

## **Planning & Development Services**

Boise City Hall, 2nd Floor 150 N. Capitol Boulevard P. O. Box 500

Boise, Idaho 83701-0500

Phone: 208/384-3830 Fax: 208/384-3753 TDD/TTY: 800/377-3529

Website: www.cityofboise.org/pds

## MEMORANDUM

MEMO TO: Historic Preservation Commission

FROM: Julie Archambeault

Historic Preservation Planner

Boise City Planning and Development Services

RE: DRH08-00054 / 616 Fort Street

DATE: April 28, 2008

**NIRMAL CHARAN** requests Historic Preservation approval to construct an addition to the east side of the structure, replace the foundation, roof, windows and doors on property located at 616 Fort Street in an R-3HD (Multi-Family Residential with Historic Design Review) zone.

**Project History:** This project was originally scheduled for the March 24, 2008 hearing of the Historic Preservation Commission. The Commission had concerns regarding several design issues including lot coverage, the lengthening of the front porch, the residential floor area and the roof details. The item was deferred to the April 28, 2008 hearing to allow time for a redesign of the project.

## **Discussion**

Several of the issues of concern have been addressed. The roof forms are all hipped and the dentils and the repetition of the front gable detail have been deleted from the design. This makes the roof more compatible with the existing house. Also, the basement has been sunk so that it is now at a depth of 4' and the addition may qualify as a 1 ½ story, rather than a 2-story addition. The front porch is not lengthened. Finally, the square footage of the house has been recounted to be more accurate and is now 34.8%, while the residential floor area is 52.5%. Because of the unique size and configuration of the lot 34.8% is acceptable for this project.

**Staff Recommendations:** Staff recommends approval of the project based on the new design

## **Findings**

- 1. The Commission's decision in regard to Certificates of Appropriateness for alterations, as described in 2-18-09 (A), shall be based on six Findings as applicable to that property. (2-18-11 01)
  - 1. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not in a commercial district. This Finding does not apply.
  - 2. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. This application complies with the following guidelines.
    - i. "Set back a new addition from the primary façade of the original building to maintain original proportion, massing, size, and scale." (4.1.2) The addition is set 5' back from the front elevation.
    - ii. "Relate rooflines, the pitch, and orientation of the new addition to the primary building." (4.1.3) The rooflines of the addition are related in orientation, design and pitch to the primary building.
    - iii. "Use similar materials as found on the original building." (4.1.6) The new addition will use materials similar to those found on the original building including wood windows and wood siding.
    - iv. "Maintain proportional lot coverage as found on the neighboring properties of the same block; maximum lot coverage of all buildings should not exceed 30% of the total lot area. Minimum open space should be 40% of the total lot area. Any exceptions to these percentages will be closely scrutinized." (4.1.10) The addition will raise the lot coverage to 34.8%. Because of the tapering configuration of the lot and the small lot size, this lot coverage is congruous.
  - 3. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction.) This application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. T, this application complies with the following requirements.
    - i. "Placing a new addition on a non-character-defining elevation and limiting the size and scale in relationship to the historic building." (pg. 113) The new addition will be placed on the side elevation and will be limited in scale to that of the historic building.
    - ii. "The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment." (pg. 62) The new work will be differentiated from the old through broken wall planes and will be compatible with the historic building through the use of compatible shapes and materials.

- iii. "Designing new exterior additions to historic buildings or adjacent new construction which is compatible with the historic character of the site and which preserves the historic relationship between the building or buildings and the landscape. (pg.105) The new addition is compatible with the historic character of the site. It will use materials and shapes that match those on the historic building.
- 4. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. T, the application is in compliance with the following goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan and the North End Plan.
  - The proposed use or design of the property should reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood and be compatible with it. North End Plan pg. 17 The design of the addition will reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood and be compatible with it by using materials and forms compatible to the existing building.
  - ii. The unique character of the neighborhood should be maintained, including architectural style, sitting on the lots, orientation of the units and landscaping characteristics. (North End Plan, pg. 18) The unique character of the neighborhood will be maintained through the use of compatible design and materials.
  - iii. Protect historically and culturally significant resources that contribute to community identity and history. (Boise City Comprehensive Plan, pg 5-12) The historically and culturally significant resource, the subject home, will be protected by constructing an addition that is compatible with the existing building.
- 5. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the district. The project is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education or cultural aspects of the District because it complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts and the North End Plan.
- 6. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the District and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. This application complies with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the request for any variances.

2. A contributing building, site, structure or object adds to the historic architectural qualities, historic associations, or archeological values for which a property is significant because (a) it was present during the period of significance, and possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time or is capable of yielding important information about the period, or (b) it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria.