



## Planning & Development Services

Boise City Hall, 2nd Floor  
150 N. Capitol Boulevard  
P. O. Box 500  
Boise, Idaho 83701-0500

Phone: 208/384-3830  
Fax: 208/384-3753  
TDD/TTY: 800/377-3529  
Website: [www.cityofboise.org/pds](http://www.cityofboise.org/pds)

# Historic Preservation Commission

## Hearing Minutes of April 28, 2008

Commission Members Jennifer Stevens, Chair, Scott Chandler, Cathy Sewell, Barbara Dawson, Betsy McFadden, Bonnie Burry

Members Present Sarah Schafer, Julie Archambeault, Teresa Sobotka, Nicki Heckenlively

---

### **DRH08-00099 / Ryan Doyle / 818 Eastman**

Requests Historic Preservation approval to construct a front porch and replace the windows and the doors on property located in an R-1CH (Single Family Residential with Historic Overlay) zone.

JULIE ARCHAMBEAULT: Presented staff report with a recommendation of approval with the condition that the porch siding will be wood or smooth Hardiboard.

CHAIRMAN STEVENS: Was the applicant amenable to that in your discussions?

JULIE ARCHAMBEAULT: Staff did not get chance to discuss that.

COMMISSIONER McFADDEN: When there is a situation where they are matching an undesirable material are you willing to keep it the same or do you think it is better to get a better material?

JULIE ARCHAMBEAULT: It is difficult? I think matching the material that is on it is fine. I don't know if you can get that kind of aluminum siding anymore. I think if we are going with something different than the existing siding we should bring in something that is congruous with the District.

### SITE VISITS

Commissioners Burry, McFadden, Chandler, Sewell and Dawson viewed the site prior to the hearing. Chairman Stevens did not view the site.

RYAN DOYLE (Applicant): I have no objections. I actually spoke with my contractor and he has actually talked to me about replacing the siding on the whole front of the house to make the whole thing the same material.

COMMISSIONER BURRY: Have you considered shingles? I think it would be a nice look for what you are doing.

RYAN DOYLE: I don't prefer that. I looked at other houses and prefer the changing of the siding.

COMMISSIONER DAWSON: You are re-roofing as well?

RYAN DOYLE: Correct.

COMMISSIONER DAWSON: Is that an old flue? Would it go away?

RYAN DOYLE: Yes.

CHAIRMAN STEVENS: If you would reside would you reside with Hardi-board or another congruous material or vinyl siding?

RYAN DOYLE: No. I would reside with the Hardi-board.

CHAIRMAN STEVENS: So you're okay with the condition of doing it with Hardi-board siding.

JULIE ARCHAMBEAULT: Residing the front is a great idea. It would be a staff level so if you wanted to quicken his journey through our process you might also put that on here. I don't know, when he talks about texture I'm not sure if he met he was going to get a textured Hardi-plank, but you might condition that it be smooth if you so desire.

RYAN DOYLE: The hardi-board would match the texture of the side aluminum siding.

COMMISSIONER McFADDEN: Is that a wood grain texture?

RYAN DOYLE: Yes.

COMMISSIONER McFADDEN: That might not be acceptable because that looks fake. Does that make sense?

CHAIRMAN STEVENS: That's why we typically condition the smooth.

COMMISSIONER McFADDEN: Rather than a faux stamped on wood grain.

RYAN DOYLE: The intent is to match whatever is there. What I have been told by the contractor is that once you paint it you won't notice the difference.

CHAIRMAN STEVENS: Julie, did you notice the wood grain on the aluminum?

JULIE ARCHAMBEAULT: I did not.

CHAIRMAN STEVENS: Typically we don't try to match something that is incongruous. We try not to match something that shouldn't be on the house.

PUBLIC PORTION CLOSED.

COMMISSIONER CHANDLER: On the subject of the wood grain versus the smooth, given that the house is non-contributing, if we felt it was important for it to be smooth, we should require the whole house to be resided and I don't think that is reasonable. It is reasonable that the applicant be allowed to use the wood grain and it would be a more compatible siding with what is there.

COMMISSIONER BURRY: I would agree with Commissioner Chandler. With the fact that he is adding a porch it is going to add so much to the house.

COMMISSIONER DAWSON: I concur. Everything that is being done is a huge improvement.

COMMISSIONER CHANDLER: MOVED TO APPROVE DRH08-00099 WITH THE CONDITION THAT THE SIDING FOR THE PORCH OR FOR THE ENTIRE FRONT OF THE HOUSE BE HARDI-BOARD SIDING IN EITHER WOOD GRAIN OR SMOOTH.

COMMISSIONER McFADDEN SECONDED THE MOTION.

ROLL CALL VOTE 6:0. MOTION CARRIES.