

DRH08-00094
Bryant Kuechle
1519 N. 8th Street

Reason Statement (Approval)

Pursuant to Boise City Code 2-18-9 A and B of Boise Municipal Code, the request to construct a two-story addition on the rear of the dwelling is congruous with the historical, architectural, archeological, educational or cultural aspects of the Historic District because:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (1995 Edition), the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Districts, the North End Plan and the Boise City Comprehensive Plan are references often utilized by the Historic Preservation Commission to determine whether a change is congruous with the historic and architectural qualities of the Historic District.

1. In order for the Commission to approve a demolition or relocation request at least three out of the five Findings must be met. (2-18-9C) Four of the five Findings have been met. The site is not classified as contributing, it cannot meet landmark status, the rear section's demolition will not adversely affect the District or the adjacent properties, and the submitted plans will have a positive effect on the District and the adjacent properties.
2. The Commission's decision in regard to Certificates of Appropriateness for alterations, as described in 2-18-09 (A), shall be based on six Findings as applicable to that property. (2-18-11 01)
 1. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not in a commercial district. This Finding does not apply.
 2. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. This application complies with the following guidelines.
 - i. "Set back a new addition from the primary façade of the original building to maintain original proportion, massing, size, and scale." (4.1.2) The addition will be set 35' from the front elevation.
 - ii. "Relate rooflines, the pitch, and orientation of the new addition to the primary building." (4.1.3)
 - iii. "Use similar materials as found on the original building." (4.1.6) The addition will bring materials similar to those found on the existing building including metal clad wood windows and Hardiboard siding.
 - iv. "Maintain proportional lot coverage as found on the neighboring properties of the same block; maximum lot coverage of all buildings should not exceed 30% of the total lot area. Minimum open space should be 40% of the total lot area. Any exceptions to these percentages will be closely scrutinized." (4.1.10) The addition will bring the lot coverage up to 30%.

3. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction.) This application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. This application complies with the following requirements.
 - i. "New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment." (pg. 62) The new addition will be differentiated from the existing building through broken wall planes. It will be compatible through compatible forms and materials.
 - ii. "Placing a new addition on a non-character-defining elevation and limiting the size and scale in relationship to the historic building." (pg. 113) The addition will be placed on the rear elevation and be limited in height and width to that of the original structure.
 - iii. "The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided." (pg. 62) The area to be removed does not characterize the property-it is a modern intrusion on the form of the historic property.
4. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. The application is in compliance with the following goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan and the North End Plan.
 - i. The proposed use or design of the property should reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood and be compatible with it. (p. 17) The design of the addition reflects the character of the adjacent neighborhood with its compatible materials and forms and is compatible with the neighborhood.
 - ii. The unique character of the neighborhood should be maintained, including architectural style, sitting on the lots, orientation of the units and landscaping characteristics. (p. 18) The new addition maintains the character of the neighborhood through its compatible materials and design.
5. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the district. The project is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education or cultural aspects of the district because it complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts and the North End Plan.

6. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the district and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. This application complies with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the request for any variances.
3. A contributing building, site, structure or object adds to the historic architectural qualities, historic associations, or archeological values for which a property is significant because (a) it was present during the period of significance, and possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time or is capable of yielding important information about the period, or (b) it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria. The structure's 1940s changes have gained their own significance. The site is contributing.