



Planning & Development Services

Boise City Hall, 2nd Floor
150 N. Capitol Boulevard
P. O. Box 500
Boise, Idaho 83701-0500

Phone: 208/384-3830
Fax: 208/384-3753
TDD/TTY: 800/377-3529
Website: www.cityofboise.org/pds

7

Planning Division Staff Report

File Number	DRH08-00117
Applicant	Jay Henry
Property Address	1116 North 15 th Street
Public Hearing Date	May 12, 2008
Heard by	Historic Preservation Commission
Analyst	Julie Archambeault
Checked By	Sarah Schafer

Public Notification

Radius notices mailed to adjacent properties: **April 25, 2008**
Staff posted notice on site on: **April 28, 2008**

Table of Contents

1. Project Data and Facts	2
2. Land Use	2
3. Project Proposal	3
4. Ordinance / Standards	4
5. Analysis / Findings	4
6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions	4

1. Project Data and Facts

Applicant/Status	Jay Henry / Owner
Architect/Representative	Beth Lassen
Location of Property	1116 North 15 th Street
Size of Property	6,100 sq. ft.
Present Zoning and Land Use	R-1CH
Historic District	North End
Date of Construction	1936
Style	Minimal Traditional
Status	Contributing
Square Footage of Existing House	1,164 sq. ft.

Description of Applicant's Request

The applicant is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish a small rear addition and construct a new rear addition.

2. Land Use

Description and Character of Surrounding Area

The area is characterized by a wide, busy road. The homes on either side are a mix of 1, 1 ½ and 2 story homes of various eras and styles.

Site Characteristics

The site has a small house that is one story in the front and two stories at the rear. There is also a garage at the alley line. Landscaping consists of lawn and a few large trees.

Special Considerations

None

History of Previous Actions

1936-Construct house and garage
1976-Repair fire damage to fence and garage

3. Project Proposal

Site Design

Land Use	Existing	Proposed
Percentage of the site devoted to building coverage:	22%	23%
Percentage of the site devoted to paving:	6%	6%
Percentage of the site devoted to landscaping:	72%	71%
TOTAL	100%	100%

Setbacks

Yard	Required	Proposed for Building	Proposed for Garage
Front (west)	15' (bldg.) 20' (garage)	No change	No change
Side (south)	5' (bldg.) 5' (garage)	17'	No change
Side (north)	5' (bldg.) 5' (garage)	16'	No change
Rear (east)	15' (bldg.) 0' (garage)	62'	No change

Fencing

None

Structure(s) Design

Number and Proposed Use of Buildings	Two buildings exist-a single-family residence and a garage.
Maximum Building Height	21'
Number of Stories	2

4. Ordinance / Standards

Section	
11-04-04.01	General Standards
2-18-09	Historic Preservation Ordinance
4.1	Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts
	Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Structures

5. Analysis/Findings

Section 2-18-9 (A) (1) (c) Confirmation of Classification

As part of the application process for a Certificate of Appropriateness, the Planning Staff shall confirm the contributing or non-contributing classification of the property based on the criteria set forth in the definitions of Section 2-18-02.

- A. A property is contributing if
 - 1. it was present during the period of significance, AND
 - 2. it possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time
 - i. Location
 - ii. Design
 - iii. Setting
 - iv. Materials
 - v. Workmanship
 - vi. Feeling
 - vii. Association
 - 3. it is capable of yielding important information about the period OR
 - 4. it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria
- B. A property is noncontributing if
 - 1. it was not present during the period of significance,
 - 2. due to alterations, disturbances, additions, or other changes, it no longer possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time OR
 - 3. it is incapable of yielding important information about the period OR
 - 4. it does not individually meet the National Register eligibility criteria

The North End's era of significance runs from the early 20th Century through the mid-1950s. This building was constructed in 1936. When constructed, the house had an offset entry. At some point after 1956, an addition to the south side centered the entry. However, according to the Sanborn Maps, the house has been one story in the front and two stories at the rear since 1949. Despite the prominent addition to the south elevation and its picture window, the house remains contributing. It retains the remainder of its unique design, its materials and workmanship. It also retains its feeling and association. Its location and setting have not changed.

The property is contributing.

Section 2-18-9 (C) Demolition or Relocation.

