



Planning & Development Services

Boise City Hall, 2nd Floor
150 N. Capitol Boulevard
P. O. Box 500
Boise, Idaho 83701-0500

Phone: 208/384-3830
Fax: 208/384-3753
TDD/TTY: 800/377-3529
Website: www.cityofboise.org/pds

2

Planning Division Staff Report

File Number	DRH08-000107
Applicant	Anika Smulovitz
Property Address	916 East State Street
Public Hearing Date	May 12, 2008
Heard by	Historic Preservation Commission
Analyst	Julie Archambeault
Checked By	Sarah Schafer

Public Notification

Radius notices mailed to adjacent properties: **March 12, 2008**
Staff posted notice on site on: **March 9, 2008**

Table of Contents

1. Project Data and Facts	2
2. Land Use	2
3. Project Proposal	3
4. Ordinance / Standards	4
5. Analysis / Findings	4
6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions	4

1. Project Data and Facts

Applicant/Status	Anika Smulovitz / Owner
Architect/Representative	Chad Vincent / Renaissance Remodeling
Location of Property	916 East State Street
Size of Property	5,368 sq. ft.
Present Zoning and Land Use	R-2H (Single-Family Residential)
Historic District	East End
Date of Construction	1910
Style	Craftsman / Bungalow
Status	Contributing
Square Footage of Existing House	1,214 sq. ft.

Description of Applicant's Request

The applicant is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a rear addition with unfinished basement.

2. Land Use

Description and Character of Surrounding Area

Across the street from the house is an elementary school. The rest of the neighborhood is dominated by small bungalows.

Site Characteristics

The site has a single family dwelling and three outbuildings. Landscaping includes lawn, trees and smaller plantings.

Special Considerations

None

History of Previous Actions

1910-Construct house
1967-Install comp. shingles over cedar
1975-Construct addition to shed for coal storage

3. Project Proposal

Site Design

Land Use	Existing	Proposed
Percentage of the site devoted to building coverage:	29%	36%
Percentage of the site devoted to paving:	5%	5%
Percentage of the site devoted to landscaping:	66%	59%
TOTAL	100%	100%

Setbacks

Yard	Required	Proposed for Building	Proposed for Garage
Front (south)	15' (bldg.) 20' (garage)	No change	No change
Side (southeast)	15' (bldg.) 15' (garage)	5'	No change
Side (northwest)	5' (bldg.) 5' (garage)	20'	No change
Rear (north)	15' (bldg.) 9' (garage)	30'	No change

Fencing

None

Structure(s) Design

Number and Proposed Use of Buildings	Four buildings exist-one single family dwelling and three outbuildings.
Maximum Building Height	18' 4"-existing; 15' 4"-proposed
Number of Stories	1

4. Ordinance / Standards

Section	
11-04-04.01	General Standards
2-18-09	Historic Preservation Ordinance
4.1	Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts
	Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Structures

5. Analysis/Findings

Section 2-18-9 (A) (1) (c) Confirmation of Classification

As part of the application process for a Certificate of Appropriateness, the Planning Staff shall confirm the contributing or non-contributing classification of the property based on the criteria set forth in the definitions of Section 2-18-02.

- A. A property is contributing if
1. it was present during the period of significance, AND
 2. it possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time
 - i. Location
 - ii. Design
 - iii. Setting
 - iv. Materials
 - v. Workmanship
 - vi. Feeling
 - vii. Association
 3. it is capable of yielding important information about the period OR
 4. it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria
- B. A property is noncontributing if
1. it was not present during the period of significance,
 2. due to alterations, disturbances, additions, or other changes, it no longer possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time OR
 3. it is incapable of yielding important information about the period OR
 4. it does not individually meet the National Register eligibility criteria

The East End's era of significance runs from the first developments in 1890 through the end of the period of rapid growth in 1940. The property was constructed in 1910.

