



Planning & Development Services

Boise City Hall, 2nd Floor
150 N. Capitol Boulevard
P. O. Box 500
Boise, Idaho 83701-0500

Phone: 208/384-3830
Fax: 208/384-3753
TDD/TTY: 800/377-3529
Website: www.cityofboise.org/pds

4

Summary/Reason Statement for DRH08-00173

Staff's Recommendation

Approval with conditions

The roof and eaves will match those of the house.

The windows will be metal clad wood.

Except for the bathroom window, the new windows will be 1/1.

Summary

ATHENA V. KILLEEN requests Historic Preservation approval to a single-story, rear addition to the main dwelling on property located at 1309 N. 25th Street in an R-1CH (Single Family Residential with Historic overlay) zone.

1. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not in a commercial district.
 - A. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. With the conditions of approval, this application complies with the following guidelines.
 - i. "Set back a new addition from the primary façade of the original building to maintain original proportion, massing, size, and scale." (4.1.2) The new addition is set 28' back from the front façade.
 - ii. "Relate rooflines, the pitch, and orientation of the new addition to the primary building." (4.1.3) The roofline of the addition will be a rear gable, as is the current rear facing section of the house.
 - iii. "Use similar materials as found on the original building." (4.1.6) The addition will use materials similar to those found on the original building including lap siding and wood trim.
 - iv. "Consider ground or basement additions before the addition of dormer(s). Under unique circumstances driven by site constraints, dormer(s) additions should be designed in

proportional scale to the original roof and should not visually compete.” (4.1.8) The addition is a ground floor addition.

- v. “Maintain proportional lot coverage as found on the neighboring properties of the same block; maximum lot coverage of all buildings should not exceed 30% of the total lot area. Minimum open space should be 40% of the total lot area. Any exceptions to these percentages will be closely scrutinized.” (4.1.10) The proposal will bring the lot coverage up to 30.5%.

B. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction.) This application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. With the conditions of approval, this application complies with the following guidelines.

- i. “Designing a new addition in a manner that makes clear what is historic and what is new. (pg. 112) Design for the new work may be contemporary or may reference design motifs from the historic building. In either case, it should always be clearly differentiated from the historic building and be compatible in terms of mass, materials, relationship of solids to voids, and color.” (pg. 113) The lowered roofline of the addition clearly marks it as new, while the similar materials and forms make it compatible.
- ii. “Placing a new addition on a non-character-defining elevation and limiting the size and scale in relationship to the historic building.” (pg. 113) The new addition will be placed on the rear elevation and will be smaller in height and width than the historic building.
- iii. “Designing new exterior additions to historic buildings or adjacent new construction which is compatible with the historic character of the site and which preserves the historic relationship between the building or buildings and the landscape. (pg.105) The addition will be compatible with the historic building through the use of similar materials and forms.

C. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. With the conditions of approval, the application is in compliance with the following goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan and the North End Plan.

- i. The unique character of the neighborhood should be maintained, including architectural style, sitting on the lots, orientation of the units and landscaping characteristics. (p. 18)
The unique character of the neighborhood will be maintained; the addition will use materials and forms that are compatible with the house and the surrounding neighborhood.
 - ii. Protect historically and culturally significant resources that contribute to community identity and history. Goal, page 5-12
The original house will be protected by designing an addition that is compatible.
 - D. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the district. With the conditions of approval, the project is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education or cultural aspects of the district because it complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts and the North End Plan.
 - E. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the district and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. This application complies with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the request for any variances.
2. A contributing building, site, structure or object adds to the historic architectural qualities, historic associations, or archeological values for which a property is significant because (a) it was present during the period of significance, and possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time or is capable of yielding important information about the period, or (b) it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria. The property was built during the era of significance and retains its integrity. It is congruous.



Planning & Development Services

Boise City Hall, 2nd Floor
150 N. Capitol Boulevard
P. O. Box 500
Boise, Idaho 83701-0500

Phone: 208/384-3830
Fax: 208/384-3753
TDD/TTY: 800/377-3529
Website: www.cityofboise.org/pds

4

Planning Division Staff Report

File Number	DRH08-00173
Applicant	Athena V. Killeen
Property Address	1309 North 25 th Street
Public Hearing Date	June 23, 2008
Heard by	Historic Preservation Commission
Analyst	Julie Archambeault
Checked By	Sarah Schafer

Public Notification

Radius notices mailed to adjacent properties: **June 6, 2008**
Staff posted notice on site on: **June 5, 2008**

Table of Contents

1. Project Data and Facts	2
2. Land Use	2
3. Project Proposal	3
4. Ordinance / Standards	4
5. Analysis / Findings	4
6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions	6

1. Project Data and Facts

Applicant/Status	Athena V. Killeen / Owner
Architect/Representative	N/A
Location of Property	1309 North 25 th Street
Size of Property	6,100 sq. ft.
Present Zoning and Land Use	R-1CH (Single Family Residential)
Historic District	Expanded North End
Date of Construction	1922
Style	Other
Status	Contributing
Square Footage of Existing House	1,412

Description of Applicant's Request

The applicant is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a single-story, rear addition to the main dwelling.