Findings—In order for the Commission to approve a demolition or relocation request at least three (3) out of the five (5) following Findings must be met:

- A. That the building, project, site or structure is not classified as contributory to the District.

The site is classified as contributing to the District. The applicant has not met this Finding.

- B. That the building, object, site or structure cannot reasonably meet National, State or Local criteria for designation as an historical or architectural landmark.

The site has been too altered to reasonably meet National, State or Local criteria for designation as an historical or architectural landmark. The applicant has met this Finding.

- C. That demolition of the building, object, site or structure would not adversely affect the character of the District and/or the adjacent properties.

The rear section to be demolished is a modern addition. Its demolition will not adversely affect the character of the District or the adjacent properties. The applicant has met this Finding.

- D. That the owner has reasonably demonstrated that rehabilitation of the building, object, site or structure would not be economically feasible.

This alternative has not been explored. The applicant has not met this Finding.

- E. That plans have been submitted to redevelop the property if the demolition proceeds and such plans will have a positive effect on the District and/or adjacent properties.

Plans have been submitted to replace the small rear addition with a new, slightly larger addition. These plans will have a positive effect on the District by meeting the Guidelines for Historic Districts and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The applicant has met this Finding.

The applicant has met three out of five Findings.

Discussion

The project proposal is to remove the small structure on the rear elevation that houses the stairs and to rebuild it. The new structure will be slightly larger and have a small porch. The existing structure does not show up on the Sanborn maps and is not visible from the street. Its demolition will not adversely affect the house or the District. The new structure will be small and use similar forms and materials as those currently used on the house. The project is congruous.

6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions

Pursuant to Boise City Code 2-18-9 A and B of Boise Municipal Code, the request to demolish a small rear addition and construct a new rear addition is congruous with the historical, architectural, archeological, educational or cultural aspects of the Historic District because:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (1995 Edition), the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Districts, the North End Plan and the Boise City Comprehensive Plan are references often utilized by the Historic Preservation Commission to determine whether a change is congruous with the historic and architectural qualities of the Historic District.

1. In order for the Commission to approve a demolition or relocation request at least three out of the five Findings must be met. (2-18-9C) Three of the five Findings have been met. The structure cannot meet landmark status, its demolition will not adversely affect the District or the adjacent properties, and the submitted plans will have a positive effect on the District and the adjacent properties.
2. The Commission's decision in regard to Certificates of Appropriateness for alterations, as described in 2-18-09 (A), shall be based on six findings as applicable to that property. (2-18-11 01)
 - A. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not in a commercial district.
 - B. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. This application complies with the following guidelines.
 - i. "Design a new addition to preserve the established massing and orientation of the building and character of the block." (4.1.1) The new addition preserves the established massing and orientation of the building and character of the block by being added to the rear of the building.
 - ii. "Set back a new addition from the primary façade of the original building to maintain original proportion, massing, size, and scale." (4.1.2) The addition will be set approximately 33' back from the front façade. This setback will maintain the original proportion, massing, size and scale.
 - iii. "Relate rooflines, the pitch, and orientation of the new addition to the primary building." (4.1.3) The roofline of the addition will be of an orientation and pitch that are related to the primary building.
 - iv. "Use similar materials as found on the original building." (4.1.6) The addition will use materials similar to those found on the original building including shingles and clad wood windows.

- v. “Maintain proportional lot coverage as found on the neighboring properties of the same block; maximum lot coverage of all buildings should not exceed 30% of the total lot area. Minimum open space should be 40% of the total lot area. Any exceptions to these percentages will be closely scrutinized.” (4.1.10) The addition will raise the lot coverage to 23%.
- C. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction.) This application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. This application complies with the following requirements.
 - i. “Placing a new addition on a non-character-defining elevation and limiting the size and scale in relationship to the historic building.” (pg. 113) The addition will be placed on the rear elevation and will be limited in height, width and scale to that of the historic building.
 - ii. “The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.” (pg. 62) The new work will be differentiated from the old by broken wall planes and rooflines.
- D. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. The application is in compliance with the following goals and objectives of the North End Plan.
 - i. The proposed use or design of the property should reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood and be compatible with it. (p. 17) The design of the rear addition uses materials and forms that reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood and are compatible with it.
 - ii. The unique character of the neighborhood should be maintained, including architectural style, sitting on the lots, orientation of the units and landscaping characteristics. (p. 18) The unique character of the neighborhood will not be altered by this project-the addition will be compatible with the neighborhood and will be placed at the rear of the structure.
- E. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the District. The project is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education or cultural aspects of the District because it complies with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts and the North End Plan.

- F. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the District and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. This application complies with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the request for any variances.

A contributing building, site, structure or object adds to the historic architectural qualities, historic associations, or archeological values for which a property is significant because (a) it was present during the period of significance, and possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time or is capable of yielding important information about the period, or (b) it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria.

3. A contributing building, site, structure or object adds to the historic architectural qualities, historic associations, or archeological values for which a property is significant because (a) it was present during the period of significance, and possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time or is capable of yielding important information about the period, or (b) it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria. The structure was constructed during the era of significance and retains its integrity. It is contributing.

Site Specific Conditions of Approval

1. Compliance with plans and specifications submitted to and on file in the Planning and Development Services Department dated received April 11, 2008.

Standard Conditions of Approval

2. The applicant shall comply with the Boise City Fire Code.
3. Prior to a Building Permit and prior to any construction on the site, an Erosion and Sediment Control Permit must be obtained from the Building Division of the Planning and Development Services Department.
4. No change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall be valid unless in writing and signed by the applicant or his authorized representative and an authorized representative of the City of Boise. The burden shall be upon the applicant to obtain the written confirmation of any change and not upon the City of Boise.
5. Any change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall require the applicant to comply with all rules, regulations, ordinances, plans or other regulatory and legal restrictions in force at the time the applicant or successors in interest advise the City of intent to change the planned use of the property described herein unless a variance in said requirements or other legal relief is granted pursuant to the law in effect at the time the change in use is sought.

6. If the applicant does not act on the Certificate of Appropriateness through the commencement of construction, or extended pursuant to the Boise City Code, within eighteen months, it will become null and void without further notification from this department.
7. The applicant shall be required to obtain a Building Permit prior to the start of construction.

Construction Site Requirements

8. The practices required below are intended to mitigate the impact and disturbance of residential property owners during the construction of adjacent buildings or structures. The following conditions apply to all construction-related activities ranging from grading and demolition activities to final occupancy on any land or parcel falling under the proprietary ownership of the permit applicant.
 - a) Prior to the issuance of a building permit and prior to the commencement of any construction on-site, an Erosion and Sediment Control (ESC) permit must be obtained from the Planning and Development Services Department. No grading, demolition or earth disturbing activities may start until an approved ESC permit and the associated site work or grading permits have been issued.
 - b) Measures shall be taken to manage construction debris and trash on the construction site and efforts shall also be made to provide reasonable controls to minimize fugitive dust on the construction site. Such measures shall include, but are not limited to:
 - Provide suitable containers for solid waste generated by construction activity;
 - Wet demolition of existing buildings;
 - Watering of driving surfaces and earth moving activities;
 - Installation of wind screening around property and each open floor above grade; and
 - Daily broom cleaning of above grade floors, adjacent streets and sidewalks.
 - c) To reduce the noise impact of construction on nearby residential properties, all exterior construction activities shall be limited to the hours between 7:00 a.m. and 7:00 p.m. Monday through Friday and 8:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. for Saturday and Sunday. Low noise impact activities such as surveying, layout and weather protection may be performed at any time. After each floor of the structure or building is enclosed with exterior walls and windows, interior construction of the enclosed floors can be performed at any time.
 - d) A minimum height of six foot (6') rigid security fencing, either wood or metal, shall be installed around the construction site within 30 days of the date when the first city permit is issued on projects where construction activity shall exceed 90 days.

- e) Exterior lighting and other illuminating equipment or materials shall be positioned, shielded, directed and located to not reflect or impact adjacent residential property and streets.
- f) Applicant shall comply with Boise City Fire Department requirements for water, access, and/or other requirements as determined by the Fire Marshal.
- g) Any conditions to be enforced during construction shall remain posted at each street abutting the construction site for the duration of the project. In addition to the posted conditions the permit holder shall also post an 11"x 17" laminated sign containing a project contact phone number, name of project contact and the Boise City contact number, 384-3845, to address issues as they arise. Failure to abide by any conditions set forth shall be grounds for revocation of Conditional Use Permit and/or Building Permits and may be subject the owner or owner's agents to fines and criminal citations.