The property retains its integrity. It remains in the same location. Its setting is very similar to its condition during the era of significance including the layout of streets and sidewalks and the surrounding historic homes. The design and materials of the home remain almost unchanged. The porch has been enclosed, but it maintains the appearance of a porch, rather than an interior space. The workmanship necessary to construct the house remains in the original materials, the stonework and the design. The feeling and association also remain. The property is contributing.

Section 2-18-11.01 Alteration - Findings

The Commission's decision in regard to Certificates of Appropriateness for alterations, as described in 2-18-09 (A), shall be based on the following findings as applicable to that property:

Discussion

The addition is congruous in its design. It is set apart from the original construction, it is limited in size and scale to the original building, and used materials similar to those used on the original structure. The roof forms and massing are also similar.

It is not congruous in its lot coverage, however. The addition will raise the lot coverage to 36%. The lot coverage is currently 29%. Therefore, constructing a useable addition that remains under 30% lot coverage is not possible. However, with a repurposing of the space, a useable addition could be gained with 33% lot coverage, rather than 36%.

6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions

Pursuant to Boise City Code 2-18-9 A and B of Boise Municipal Code, the request to construct a rear addition with unfinished basement is congruous with the historical, architectural, archeological, educational or cultural aspects of the Historic District because:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (1995 Edition), the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Districts, the North End Plan and the Boise City Comprehensive Plan are references often utilized by the Historic Preservation Commission to determine whether a change is congruous with the historic and architectural qualities of the Historic District.

1. The Commission's decision in regard to Certificates of Appropriateness for alterations, as described in 2-18-09 (A), shall be based on six Findings as applicable to that property. (2-18-11 01)
 - A. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not in a commercial district.

- B. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. With the condition of approval, this application complies with the following guidelines.
- i. "Set back a new addition from the primary façade of the original building to maintain original proportion, massing, size, and scale." (4.1.2) The new addition will be set approximately 45' back from the front elevation.
 - ii. "Relate rooflines, the pitch, and orientation of the new addition to the primary building." (4.1.3) The roofline of the addition will be related in pitch and orientation with that of the original roofline.
 - iii. Use similar materials as those found on the original building. (4.1.6) The addition will use materials similar to those found on the original building including cedar shake siding and wood windows.
 - iv. "Consider ground or basement additions before the addition of dormer(s). Under unique circumstances driven by site constraints, dormer(s) additions should be designed in proportional scale to the original roof and should not visually compete." (4.1.8) The addition is a ground addition.
 - v. "Maintain proportional lot coverage as found on the neighboring properties of the same block; maximum lot coverage of all buildings should not exceed 30% of the total lot area. Minimum open space should be 40% of the total lot area. Any exceptions to these percentages will be closely scrutinized." (4.1.10) The lot coverage will be 33%. Because of the existing 29% lot coverage, some overage of the recommended 30% is acceptable, and 3% is a small amount to exceed the recommendation.
- C. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction.) This application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. With the condition of approval, this application complies with the following requirements.
- i. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment. (pg. 62) The new work will be differentiated from the old through broken wall planes and a lower roofline. It will be compatible with the existing house through the use of similar forms and materials.
 - ii. Designing new exterior additions to historic buildings or adjacent new construction which is compatible with the historic character of the site and which preserves the historic relationship between the building or buildings and the landscape. (pg.105) The addition is compatible with the historic character of the site through its use of similar forms and materials.

- iii. Place a new addition on a non-character-defining elevation and limiting the size and scale in relationship to the historic building. (pg. 113) The new addition will be placed on the rear elevation and will be limited in height and width to the existing building.
- D. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. With the condition of approval, the application is in compliance with the following goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan and the East End Plan.
- i. Encourage the preservation of the historic character and scale of the near east end, and the adaptive reuse of historic structures. Pg 2-9 The addition will preserve the historic character and scale of the East End.
 - ii. New development within the North End/East End shall be designed to reflect elements of the historic architecture and design that exist in the area. Policy 7, pg 8-33 The new addition is designed to reflect elements of the historic architecture and design that exist in the area.
- E. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the District. With the condition of approval, the project is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education or cultural aspects of the District because it complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts and the North End Plan.
- F. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the District and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. This application complies with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the request for any variances.
2. A contributing building, site, structure or object adds to the historic architectural qualities, historic associations, or archeological values for which a property is significant because (a) it was present during the period of significance, and possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time or is capable of yielding important information about the period, or (b) it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria. The property was constructed during the era of significance and retains its integrity. It is contributing.

