

DRH08-00109
Phil Gerhardson
1511 N. 11th Street

Reason Statement (Denial)

Pursuant to Boise City Code 2-18-9 A and B of Boise Municipal Code, the request to construct a one and a half story, single-family dwelling with detached garage is not congruous with the historical, architectural, archeological, educational or cultural aspects of the Historic District because:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (1995 Edition), the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Districts, the North End Plan and the Boise City Comprehensive Plan are references often utilized by the Historic Preservation Commission to determine whether a change is not congruous with the historic and architectural qualities of the Historic District.

1. The Commission's decision in regard to Certificates of Appropriateness for alterations, as described in 2-18-09 (A), shall be based on six Findings as applicable to that property. (2-18-11 01)
 - A. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not in a commercial district.
 - B. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. This application does not comply with the guidelines.
 - i. Maintain proportional lot coverage as found on the neighboring properties of the same block; maximum lot coverage of all buildings should not exceed 30% of the total lot area; minimum open space should be 40% of the total lot area. Any exceptions to these percentages will be closely scrutinized. (5.3.4.) The project will require a lot coverage of 40%.
 - ii. Not appropriate to develop a building, which does not maintain or suggest building-to-lot proportions of adjacent sites. (5.3.9.) The 40% lot coverage does not maintain the lower lot coverage that is prevalent in the neighborhood and throughout the District.
 - C. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction.) This application is not consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.
 - i. Introducing new construction onto the building site which is visually incompatible in terms of size, scale, design, materials, color and texture; which destroys historic relationships on the site; or which damages or destroys important landscape features is not recommended. (pg. 105) The project is incompatible in terms of size. It covers 40% of the lot and only allows an 18' long rear yard.

- ii. Designing new exterior additions to historic buildings or adjacent new construction which is compatible with the historic character of the site and which preserves the historic relationship between the building or buildings and the landscape is recommended. (pg.105) The lot coverage and small rear yard is not compatible with the historic character of the site.
 - D. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. The application is not in compliance with the following goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan and the North End Plan.
 - i. New development within the North End/East End shall be designed to reflect elements of the historic architecture and design that exist in the area. Policy 7, pg 8-33 The heavy lot coverage does not reflect the lot coverage that exists in the area.
 - ii. The proposed use or design of the property should reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood and be compatible with it. (p. 17) The lot coverage, which is a part of the design of the property, does not reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood and is not compatible with it.
 - iii. The unique character of the neighborhood should be maintained, including architectural style, sitting on the lots, orientation of the units and landscaping characteristics. (p. 18) The heavy lot coverage and small amount of open space is not in keeping with the unique character of the neighborhood.
 - E. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the District. The project is not congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education or cultural aspects of the District because it does not comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts or the North End Plan.
 - F. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the District and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. This application complies with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the request for any variances.
2. A contributing building, site, structure or object adds to the historic architectural qualities, historic associations, or archeological values for which a property is significant because (a) it was present during the period of significance, and possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time or is capable of yielding important information about the period, or (b) it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria. The structures were removed in 2005. The property is non-contributing.