' (garage)	No change	No change
Side (north)	5' (bldg.) 5' (garage)	7'	No change
Side (south)	5' (bldg.) 5' (garage)	32'	No change
Rear (west)	15' (bldg.) 0' (garage)	40'	No change

Fencing

A 6' wood fence lines the perimeter of the property.

Structure(s) Design

Number and Proposed Use of Buildings	Two buildings exist-a single-family dwelling and a garage.
Maximum Building Height	Existing house-26'; Addition-25' 6"
Number of Stories	Existing house-1 ½ ; Addition-2

4. Ordinance / Standards

Section	
11-04-04.01	General Standards
2-18-09	Historic Preservation Ordinance
4.1	Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts
	Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Structures

5. Analysis/Findings

Section 2-18-9 (A) (1) (c) Confirmation of Classification

As part of the application process for a Certificate of Appropriateness, the Planning Staff shall confirm the contributing or non-contributing classification of the property based on the criteria set forth in the definitions of Section 2-18-02.

- A. A property is contributing if
 - 1. it was present during the period of significance, AND
 - 2. it possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time
 - i. Location
 - ii. Design
 - iii. Setting
 - iv. Materials
 - v. Workmanship
 - vi. Feeling
 - vii. Association
 - 3. it is capable of yielding important information about the period OR
 - 4. it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria
- B. A property is noncontributing if
 - 1. it was not present during the period of significance,
 - 2. due to alterations, disturbances, additions, or other changes, it no longer possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time OR
 - 3. it is incapable of yielding important information about the period OR
 - 4. it does not individually meet the National Register eligibility criteria

The property retains its historic integrity. It has retained most of its original materials, design and workmanship. It expresses its significance as a turn of the century building and its link with early 19th century architecture. Its location has not changed and its setting has remained the same. The property is contributing.

Section 2-18-9 (C) Demolition or Relocation.

Findings—In order for the Commission to approve a demolition or relocation request at least three (3) out of the five (5) following Findings must be met:

- A. That the building, project, site or structure is not classified as contributory to the District.

The site is classified as contributory to the District. The applicant has not met this Finding.

- B. That the building, object, site or structure cannot reasonably meet National, State or Local criteria for designation as an historical or architectural landmark.

The property does not have enough architectural or historical significance to reasonably meet National, State or Local criteria for designation as an historical or architectural landmark. The applicant has met this Finding.

- C. That demolition of the building, object, site or structure would not adversely affect the character of the District and/or the adjacent properties.

The rear porch has been substantially altered. Its demolition will not adversely affect the character of the District or the adjacent properties. The rear dormer is a small feature and cannot be seen from the rest of the District. Its loss will not adversely affect the character of the District or the adjacent properties. The applicant has met this Finding.

- D. That the owner has reasonably demonstrated that rehabilitation of the building, object, site or structure would not be economically feasible.

This alternative has not been explored. The applicant has not met this Finding.

- E. That plans have been submitted to redevelop the property if the demolition proceeds and such plans will have a positive effect on the District and/or adjacent properties.

Plans have been submitted to replace the rear porch and dormer with a two-story addition with bump-outs on each side elevation. With the conditions of approval, these plans will have a positive effect on the District. The applicant has met this Finding.

The applicant has met three out of five Findings.

Discussion

Built in 1910, according to the Ada County Assessor, the structure was constructed with open front and rear porches. Sometime after 1956, the rear porch was enclosed. In 2002, the front porch was restored. Pictures from that project show the porch leaning and show rectilinear pillars. Today, the porch appears more stable and has battered pillars. Other minor work has been done to the house. These minor alterations have not adversely affected the site's historic integrity.

The project includes the demolition of the enclosed rear porch and the rear dormer and construction of a two-story addition with a bay window on the south side of the first floor and a projection from the north side of the second floor. For reasons stated below, the addition is congruous. The bay window is also congruous. It resembles the one currently on the house. However, the second floor projection is not congruous. Its shed roofline is not congruous with the steeply pitched gable rooflines on the rest of the house. Also, its cantilevered position on the second story is unlike any other form on the house.

6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions

Pursuant to Boise City Code 2-18-9 A and B of Boise Municipal Code, the request to demolish a rear addition and a rear dormer and construct a two-story addition on the rear of the main dwelling is congruous with the historical, architectural, archeological, educational or cultural aspects of the Historic District because:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (1995 Edition), the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Districts, the North End Plan and the Boise City Comprehensive Plan are references often utilized by the Historic Preservation Commission to determine whether a change is congruous with the historic and architectural qualities of the Historic District.

1. In order for the Commission to approve a demolition or relocation request at least three out of the five Findings must be met. (2-18-9C) Three of the five Findings have been met. The site cannot meet landmark status, the demolition of the rear enclosed porch and rear dormer will not adversely affect the District or the adjacent properties, and the submitted plans will have a positive effect on the District and the adjacent properties.
2. The Commission's decision in regard to Certificates of Appropriateness for alterations, as described in 2-18-09 (A), shall be based on six Findings as applicable to that property. (2-18-11 01)
 - a. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not in a commercial district. This Finding does not apply.
 - b. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. With the conditions of approval, this application complies with the following guidelines.
 - i. "Set back a new addition from the primary façade of the original building to maintain original proportion, massing, size, and scale." (4.1.2) The addition is set 45' back from the front elevation.

- ii. "Relate rooflines, the pitch, and orientation of the new addition to the primary building." (4.1.3) With the condition of approval, the rooflines of the addition are related in orientation and pitch to the primary building.
 - iii. "Use similar materials as found on the original building." (4.1.6) The new addition will use materials similar to those found on the original building including wood windows, siding and shakes.
 - iv. "Maintain proportional lot coverage as found on the neighboring properties of the same block; maximum lot coverage of all buildings should not exceed 30% of the total lot area. Minimum open space should be 40% of the total lot area. Any exceptions to these percentages will be closely scrutinized." (4.1.10) The addition will raise the lot coverage to 25%.
- c. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction.) This application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. With the conditions of approval, this application complies with the following requirements.
 - i. "Placing a new addition on a non-character-defining elevation and limiting the size and scale in relationship to the historic building." (pg. 113) The new addition will be placed on the rear elevation and will be limited in height and width to that of the historic building.
 - ii. "The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment." (pg. 62) The new work will be differentiated from the old through broken wall planes and will be compatible with the historic building through the use of compatible shapes and materials.
 - iii. "Designing new exterior additions to historic buildings or adjacent new construction which is compatible with the historic character of the site and which preserves the historic relationship between the building or buildings and the landscape. (pg.105) The new addition is compatible with the historic character of the site. It will use materials and shapes that match those on the historic building.
- d. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. With the conditions of approval, the application is in compliance with the following goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan and the North End Plan.
 - i. The proposed use or design of the property should reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood and be compatible with it. (North End Plan pg. 17) The design of the addition will reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood and be compatible with it by using materials and forms compatible to the existing building.

- ii. The unique character of the neighborhood should be maintained, including architectural style, sitting on the lots, orientation of the units and landscaping characteristics. (North End Plan, pg. 18) The unique character of the neighborhood will be maintained through the use of compatible design and materials.
 - iii. Protect historically and culturally significant resources that contribute to community identity and history. (Boise City Comprehensive Plan, pg 5-12) The historically and culturally significant resource, the subject home, will be protected by constructing an addition that is compatible with the existing building.
- e. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the district. With the conditions of approval, the project is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education or cultural aspects of the district because it complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts and the North End Plan.
- f. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the district and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. This application complies with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the request for any variances.
3. A contributing building, site, structure or object adds to the historic architectural qualities, historic associations, or archeological values for which a property is significant because (a) it was present during the period of significance, and possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time or is capable of yielding important information about the period, or (b) it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria.

Site Specific Conditions of Approval

1. Compliance with plans and specifications submitted to and on file in the Planning and Development Services Department dated received April 14, 2008.
 - a. The shed roofed projection will not be constructed.

Standard Conditions of Approval

2. The applicant shall comply with the Boise City Fire Code.

3. Prior to a Building Permit and prior to any construction on the site, an Erosion and Sediment Control Permit must be obtained from the Building Division of the Planning and Development Services Department.
4. No change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall be valid unless in writing and signed by the applicant or his authorized representative and an authorized representative of the City of Boise. The burden shall be upon the applicant to obtain the written confirmation of any change and not upon the City of Boise.
5. Any change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall require the applicant to comply with all rules, regulations, ordinances, plans or other regulatory and legal restrictions in force at the time the applicant or successors in interest advise the City of intent to change the planned use of the property described herein unless a variance in said requirements or other legal relief is granted pursuant to the law in effect at the time the change in use is sought.
6. If the applicant does not act on the Certificate of Appropriateness through the commencement of construction, or extended pursuant to the Boise City Code, within eighteen months, it will become null and void without further notification from this department.
7. The applicant shall be required to obtain a Building Permit prior to the start of construction.

Construction Site Requirements

8. The practices required below are intended to mitigate the impact and disturbance of residential property owners during the construction of adjacent buildings or structures. The following conditions apply to all construction-related activities ranging from grading and demolition activities to final occupancy on any land or parcel falling under the proprietary ownership of the permit applicant.
 - a) Prior to the issuance of a building permit and prior to the commencement of any construction on-site, an Erosion and Sediment Control (ESC) permit must be obtained from the Planning and Development Services Department. No grading, demolition or earth disturbing activities may start until an approved ESC permit and the associated site work or grading permits have been issued.
 - b) Measures shall be taken to manage construction debris and trash on the construction site and efforts shall also be made to provide reasonable controls to minimize fugitive dust on the construction site. Such measures shall include, but are not limited to:
 - Provide suitable containers for solid waste generated by construction activity;
 - Wet demolition of existing buildings;
 - Watering of driving surfaces and earth moving activities;

- Installation of wind screening around property and each open floor above grade; and
 - Daily broom cleaning of above grade floors, adjacent streets and sidewalks.
- c) To reduce the noise impact of construction on nearby residential properties, all exterior construction activities shall be limited to the hours between 7:00 a.m. and 7:00 p.m. Monday through Friday and 8:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. for Saturday and Sunday. Low noise impact activities such as surveying, layout and weather protection may be performed at any time. After each floor of the structure or building is enclosed with exterior walls and windows, interior construction of the enclosed floors can be performed at any time.
- d) A minimum height of six foot (6') rigid security fencing, either wood or metal, shall be installed around the construction site within 30 days of the date when the first city permit is issued on projects where construction activity shall exceed 90 days.
- e) Exterior lighting and other illuminating equipment or materials shall be positioned, shielded, directed and located to not reflect or impact adjacent residential property and streets.
- f) Applicant shall comply with Boise City Fire Department requirements for water, access, and/or other requirements as determined by the Fire Marshal.
- g) Any conditions to be enforced during construction shall remain posted at each street abutting the construction site for the duration of the project. In addition to the posted conditions the permit holder shall also post an 11"x 17" laminated sign containing a project contact phone number, name of project contact and the Boise City contact number, 384-3845, to address issues as they arise. Failure to abide by any conditions set forth shall be grounds for revocation of Conditional Use Permit and/or Building Permits and may be subject the owner or owner's agents to fines and criminal citations.