



Planning & Development Services

Boise City Hall, 2nd Floor
150 N. Capitol Boulevard
P. O. Box 500
Boise, Idaho 83701-0500

Phone: 208/384-3830
Fax: 208/384-3753
TDD/TTY: 800/377-3529
Website: www.cityofboise.org/pds

3

Planning Division Staff Report

File Number	DRH08-00099
Applicant	Ryan Doyle
Property Address	818 Eastman
Public Hearing Date	April 28, 2008
Heard by	Historic Preservation Commission
Analyst	Julie Archambeault
Checked By	Sarah Schafer

Public Notification

Radius notices mailed to adjacent properties: **April 15, 2008**
Staff posted notice on site on: **April 11, 2008**

Table of Contents

1. Project Data and Facts	2
2. Land Use	2
3. Project Proposal	3
4. Ordinance / Standards	4
5. Analysis / Findings	4
6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions	4

1. Project Data and Facts

Applicant/Status	Ryan Doyle / Owner
Architect/Representative	Weston Shuette / Erstad Architects
Location of Property	818 Eastman
Size of Property	9,750 sq. ft.
Present Zoning and Land Use	R-1CH (Single-Family Residential)
Historic District	North End
Date of Construction	1890
Style	No style
Status	Non-contributing
Square Footage of Existing House	2,014 sq. ft.

Description of Applicant's Request

The applicant is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a front porch and replace the windows and the doors.

2. Land Use

Description and Character of Surrounding Area

The surrounding area is populated with historic homes, most of which have retained their historic integrity, although some have been altered. The homes are a mix of heights and styles.

Site Characteristics

The site is a large corner lot. The house sits close to the side street and within 24' of the front setback. There are several trees on the lot.

Special Considerations

None

History of Previous Actions

1890-Construction of house
1957-Rside dwelling and garage with asbestos siding; new garage doors
1977-Construct a 10' x 30' addition to the front of the building (replace and extend front porch)
1978-Reside dwelling with aluminum siding

3. Project Proposal

Site Design

Land Use	Existing	Proposed
Percentage of the site devoted to building coverage:	14%	15%
Percentage of the site devoted to paving:	5%	5%
Percentage of the site devoted to landscaping:	81%	80%
TOTAL	100%	100%

Setbacks

Yard	Required	Proposed for Building	Proposed for Garage
Front (southwest)	15' (bldg.) 20' (garage)	16'	No change
Side Street (southeast)	15' (bldg.) 15' (garage)	22' 3"	No change
Side (northwest)	5' (bldg.) 5' (garage)	17' 6"	No change
Rear (northeast)	15' (bldg.) 0' (garage)	No change	No change

Fencing

A 6' wood fence lines the rear yard. No changes are proposed.

Structure(s) Design

Number and Proposed Use of Buildings	Two buildings exist-a single-family dwelling and a small garage.
Maximum Building Height	Existing-18' 2"; proposed-13' 9"
Number of Stories	1

4. Ordinance / Standards

Section	
11-04-04.01	General Standards
2-18-09	Historic Preservation Ordinance
4.1	Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts
	Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Structures

5. Analysis/Findings

Section 2-18-9 (A) (1) (c) Confirmation of Classification

As part of the application process for a Certificate of Appropriateness, the Planning Staff shall confirm the contributing or non-contributing classification of the property based on the criteria set forth in the definitions of Section 2-18-02.

- A. A property is contributing if
 - 1. it was present during the period of significance, AND
 - 2. it possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time
 - i. Location
 - ii. Design
 - iii. Setting
 - iv. Materials
 - v. Workmanship
 - vi. Feeling
 - vii. Association
 - 3. it is capable of yielding important information about the period OR
 - 4. it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria
- B. A property is noncontributing if
 - 1. it was not present during the period of significance,
 - 2. due to alterations, disturbances, additions, or other changes, it no longer possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time OR
 - 3. it is incapable of yielding important information about the period OR
 - 4. it does not individually meet the National Register eligibility criteria

The North End's era of significance runs from the early 20th century through the mid-1950s. This building was constructed in 1890. However, it has been heavily altered. It was originally constructed with open porches spanning the front and rear elevations. By 1949, the rear porch was partially enclosed. The siding has been changed twice, and the front porch has been enclosed. The porch was extended 18" on each side to meet the side walls. The windows are a mix of 1/1, fixed pane and 2/2 windows. Because of the extensive alterations to the house, it is non-contributing.

Discussion

The applicant proposes to construct a Craftsman style porch and entry and to change the position of the front door and front window. The front of the house has been so altered that these changes cannot further reduce its historic integrity. Also, these changes will bring the structure more into congruousness with the District. The porch is similar to other, Craftsman style porches in the district.

The new window will be metal clad wood. This is congruous. However, the proposal includes cedar shakes and vinyl siding on the porch. Although the house is clad in aluminum siding, which is not its original cladding, adding vinyl siding to the structure is not a recommended procedure. Also, having three different cladding types, two of which are modern, is not recommended. Wood or Hardiboard siding, both of which are congruous with the district, will match the cedar shakes better and will not add another incongruous element to the house.

6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions

Pursuant to Boise City Code 2-18-9 A and B of Boise Municipal Code, the request to construct a front porch and replace the windows and the doors is congruous with the historical, architectural, archeological, educational or cultural aspects of the Historic District because:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (1995 Edition), the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Districts, the North End Plan and the Boise City Comprehensive Plan are references often utilized by the Historic Preservation Commission to determine whether a change is congruous with the historic and architectural qualities of the Historic District.

