



Planning & Development Services

Boise City Hall, 2nd Floor
150 N. Capitol Boulevard
P. O. Box 500
Boise, Idaho 83701-0500

Phone: 208/384-3830
Fax: 208/384-3753
TDD/TTY: 800/377-3529
Website: www.cityofboise.org/pds

8

Summary/Reason Statement for DRH08-00186

Staff's Recommendation

Approval

Summary

DUNCAN AND KARI FILSON request Historic Preservation approval to construct a single-story addition on the north side of the main dwelling with new covered entry on property located at 1502 N. 27th Street in an R-1CH (Single Family Residential with Historic Overlay) zone.

1. The Commission's decision in regard to Certificates of Appropriateness for alterations, as described in 2-18-09 (A), shall be based on six findings as applicable to that property. (2-18-11 01)
 - A. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not in a commercial district. This finding is not applicable.
 - B. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. This application complies with the following guidelines.
 - i. "Relate rooflines, the pitch, and orientation of the new addition to the primary building." (4.1.3) The roofline of the addition will be related in pitch, slope and height to that of the original roofline.
 - ii. "Use similar materials as found on the original building." (4.1.6) The addition will use materials similar to those found on the original building including lap siding and wood trim.
 - iii. "Maintain proportional lot coverage as found on the neighboring properties of the same block; maximum lot coverage of all buildings should not exceed 30% of the total lot area. Minimum open space should be 40% of the total lot area. Any exceptions to these percentages will be closely scrutinized." (4.1.10) The project will bring the lot coverage up to 28%.

- C. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction.) This application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. This application complies with the following guidelines.
- i. New work should be compatible with the historic character of the setting in terms of size, scale, design, material, color and texture. (pg.108) The new work is compatible with the historic character of the setting in terms of size, scale, design, material, color and texture.
 - ii. Removing or radically changing buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished. (pg. 102) The existing building is non-contributing and is not important in defining the overall historic character of the property.
- D. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. The application is in compliance with the following goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan and the North End Plan.
- i. The proposed use or design of the property should reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood and be compatible with it. (p. 17) The design of the property reflects the adjacent neighborhood and is compatible with it.
 - ii. The unique character of the neighborhood should be maintained, including architectural style, sitting on the lots, orientation of the units and landscaping characteristics. (p. 18) The unique character of the neighborhood will be maintained by the project.
- E. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the district. The project is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education or cultural aspects of the district because it complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts and the North End Plan.
- F. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the district and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. This application complies with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the request for any variances.

2. A contributing building, site, structure or object adds to the historic architectural qualities, historic associations, or archeological values for which a property is significant because (a) it was present during the period of significance, and possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time or is capable of yielding important information about the period, or (b) it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria. The property has been altered and is no longer contributing. It does not meet the National Register eligibility criteria.



Planning & Development Services

Boise City Hall, 2nd Floor
150 N. Capitol Boulevard
P. O. Box 500
Boise, Idaho 83701-0500

Phone: 208/384-3830
Fax: 208/384-3753
TDD/TTY: 800/377-3529
Website: www.cityofboise.org/pds

8

Planning Division Staff Report

File Number	DRH08-00186
Applicant	Duncan and Kari Filson
Property Address	1502 North 17 th Street
Public Hearing Date	June 23, 2008
Heard by	Historic Preservation Commission
Analyst	Julie Archambeault
Checked By	Sarah Schafer

Public Notification

Radius notices mailed to adjacent properties: **June 6, 2008**
Staff posted notice on site on: **June 5, 2008**

Table of Contents

1. Project Data and Facts	2
2. Land Use	2
3. Project Proposal	3
4. Ordinance / Standards	4
5. Analysis / Findings	4
6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions	5

1. Project Data and Facts

Applicant/Status	Duncan and Kari Filson / Owner
Architect/Representative	Evelyn Grime / Place Inc
Location of Property	1502 North 27 th Street
Size of Property	Duncan and Kari Filson / Owner
Present Zoning and Land Use	Evelyn Grime / PLACE! Inc.
Historic District	1502 North 27 th Street
Date of Construction	9,760 sq. ft.
Style	R-1CH / Single Family Residential
Status	Expanded North End
Square Footage of Existing House	1940

Description of Applicant's Request

The applicant is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a single-story addition on the north side of the main dwelling with new covered entry.

2. Land Use

Description and Character of Surrounding Area

There are two modern structures on this block that were determined to be non-contributing; otherwise, all of the structures on the block were determined to be contributing to the District. The landscaping is made up of lawns and large trees.

Site Characteristics

The site is a corner lot that is almost a quarter of an acre in size. There is one main structure and two outbuildings.

