



Planning & Development Services

Boise City Hall, 2nd Floor
150 N. Capitol Boulevard
P. O. Box 500
Boise, Idaho 83701-0500

Phone: 208/384-3830
Fax: 208/384-3753
TDD/TTY: 800/377-3529
Website: www.cityofboise.org/pds

7

Planning Division Staff Report

File Number	DRH08-00184
Applicant	Beverly Pillott
Property Address	1515 West Alturas
Public Hearing Date	23 June 2008
Heard by	Historic Preservation Commission
Analyst	Matt Halitsky
Checked By	Sarah Schafer

Public Notification

Radius notices mailed to adjacent properties:
Staff posted notice on site on:

6 June 2008
5 June 2008

Table of Contents

1. Project Data and Facts	2
2. Land Use	2
3. Project Proposal	3
4. Ordinance / Standards	4
5. Analysis / Findings	4
6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions	6

1. Project Data and Facts

Applicant/Status	Beverly Pillott / owner
Architect/Representative	Marla Carson
Location of Property	1515 West Alturas
Size of Property	7,200 square feet
Present Zoning and Land Use	R-1CH
Historic District	North End
Date of Construction	1911
Style	Craftsman
Status	Contributing
Square Footage of Existing House	1,110 square feet

Description of Applicant's Request

The applicant is proposing to construct a 462 square foot addition to the west side of the home, replace existing windows with vinyl throughout the home, remodel the front entry to include French doors flanking either side of the main entry, and restore the original wood lap siding.

2. Land Use

Description and Character of Surrounding Area

The surrounding neighborhood is a mixture of single and one and one-half story homes, with single-story garages accessed off of a rear or side alley. A neighboring home of very similar design is located directly adjacent to the west. Across the side alley to the east is the rear yard of a large home facing 15th Street.

Site Characteristics

The subject property consists of a contributing Craftsman bungalow in excellent condition, with a detached garage to the rear of the home. A large landscaped area is located to the west of the home in the area of the proposed addition. A large mature evergreen tree is located in the center of the rear yard. An alley runs the length of the eastern side yard as opposed to the rear.

Special Considerations

None.

History of Previous Actions

None.

3. Project Proposal

Site Design

Land Use	Existing	Proposed
Percentage of the site devoted to building coverage:	22%	29%
Percentage of the site devoted to paving:	3%	3%
Percentage of the site devoted to landscaping:	75%	68%
TOTAL	100%	100%

Setbacks

Yard	Required	Proposed for Building	Proposed for Garage
Front (north)	15' (bldg.) 20' (garage)	19'	No Change
Side (east)	5' (bldg.) 0' (garage)	No Change	No Change
Side (west)	5' (bldg.) 5' (garage)	5'	No Change
Rear (south)	15' (bldg.) 15' (garage)	52'	No Change

Fencing

Fencing currently encloses the property, in places concrete and wrought iron and in others a simple six-foot wood fence. No changes are proposed to the existing fencing.

Structure(s) Design

Number and Proposed Use of Buildings	Two: Existing contributing home Existing garage
Maximum Building Height	18' to the ridgeline (existing) 17' to the ridgeline of the proposed addition
Number of Stories	One

4. Ordinance / Standards

Section	
11-04-04.01	General Standards
2-18-09	Historic Preservation Ordinance
4.1	Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts
	Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Structures

5. Analysis/Findings

Contributing Analysis

B.C.C Section 2-18-09 (A) (1) (c) states: *As part of the application process for a Certificate of Appropriateness, the Planning Staff shall confirm the contributing or non-contributing classification of the property based on the criteria set forth in the definitions of Section 2-18-02.*

The building was constructed circa 1911, which is during the period of significance for the North End. The home was deemed contributing in a survey conducted in 1998, and has remained relatively unchanged since its original construction. The massing of the house remains the same, and it retains its character defining features including the front entry, shed dormer and low-pitched roof. As the property has retained its historic integrity, it is still contributing.

Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts, Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Structures

As mentioned above the subject property is an original Craftsman bungalow in excellent condition. It has remained largely unchanged since its original construction, except for the addition of contemporary aluminum siding in the recent past. The applicant has proposed changes to the front façade, to include a new front entry and the replacement of the front windows with French doors, as well as a 462-square foot addition to the west side of the home. In addition, the applicant is proposing to replace all wood windows with vinyl, and to remove the existing metal siding to expose and restore the original wood lap siding underneath.

