



## Planning & Development Services

Boise City Hall, 2nd Floor  
150 N. Capitol Boulevard  
P. O. Box 500  
Boise, Idaho 83701-0500

Phone: 208/384-3830  
Fax: 208/384-3753  
TDD/TTY: 800/377-3529  
Website: [www.cityofboise.org/pds](http://www.cityofboise.org/pds)

# 1

## Planning Division Staff Report

<b>File Number</b>	DRH08-00169
<b>Applicant</b>	Eric Wilde
<b>Property Address</b>	1209 North 24 <sup>th</sup> Street
<b>Public Hearing Date</b>	23 June 2008
<b>Heard by</b>	Historic Preservation Commission
<b>Analyst</b>	Matt Halitsky
<b>Checked By</b>	Sarah Schafer

---

### Public Notification

Radius notices mailed to adjacent properties:	<b>5 June 2008</b>
Staff posted notice on site on:	<b>6 June 2008</b>

---

### Table of Contents

1. Project Data and Facts	2
2. Land Use	2
3. Project Proposal	3
4. Ordinance / Standards	4
5. Analysis / Findings	4
6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions	6

## 1. Project Data and Facts

<b>Applicant/Status</b>	Eric Wilde / <i>Owner</i>
<b>Architect/Representative</b>	Kenneth Reed / <i>Architect</i>
<b>Location of Property</b>	1209 North 24 <sup>th</sup> Street
<b>Size of Property</b>	9,000 Square Feet
<b>Present Zoning and Land Use</b>	R-1CH, <i>Single Family Residential with Historic Overlay</i>
<b>Historic District</b>	North End
<b>Date of Construction</b>	1915
<b>Style</b>	Craftsman / Bungalow (2001 survey)
<b>Status</b>	Contributing
<b>Square Footage of Existing House</b>	1,841 Square Feet

### Description of Applicant's Request

The applicant is proposing to construct a new two-car garage with accessory dwelling unit; as well as to re-side, replace windows and add a side deck to the principal dwelling.

## 2. Land Use

### Description and Character of Surrounding Area

The surrounding neighborhood is a mixture of single and one and one-half story homes, with single and two-story garages accessed off of a rear alley. The lots along 24<sup>th</sup> Street are unusually deep due to the wide avenue which once boasted a streetcar line. A contemporary two-story garage is located adjacent to the proposed development.

### Site Characteristics

The existing single-story home sits on a relatively large lot in the North End. Though considered contributing in a survey conducted in 2001, there have been two obvious additions as well as contemporary siding and windows added to the structure. The property currently lacks a garage.

### Special Considerations

None.

### History of Previous Actions

None.

### 3. Project Proposal

#### Site Design

Land Use	Existing	Proposed
Percentage of the site devoted to building coverage:	20%	28.5%
Percentage of the site devoted to paving:	1%	8%
Percentage of the site devoted to landscaping:	79%	63.5%
TOTAL	100%	100%

#### Setbacks

Yard	Required	Proposed for Building	Proposed for Garage
Front (east)	15' (bldg.) 20' (garage)	No Change	147'
Side (north)	5' (bldg.) 5' (garage)	5'	5'
Side (south)	5' (bldg.) 5' (garage)	8'	3'
Rear (west)	15' (bldg.) 0' (garage)	No Change	0'

#### Fencing

A six-foot wood fence exists along the perimeter of the property and shall remain.

#### Structure(s) Design

Number and Proposed Use of Buildings	Two: Existing Contributing Home Proposed Garage
Maximum Building Height	17'6" to ridgeline of home (existing) 17'0" to ridgeline of proposed garage
Number of Stories	1-story home, 1 ½ story sunken garage

## 4. Ordinance / Standards

Section	
11-04-04.01	General Standards
2-18-09	Historic Preservation Ordinance
4.1	Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts
	Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Structures

## 5. Analysis/Findings

### Contributing Analysis

**B.C.C Section 2-18-09 (A) (1) (c) states:** *As part of the application process for a Certificate of Appropriateness, the Planning Staff shall confirm the contributing or non-contributing classification of the property based on the criteria set forth in the definitions of Section 2-18-02.*

The building was constructed circa 1915, which is during the period of significance for the North End. The home was deemed contributing in a survey conducted in 2001, however at least two additions as well as contemporary siding and vinyl windows have been added to the home at varying points throughout its history. The massing of the house remains relatively the same, and it retains its character defining features including the front entry with gable and low-pitched roof. Though altered, the property is still contributing.

### Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts, Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Structures

The applicant is proposing to construct a new two-car, one and one half story garage with an accessory dwelling in the rear portion of the subject property, remodel the existing home by replacing siding and windows, as well as construct a new deck and exterior stairwell to the basement. The new deck, measuring roughly 10' by 24', is to be located on the north side of the home near the rear, and is not visible from the street. According to the submitted elevations this deck will be built one foot to one and a half feet above grade, and will meet the side setback required by Code. In addition to the deck, a new exterior stairwell is proposed to be constructed along the southern elevation near the front of the home. This stairwell will provide access to the basement and as designed will not be readily visible from the street, especially as it will be located behind an existing fence. Both changes are consistent with the residential design guidelines, specifically 4.1.12, as neither addition overpowers, obscures or eliminates historically significant architectural or character-defining features. Neither the deck nor the stairwell will be visible from the street or interfere with the front façade.

Along with the two minor modifications to the home described above, the applicant is proposing to remove the existing ten-inch pressboard siding and replace it with a six-inch wood lap or hardi-board material, as well as to replace and reconfigure existing windows, some of which are vinyl, with wood windows in a more traditional arrangement. As the existing siding is clearly contemporary and not original to the home, returning the exterior to a wood lap or appropriate alternative siding is an appropriate alteration to a contributing structure. The six-inch reveal proposed is also appropriate given that the original siding on the home was a six-inch wood clapboard, as indicated on the attached survey from 2001. Similarly, returning the vinyl replacement windows to wood windows is also an appropriate alteration. Despite the fact that the fenestration will change slightly, the removal of the contemporary smaller square windows will make way for a more traditional window alignment and provide a consistent window design throughout. Though the Secretary of the Interior's Standards strongly recommend against creating a false sense of history, the existing fenestration is questionable in the context of a Craftsman Bungalow design, and that proposed by the applicant, while changing the current alignment slightly, is more consistent in respect to the pattern of window placement seen in this style of home and throughout the North End.

As mentioned above, the applicant is also proposing to construct a two-car garage at the rear of the property. This garage, though a story and a half, will remain slightly lower than the height of the existing home via sinking the garage by approximately 18-inches into the ground, thus remaining consistent with the residential design guidelines pertaining to height in relation to the primary structure. As proposed this garage will contain a one-bedroom accessory dwelling unit, which will require additional approvals through the Planning & Development Services Department.

Section 11-04-04.01(G)(3) of the Boise City Code allows reduced rear setbacks for accessory structures adjacent to alleys that are under 1,000 square feet in area. Accessory structures over 1,000 square feet in area or 22-feet in height must comply with the setback requirements of the zone, in this instance 15-feet. Thus, as the size of the proposed garage as indicated in the application is 1,041 square feet, a fifteen foot setback is required. Staff recommends as a condition of approval that the site layout be modified to meet current zoning setbacks or the size of the garage be reduced to 1,000 square feet or less in order to meet the aforementioned exception, or else a Variance sought and approved for the reduced setback for the garage as designed.

Generally, the design of the proposed garage is consistent with the residential design guidelines and an appropriate addition to the property. The proposal incorporates similar accents and materials as seen on the remodeled home, and does not overpower the residence. Although the accessory structure is a story and a half, sinking the garage portion to reduce the height to slightly lower than the existing home is an innovative approach to gaining additional square footage while retaining a significant portion of the rear yard as well as a mature tree. Though the property is contributing, none of the alterations or additions will

result in a compromise of the historic integrity of the home, and approval is recommended subject to the conditions attached

## 6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions

**Pursuant to Boise City Code 2-18-9 A and B of Boise Municipal Code, the proposed development is congruous with the historical, architectural, archeological, educational or cultural aspects of the historic district because:**

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (1995 Edition), the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Districts, the North End Plan and the Boise City Comprehensive Plan are references often utilized by the Historic Preservation Commission to determine whether a change is congruous with the historic and architectural qualities of the historic district.

1. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A* states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not within one of the Commercial Districts therefore this finding does not apply to this application.
2. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B* states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. Per the above analysis, staff believes the application will comply with the requirements of this finding. Although the proposal slightly alters the fenestration of the existing home, the design seeks to address inappropriate changes made prior and seeks to restore the design of the home to a more historic appearance. The design of the contemporary garage is consistent with the guidelines for new construction adopted by Ordinance.
3. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C* states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction). This application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. The proposal neither creates a false sense of history, nor detracts from the historic neighborhood as a whole.
4. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D* states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. The application is in compliance with the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan. The proposal promotes redevelopment and a mixture of housing types while retaining the historic integrity of the property and character of the neighborhood.
5. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E* states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the district. Based on the above analysis this application is congruous

with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education and cultural aspects of the district.

6. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F* states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the district and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. With the attached conditions of approval, this application complies with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the need for a waiver or variance.

### **Site Specific Conditions of Approval**

1. Compliance with plans and specifications submitted to and on file in the Planning and Development Services Department dated received 15 May 2008, except as expressly modified by the following condition:
  - a. The proposed garage shall meet current zoning setbacks, or be reduced in size to 1,000 square feet or less or a Variance be granted for a reduced setback.
  - b. The accessory dwelling unit requires separate approval through the Planning & Development Services Department.

### **Standard Conditions of Approval**

2. The applicant shall comply with the Boise City Fire Code.
3. Prior to a Building Permit and prior to any construction on the site, an Erosion and Sediment Control Permit must be obtained from the Building Division of the Planning and Development Services Department.
4. No change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall be valid unless in writing and signed by the applicant or his authorized representative and an authorized representative of the City of Boise. The burden shall be upon the applicant to obtain the written confirmation of any change and not upon the City of Boise.
5. Any change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall require the applicant to comply with all rules, regulations, ordinances, plans or other regulatory and legal restrictions in force at the time the applicant or successors in interest advise the City of intent to change the planned use of the property described herein unless a variance in said requirements or other legal relief is granted pursuant to the law in effect at the time the change in use is sought.
6. If the applicant does not act on the Certificate of Appropriateness through the commencement of construction, or extended pursuant to the Boise City Code, within

eighteen months, it will become null and void without further notification from this department.

7. The applicant shall be required to obtain a Building Permit prior to the start of construction.

## **Construction Site Requirements**

8. The practices required below are intended to mitigate the impact and disturbance of residential property owners during the construction of adjacent buildings or structures. The following conditions apply to all construction-related activities ranging from grading and demolition activities to final occupancy on any land or parcel falling under the proprietary ownership of the permit applicant.
  - a) Prior to the issuance of a building permit and prior to the commencement of any construction on-site, an Erosion and Sediment Control (ESC) permit must be obtained from the Planning and Development Services Department. No grading, demolition or earth disturbing activities may start until an approved ESC permit and the associated site work or grading permits have been issued.
  - b) Measures shall be taken to manage construction debris and trash on the construction site and efforts shall also be made to provide reasonable controls to minimize fugitive dust on the construction site. Such measures shall include, but are not limited to:
    - Provide suitable containers for solid waste generated by construction activity;
    - Wet demolition of existing buildings;
    - Watering of driving surfaces and earth moving activities;
    - Installation of wind screening around property and each open floor above grade; and
    - Daily broom cleaning of above grade floors, adjacent streets and sidewalks.
  - c) To reduce the noise impact of construction on nearby residential properties, all exterior construction activities shall be limited to the hours between 7:00 a.m. and 7:00 p.m. Monday through Friday and 8:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. for Saturday and Sunday. Low noise impact activities such as surveying, layout and weather protection may be performed at any time. After each floor of the structure or building is enclosed with exterior walls and windows, interior construction of the enclosed floors can be performed at any time.
  - d) A minimum height of six foot (6') rigid security fencing, either wood or metal, shall be installed around the construction site within 30 days of the date when the first city permit is issued on projects where construction activity shall exceed 90 days.



- e) Exterior lighting and other illuminating equipment or materials shall be positioned, shielded, directed and located to not reflect or impact adjacent residential property and streets.
- f) Applicant shall comply with Boise City Fire Department requirements for water, access, and/or other requirements as determined by the Fire Marshal.
- g) Any conditions to be enforced during construction shall remain posted at each street abutting the construction site for the duration of the project. In addition to the posted conditions the permit holder shall also post an 11"x 17" laminated sign containing a project contact phone number, name of project contact and the Boise City contact number, 384-3845, to address issues as they arise. Failure to abide by any conditions set forth shall be grounds for revocation of Conditional Use Permit and/or Building Permits and may be subject the owner or owner's agents to fines and criminal citations.