Special Considerations

None

History of Previous Actions

1940-Construction of house
1957-Addition to rear; removal of front entry
2007-Change of house's status from contributing to non-contributing

3. Project Proposal

Site Design

Land Use	Existing	Proposed
Percentage of the site devoted to building coverage:	18%	28%
Percentage of the site devoted to paving:	1%	1%
Percentage of the site devoted to landscaping:	81%	71%
TOTAL	100%	100%

Setbacks

Yard	Required	Proposed for Building	Proposed for Garage
Front (west)	15' (bldg.) 20' (garage)	15'	No change
Side Street (south)	15' (bldg.) 25' (garage)	No change	No change
Side (north)	5' (bldg.) 5' (garage)	5'	No change
Rear (east)	15' (bldg.) 0' (garage)	66'	No change

Fencing

None

Structure(s) Design

Number and Proposed Use of Buildings	Three buildings exist-two outbuildings and the single family residence.
Maximum Building Height	Existing-17'; Proposed-17' 7"
Number of Stories	One

4. Ordinance / Standards

Section	
11-04-04.01	General Standards
2-18-09	Historic Preservation Ordinance
4.1	Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts
	Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Structures

5. Analysis/Findings

Section 2-18-9 (A) (1) (c) Confirmation of Classification

As part of the application process for a Certificate of Appropriateness, the Planning Staff shall confirm the contributing or non-contributing classification of the property based on the criteria set forth in the definitions of Section 2-18-02.

- A. A property is contributing if
1. it was present during the period of significance, AND
 2. it possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time
 - i. **Location**-The building has not been moved. It has retained its integrity of location.
 - ii. **Setting**-The setting has changed since the building was constructed. Many of the properties present during the period of significance have been altered. Some of these buildings have been altered more significantly than others. A modern structure sits next door to the subject house. The subject property has lost some integrity of setting.
 - iii. **Design**-The integrity of design has been greatly diminished with the removal of the front entrance. Although the front porch cover remains, its brackets are gone, as are the front door and the front steps. A picture window now sits where the door used to be. Also, the size and massing of the house have been changed by an addition to the rear and side of the house. The front entry is in this side addition. The street side of the house is intact. However, the front, interior side and rear have been heavily modified.
 - iv. **Materials**-The structure retains most of its integrity of materials. The siding and windows are still the original wood. The roof is new asphalt.
 - v. **Workmanship**-Much of the integrity of workmanship has been lost with the loss of the brackets, the front door and the front steps.
 - vi. **Feeling**-The integrity of feeling has been diminished. Although it feels somewhat like a Minimal Traditional house, the loss of the front door lessens this feeling.

- vii. **Association**-The integrity of association has also been diminished. It is still associated with Minimal Traditional architecture. However, without the front entrance, this association is weakened.

The integrity of the structure has been lost through the move of the front door and the removal the front steps and the brackets under the stoop cover. Although the materials are still intact, the massing has been changed with the large addition to the rear and the new entry addition. Also, although most of the neighboring structures date from the era of significance, many of them have been significantly altered and other structures are modern intrusions. With all of these factors, the property has lost its integrity and no longer contributes to the District.

- 3. it is capable of yielding important information about the period OR
- 4. it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria
- B. A property is noncontributing if
 - 1. it was not present during the period of significance,
 - 2. due to alterations, disturbances, additions, or other changes, it no longer possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time OR
 - 3. it is incapable of yielding important information about the period OR
 - 4. it does not individually meet the National Register eligibility criteria

Due to alterations, the house is no longer contributing.

Discussion

Although the appearance is very different than the existing appearance of the house, the house is non-contributing, and altering its front façade is congruous. The proposed design is congruous. The roofline is related to that of the original building and the addition uses materials similar to those on the original building including lap siding and wood trim. The low massing with the centralized porch cover is congruous with the district.

6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions

Pursuant to Boise City Code 2-18-9 A and B of Boise Municipal Code, the request to construct a two-story addition on the rear of the dwelling is congruous with the historical, architectural, archeological, educational or cultural aspects of the historic district because:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (1995 Edition), the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Districts, the North End Plan and the Boise City Comprehensive Plan are references often utilized by the Historic Preservation Commission to determine whether a change is congruous with the historic and architectural qualities of the historic district.

- 1. The Commission's decision in regard to Certificates of Appropriateness for alterations, as described in 2-18-09 (A), shall be based on six findings as applicable to that property. (2-18-11 01)