1. The Commission's decision in regard to Certificates of Appropriateness for alterations, as described in 2-18-09 (A), shall be based on six findings as applicable to that property. (2-18-11 01)
 - a. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not in a commercial district. This Finding does not apply.
 - b. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. This application complies with the following guidelines.
 - i. "Design a new addition to preserve the established massing and orientation of the building and character of the block." (4.1.1) The addition does not disturb the orientation or massing of the building by being placed on the front of the building and facing Eastman. It preserves the character of the block through its Craftsman inspired congruous design.

- ii. “Maintain proportional lot coverage as found on the neighboring properties of the same block; maximum lot coverage of all buildings should not exceed 30% of the total lot area. Minimum open space should be 40% of the total lot area. Any exceptions to these percentages will be closely scrutinized.” (4.1.10) The addition raises the lot coverage to 15%.
- c. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction.) This application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. This application complies with the following requirements.
 - i. “New work should be compatible with the historic character of the setting in terms of size, scale, design, material, color and texture.” (pg.108) The new work is compatible with the historic character of the setting in its one-story size, its small scale and its Craftsman inspired design. With the conditions of approval, the material, color and texture will also be compatible with the character of the setting.
- d. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. The application is in compliance with the following goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan and the North End Plan.
 - i. The unique character of the neighborhood should be maintained, including architectural style, sitting on the lots, orientation of the units and landscaping characteristics. (p. 18) The Craftsman inspired design and compatible size of the addition ensures that the unique character of the neighborhood will be maintained.
- e. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the district. The project is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education or cultural aspects of the district because it complies with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts and the North End Plan.
- f. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the district and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. This application complies with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the request for any variances.

2. A contributing building, site, structure or object adds to the historic architectural qualities, historic associations, or archeological values for which a property is significant because (a) it was present during the period of significance, and possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time or is capable of yielding important information about the period, or (b) it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria. The structure has been significantly altered and is not contributing.

Site Specific Conditions of Approval

1. Compliance with plans and specifications submitted to and on file in the Planning and Development Services Department dated received March 31, 2008.
 - a. The porch siding will be wood or smooth Hardiboard.

Standard Conditions of Approval

2. The applicant shall comply with the Boise City Fire Code.
3. Prior to a Building Permit and prior to any construction on the site, an Erosion and Sediment Control Permit must be obtained from the Building Division of the Planning and Development Services Department.
4. No change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall be valid unless in writing and signed by the applicant or his authorized representative and an authorized representative of the City of Boise. The burden shall be upon the applicant to obtain the written confirmation of any change and not upon the City of Boise.
5. Any change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall require the applicant to comply with all rules, regulations, ordinances, plans or other regulatory and legal restrictions in force at the time the applicant or successors in interest advise the City of intent to change the planned use of the property described herein unless a variance in said requirements or other legal relief is granted pursuant to the law in effect at the time the change in use is sought.
6. If the applicant does not act on the Certificate of Appropriateness through the commencement of construction, or extended pursuant to the Boise City Code, within eighteen months, it will become null and void without further notification from this department.
7. The applicant shall be required to obtain a Building Permit prior to the start of construction.

Construction Site Requirements

8. The practices required below are intended to mitigate the impact and disturbance of residential property owners during the construction of adjacent buildings or structures. The following conditions apply to all construction-related activities ranging from grading and demolition activities to final occupancy on any land or parcel falling under the proprietary ownership of the permit applicant.
- a) Prior to the issuance of a building permit and prior to the commencement of any construction on-site, an Erosion and Sediment Control (ESC) permit must be obtained from the Planning and Development Services Department. No grading, demolition or earth disturbing activities may start until an approved ESC permit and the associated site work or grading permits have been issued.
 - b) Measures shall be taken to manage construction debris and trash on the construction site and efforts shall also be made to provide reasonable controls to minimize fugitive dust on the construction site. Such measures shall include, but are not limited to:
 - Provide suitable containers for solid waste generated by construction activity;
 - Wet demolition of existing buildings;
 - Watering of driving surfaces and earth moving activities;
 - Installation of wind screening around property and each open floor above grade; and
 - Daily broom cleaning of above grade floors, adjacent streets and sidewalks.
 - c) To reduce the noise impact of construction on nearby residential properties, all exterior construction activities shall be limited to the hours between 7:00 a.m. and 7:00 p.m. Monday through Friday and 8:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. for Saturday and Sunday. Low noise impact activities such as surveying, layout and weather protection may be performed at any time. After each floor of the structure or building is enclosed with exterior walls and windows, interior construction of the enclosed floors can be performed at any time.
 - d) A minimum height of six foot (6') rigid security fencing, either wood or metal, shall be installed around the construction site within 30 days of the date when the first city permit is issued on projects where construction activity shall exceed 90 days.
 - e) Exterior lighting and other illuminating equipment or materials shall be positioned, shielded, directed and located to not reflect or impact adjacent residential property and streets.
 - f) Applicant shall comply with Boise City Fire Department requirements for water, access, and/or other requirements as determined by the Fire Marshal.

- g) Any conditions to be enforced during construction shall remain posted at each street abutting the construction site for the duration of the project. In addition to the posted conditions the permit holder shall also post an 11"x 17" laminated sign containing a project contact phone number, name of project contact and the Boise City contact number, 384-3845, to address issues as they arise. Failure to abide by any conditions set forth shall be grounds for revocation of Conditional Use Permit and/or Building Permits and may be subject the owner or owner's agents to fines and criminal citations.