Site Specific Conditions of Approval

1. Compliance with plans and specifications submitted to and on file in the Planning and Development Services Department dated received April 3, 2008.
 - a. The lot coverage will not exceed 33%.

Standard Conditions of Approval

2. The applicant shall comply with the Boise City Fire Code.
3. Prior to a Building Permit and prior to any construction on the site, an Erosion and Sediment Control Permit must be obtained from the Building Division of the Planning and Development Services Department.
4. No change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall be valid unless in writing and signed by the applicant or his authorized representative and an authorized representative of the City of Boise. The burden shall be upon the applicant to obtain the written confirmation of any change and not upon the City of Boise.
5. Any change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall require the applicant to comply with all rules, regulations, ordinances, plans or other regulatory and legal restrictions in force at the time the applicant or successors in interest advise the City of intent to change the planned use of the property described herein unless a variance in said requirements or other legal relief is granted pursuant to the law in effect at the time the change in use is sought.
6. If the applicant does not act on the Certificate of Appropriateness through the commencement of construction, or extended pursuant to the Boise City Code, within eighteen months, it will become null and void without further notification from this department.
7. The applicant shall be required to obtain a Building Permit prior to the start of construction.

Construction Site Requirements

8. The practices required below are intended to mitigate the impact and disturbance of residential property owners during the construction of adjacent buildings or structures. The following conditions apply to all construction-related activities ranging from grading and demolition activities to final occupancy on any land or parcel falling under the proprietary ownership of the permit applicant.
 - a) Prior to the issuance of a building permit and prior to the commencement of any construction on-site, an Erosion and Sediment Control (ESC) permit must be obtained from the Planning and Development Services Department. No grading, demolition or earth disturbing activities may start until an approved ESC permit and the associated site work or grading permits have been issued.

- b) Measures shall be taken to manage construction debris and trash on the construction site and efforts shall also be made to provide reasonable controls to minimize fugitive dust on the construction site. Such measures shall include, but are not limited to:
 - Provide suitable containers for solid waste generated by construction activity;
 - Wet demolition of existing buildings;
 - Watering of driving surfaces and earth moving activities;
 - Installation of wind screening around property and each open floor above grade; and
 - Daily broom cleaning of above grade floors, adjacent streets and sidewalks.
- c) To reduce the noise impact of construction on nearby residential properties, all exterior construction activities shall be limited to the hours between 7:00 a.m. and 7:00 p.m. Monday through Friday and 8:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. for Saturday and Sunday. Low noise impact activities such as surveying, layout and weather protection may be performed at any time. After each floor of the structure or building is enclosed with exterior walls and windows, interior construction of the enclosed floors can be performed at any time.
- d) A minimum height of six foot (6') rigid security fencing, either wood or metal, shall be installed around the construction site within 30 days of the date when the first city permit is issued on projects where construction activity shall exceed 90 days.
- e) Exterior lighting and other illuminating equipment or materials shall be positioned, shielded, directed and located to not reflect or impact adjacent residential property and streets.
- f) Applicant shall comply with Boise City Fire Department requirements for water, access, and/or other requirements as determined by the Fire Marshal.
- g) Any conditions to be enforced during construction shall remain posted at each street abutting the construction site for the duration of the project. In addition to the posted conditions the permit holder shall also post an 11"x 17" laminated sign containing a project contact phone number, name of project contact and the Boise City contact number, 384-3845, to address issues as they arise. Failure to abide by any conditions set forth shall be grounds for revocation of Conditional Use Permit and/or Building Permits and may be subject the owner or owner's agents to fines and criminal citations.