- A. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not in a commercial district. This finding is not applicable.
- B. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. This application complies with the following guidelines.
 - i. "Relate rooflines, the pitch, and orientation of the new addition to the primary building." (4.1.3) The roofline of the addition will be related in pitch, slope and height to that of the original roofline.
 - ii. "Use similar materials as found on the original building." (4.1.6) The addition will use materials similar to those found on the original building including lap siding and wood trim.
 - iii. "Maintain proportional lot coverage as found on the neighboring properties of the same block; maximum lot coverage of all buildings should not exceed 30% of the total lot area. Minimum open space should be 40% of the total lot area. Any exceptions to these percentages will be closely scrutinized." (4.1.10) The project will bring the lot coverage up to 28%.
- C. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction.) This application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. This application complies with the following guidelines.
 - i. New work should be compatible with the historic character of the setting in terms of size, scale, design, material, color and texture. (pg.108) The new work is compatible with the historic character of the setting in terms of size, scale, design, material, color and texture.
 - ii. Removing or radically changing buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished. (pg. 102) The existing building is non-contributing and is not important in defining the overall historic character of the property.
- D. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. The application is in compliance with the following goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan and the North End Plan.
 - i. The proposed use or design of the property should reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood and be compatible with it. (p. 17) The design of the property reflects the adjacent neighborhood and is compatible with it.
 - ii. The unique character of the neighborhood should be maintained, including architectural style, sitting on the lots, orientation of the units and landscaping

characteristics. (p. 18) The unique character of the neighborhood will be maintained by the project.

- E. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the district. The project is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education or cultural aspects of the district because it complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts and the North End Plan.
 - F. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the district and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. This application complies with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the request for any variances.
2. A contributing building, site, structure or object adds to the historic architectural qualities, historic associations, or archeological values for which a property is significant because (a) it was present during the period of significance, and possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time or is capable of yielding important information about the period, or (b) it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria. The property has been altered and is no longer contributing. It does not meet the National Register eligibility criteria.

Site Specific Conditions of Approval

- 1. Compliance with plans and specifications submitted to and on file in the Planning and Development Services Department dated received May 28, 2008.

Standard Conditions of Approval

- 2. The applicant shall comply with the Boise City Fire Code.
- 3. Prior to a Building Permit and prior to any construction on the site, an Erosion and Sediment Control Permit must be obtained from the Building Division of the Planning and Development Services Department.
- 4. No change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall be valid unless in writing and signed by the applicant or his authorized representative and an authorized representative of the City of Boise. The burden shall be upon the applicant to obtain the written confirmation of any change and not upon the City of Boise.

5. Any change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall require the applicant to comply with all rules, regulations, ordinances, plans or other regulatory and legal restrictions in force at the time the applicant or successors in interest advise the City of intent to change the planned use of the property described herein unless a variance in said requirements or other legal relief is granted pursuant to the law in effect at the time the change in use is sought.
6. If the applicant does not act on the Certificate of Appropriateness through the commencement of construction, or extended pursuant to the Boise City Code, within eighteen months, it will become null and void without further notification from this department.
7. The applicant shall be required to obtain a Building Permit prior to the start of construction.

Construction Site Requirements

8. The practices required below are intended to mitigate the impact and disturbance of residential property owners during the construction of adjacent buildings or structures. The following conditions apply to all construction-related activities ranging from grading and demolition activities to final occupancy on any land or parcel falling under the proprietary ownership of the permit applicant.
 - a) Prior to the issuance of a building permit and prior to the commencement of any construction on-site, an Erosion and Sediment Control (ESC) permit must be obtained from the Planning and Development Services Department. No grading, demolition or earth disturbing activities may start until an approved ESC permit and the associated site work or grading permits have been issued.
 - b) Measures shall be taken to manage construction debris and trash on the construction site and efforts shall also be made to provide reasonable controls to minimize fugitive dust on the construction site. Such measures shall include, but are not limited to:
 - Provide suitable containers for solid waste generated by construction activity;
 - Wet demolition of existing buildings;
 - Watering of driving surfaces and earth moving activities;
 - Installation of wind screening around property and each open floor above grade; and
 - Daily broom cleaning of above grade floors, adjacent streets and sidewalks.
 - c) To reduce the noise impact of construction on nearby residential properties, all exterior construction activities shall be limited to the hours between 7:00 a.m. and 7:00 p.m. Monday through Friday and 8:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. for Saturday and Sunday. Low noise impact activities such as surveying, layout and weather protection may be performed at any time. After each floor of the structure or building

- is enclosed with exterior walls and windows, interior construction of the enclosed floors can be performed at any time.
- d) A minimum height of six foot (6') rigid security fencing, either wood or metal, shall be installed around the construction site within 30 days of the date when the first city permit is issued on projects where construction activity shall exceed 90 days.
 - e) Exterior lighting and other illuminating equipment or materials shall be positioned, shielded, directed and located to not reflect or impact adjacent residential property and streets.
 - f) Applicant shall comply with Boise City Fire Department requirements for water, access, and/or other requirements as determined by the Fire Marshal.
 - g) Any conditions to be enforced during construction shall remain posted at each street abutting the construction site for the duration of the project. In addition to the posted conditions the permit holder shall also post an 11"x 17" laminated sign containing a project contact phone number, name of project contact and the Boise City contact number, 384-3845, to address issues as they arise. Failure to abide by any conditions set forth shall be grounds for revocation of Conditional Use Permit and/or Building Permits and may be subject the owner or owner's agents to fines and criminal citations.