Removal of the contemporary metal siding to expose the original wood lap underneath is an appropriate change and supported by staff. Restoration of the original wood siding is consistent with both the residential design guidelines, as well as the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. To ensure that the restoration

and preservation of the existing wood lap siding is carried out properly, staff recommends as a condition of approval where repair or replacement of portions of the original wood lap siding is necessary, milled wood be used to maintain consistency in both appearance and materials.

The applicant is also proposing to remodel the front entry, as well as alter the front façade of the home by replacing the existing front windows with French doors as seen in the attached elevations. The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties specifically recommends against "*Removing or radically changing entrances and porches which are important in defining the overall historic character of the building so that, as a result, the character is diminished*" (p. 85). In addition, the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts states: "*Whether a replacement or an addition, a new design should not create a false historical appearance, but rather be congruous with the historic character of the building. In no case should the new entrance be incongruous in size, scale, material, and color*". The existing front entry is a character defining element of the contributing structure. The simple arched roof and modest cement landing are in keeping with the size and scale of the home, as well as other bungalows seen throughout the North End. The addition of columns and a redefinition of the roofline at the entry, not to mention a porch that runs the entire length of the front elevation provides a false sense of history and is inconsistent with the existing architectural style. Similarly, the addition of the French doors to the front façade of the home introduces architectural elements that are inconsistent with the style of the existing home. The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation strongly recommend against "*Designing and constructing new additions that result in the diminution or loss of the historic character of the resource, including its design, materials, workmanship, location or setting*". The French doors in concert with the addition of the new front porch, reminiscent of a more Georgian or plantation style of architecture, would result in such a loss, effectively compromising the historic integrity of the Craftsman bungalow. Thus, staff recommends as a condition of approval the proposed redesign of the entry, as well as the addition of the front patio and French doors not be approved.

Per the applicant, the existing wood windows are to be replaced with contemporary vinyl windows throughout. The residential design guidelines recommend against the "*use of window and door types incongruous with the character of the district*" (5.7.10). In addition, the same guidelines recommend specifically against the "*use of vinyl windows that are visible from the front façade of the building*" (5.7.11). The vinyl windows proposed are inconsistent with the adopted standards and guidelines for the North End, and are an inappropriate material for this historic home. As the proposed vinyl windows are incongruous with the character of both the home and District, staff recommends as a condition of approval replacement windows shall be either wood or wood clad, and match the existing fenestration and mullion pattern of the existing contributing structure.

Finally, the applicant is proposing to construct a 462-square foot addition to the west side of the home, consisting of a master bedroom suite. As proposed this addition will be stepped back 8-feet from the primary elevation and is slightly lower in height than the existing home,

consistent with the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. In addition, the applicant proposes to use wood lap siding to match the existing home. However, the massing of the addition is incongruous with the size of the existing structure. Per the residential design guidelines, it is a policy to: “design and construct new additions to be congruous with the original building in a manner that preserves the integrity and character of the building and buildings within the surrounding block; maintain the character of a rooftop and the mass and scale of existing buildings.” (p. 28). The proposed addition would increase the square footage of the existing home by almost half, and increase the length of the home as seen from the street by almost 50-percent. Per the previous mentioned guidelines, the addition is not congruous with the historic home or the district. Though a rear addition would be preferable, a large mature evergreen is situated in the rear yard such that a rear addition of any substance would preclude its preservation, thus a side addition may be considered an appropriate alternative. However, staff recommends a condition of approval reducing the size of the proposed addition such that it does not overpower the original home, and not detract from its historic character and status as a contributing structure.

6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions

Pursuant to Boise City Code 2-18-9 A and B of Boise Municipal Code, the proposed development is congruous with the historical, architectural, archeological, educational or cultural aspects of the historic district because:

The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (1995 Edition), the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Districts, the North End Plan and the Boise City Comprehensive Plan are references often utilized by the Historic Preservation Commission to determine whether a change is congruous with the historic and architectural qualities of the historic district.

1. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A* states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City’s Historic Districts. This application is not within one of the Commercial Districts therefore this finding does not apply to this application.
2. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B* states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. Per the above analysis and with the attached conditions of approval, staff believes the application will comply with the requirements of this finding. Although the proposed changes to the front façade are incongruous and the addition not in keeping with the scale and massing of the property, restoring the siding to the original wood lap is congruous.
3. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C* states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction). As conditioned, this application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. The proposal

neither creates a false sense of history, nor detracts from the historic neighborhood as a whole.

4. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D* states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. The application is in compliance with the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan. As conditioned, the proposal promotes redevelopment while retaining the historic integrity of the property and character of the neighborhood.
5. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E* states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the district. Based on the above analysis and in light of the attached conditions of approval, this application is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education and cultural aspects of the district.
6. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F* states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the district and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. This application complies with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the need for a waiver or variance.

Site Specific Conditions of Approval

1. Compliance with plans and specifications submitted to and on file in the Planning and Development Services Department dated received 27 May 2008, except as expressly modified by the following conditions:
 - a. The French doors on the front façade are not approved.
 - b. Replacement windows shall be either wood or wood clad, and match the existing fenestration and mullion pattern.
 - c. The changes to the front entry, including the front porch are not approved.
 - d. The proposed addition must be reduced in scale, the design of which shall be reviewed and approved by the Historic Preservation Commission at an upcoming hearing or work session.
 - e. If, while restoring the original siding, sections must be replaced, the repair shall be milled wood only.

Standard Conditions of Approval

2. The applicant shall comply with the Boise City Fire Code.
3. Prior to a Building Permit and prior to any construction on the site, an Erosion and Sediment Control Permit must be obtained from the Building Division of the Planning and Development Services Department.
4. No change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall be valid unless in writing and signed by the applicant or his authorized representative and an authorized representative of the City of Boise. The burden shall be upon the applicant to obtain the written confirmation of any change and not upon the City of Boise.
5. Any change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall require the applicant to comply with all rules, regulations, ordinances, plans or other regulatory and legal restrictions in force at the time the applicant or successors in interest advise the City of intent to change the planned use of the property described herein unless a variance in said requirements or other legal relief is granted pursuant to the law in effect at the time the change in use is sought.
6. If the applicant does not act on the Certificate of Appropriateness through the commencement of construction, or extended pursuant to the Boise City Code, within eighteen months, it will become null and void without further notification from this department.
7. The applicant shall be required to obtain a Building Permit prior to the start of construction.

Construction Site Requirements

8. The practices required below are intended to mitigate the impact and disturbance of residential property owners during the construction of adjacent buildings or structures. The following conditions apply to all construction-related activities ranging from grading and demolition activities to final occupancy on any land or parcel falling under the proprietary ownership of the permit applicant.
 - a) Prior to the issuance of a building permit and prior to the commencement of any construction on-site, an Erosion and Sediment Control (ESC) permit must be obtained from the Planning and Development Services Department. No grading, demolition or earth disturbing activities may start until an approved ESC permit and the associated site work or grading permits have been issued.
 - b) Measures shall be taken to manage construction debris and trash on the construction site and efforts shall also be made to provide reasonable controls to minimize fugitive dust on the construction site. Such measures shall include, but are not limited to:
 - Provide suitable containers for solid waste generated by construction

- activity;
 - Wet demolition of existing buildings;
 - Watering of driving surfaces and earth moving activities;
 - Installation of wind screening around property and each open floor above grade; and
 - Daily broom cleaning of above grade floors, adjacent streets and sidewalks.
- c) To reduce the noise impact of construction on nearby residential properties, all exterior construction activities shall be limited to the hours between 7:00 a.m. and 7:00 p.m. Monday through Friday and 8:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. for Saturday and Sunday. Low noise impact activities such as surveying, layout and weather protection may be performed at any time. After each floor of the structure or building is enclosed with exterior walls and windows, interior construction of the enclosed floors can be performed at any time.
- d) A minimum height of six foot (6') rigid security fencing, either wood or metal, shall be installed around the construction site within 30 days of the date when the first city permit is issued on projects where construction activity shall exceed 90 days.
- e) Exterior lighting and other illuminating equipment or materials shall be positioned, shielded, directed and located to not reflect or impact adjacent residential property and streets.
- f) Applicant shall comply with Boise City Fire Department requirements for water, access, and/or other requirements as determined by the Fire Marshal.
- g) Any conditions to be enforced during construction shall remain posted at each street abutting the construction site for the duration of the project. In addition to the posted conditions the permit holder shall also post an 11"x 17" laminated sign containing a project contact phone number, name of project contact and the Boise City contact number, 384-3845, to address issues as they arise. Failure to abide by any conditions set forth shall be grounds for revocation of Conditional Use Permit and/or Building Permits and may be subject the owner or owner's agents to fines and criminal citations.