2. Land Use

Description and Character of Surrounding Area

The surrounding housing is mixed in size and style. Landscaping includes lawn, trees and smaller plantings.

Site Characteristics

The site consists of a single family residence and a small single-car garage. Landscaping includes large trees, small shrubs and lawn.

Special Considerations

None

History of Previous Actions

1922-Construction of house

3. Project Proposal

Site Design

Land Use	Existing	Proposed
Percentage of the site devoted to building coverage:	23%	30.5%
Percentage of the site devoted to paving:	1%	1%
Percentage of the site devoted to landscaping:	76%	68.5%
TOTAL	100%	100%

Setbacks

Yard	Required	Proposed for Building	Proposed for Garage
Front (southwest)	15' (bldg.) 20' (garage)	No change	No change
Side (southeast)	5' (bldg.) 5' (garage)	8'	No change
Side (northwest)	5' (bldg.) 5' (garage)	27'	No change
Rear (northeast)	15' (bldg.) 0' (garage)	42'	No change

Fencing

A wood fence lines the perimeter of the rear yard.

Structure(s) Design

Number and Proposed Use of Buildings	Two buildings exist-a single-family dwelling and a single-car garage.
Maximum Building Height	Existing-18'; Proposed-13' 6"
Number of Stories	1

4. Ordinance / Standards

Section	
11-04-04.01	General Standards
2-18-09	Historic Preservation Ordinance
4.1	Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts
	Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Structures

5. Analysis/Findings

Section 2-18-9 (A) (1) (c) Confirmation of Classification

As part of the application process for a Certificate of Appropriateness, the Planning Staff shall confirm the contributing or non-contributing classification of the property based on the criteria set forth in the definitions of Section 2-18-02.

- A. A property is contributing if
 - 1. it was present during the period of significance, AND
 - 2. it possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time
 - i. Location
 - ii. Design
 - iii. Setting
 - iv. Materials
 - v. Workmanship
 - vi. Feeling
 - vii. Association
 - 3. it is capable of yielding important information about the period OR
 - 4. it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria
- B. A property is noncontributing if
 - 1. it was not present during the period of significance,
 - 2. due to alterations, disturbances, additions, or other changes, it no longer possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time OR
 - 3. it is incapable of yielding important information about the period

The North End's era of significance runs from the early 20th century through the mid-1950s. This building was constructed in 1922. The house has retained its original design, materials, setting and location and retains its integrity of workmanship, feeling and association. It is contributing.

Discussion

Many aspects of the addition are congruous. It is a small, rear addition that will not be visible from the street. It is shorter than the existing house and its features are of the same scale as those of the existing house.

The roofline and eaves are not congruous. Neither matches those of the house. The roofline should be a rear gable, like the rear facing section of the house. The eaves should match the height and size of the existing eaves. Also, the windows proposed are of a modern material and of modern shapes. They should be metal clad wood, rather than vinyl clad and should be of a shape and configuration that more closely match those of the remainder of the house. With these conditions, the addition will be congruous.

6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions

Pursuant to Boise City Code 2-18-9 A and B of Boise Municipal Code, the request to construct a single-story, rear addition to the main dwelling is congruous with the historical, architectural, archeological, educational or cultural aspects of the historic district because:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (1995 Edition), the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Districts, the North End Plan and the Boise City Comprehensive Plan are references often utilized by the Historic Preservation Commission to determine whether a change is congruous with the historic and architectural qualities of the historic district.

1. The Commission's decision in regard to Certificates of Appropriateness for alterations, as described in 2-18-09 (A), shall be based on six findings as applicable to that property. (2-18-11 01)
 - A. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not in a commercial district.
 - B. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. With the conditions of approval, this application complies with the following guidelines.
 - i. "Set back a new addition from the primary façade of the original building to maintain original proportion, massing, size, and scale." (4.1.2) The new addition is set 28' back from the front façade.
 - ii. "Relate rooflines, the pitch, and orientation of the new addition to the primary building." (4.1.3) The roofline of the addition will be a rear gable, as is the current rear facing section of the house.
 - iii. "Use similar materials as found on the original building." (4.1.6) The addition will use materials similar to those found on the original building including lap siding and wood trim.
 - iv. "Consider ground or basement additions before the addition of dormer(s). Under unique circumstances driven by site constraints, dormer(s) additions

should be designed in proportional scale to the original roof and should not visually compete.” (4.1.8) The addition is a ground floor addition.

- v. “Maintain proportional lot coverage as found on the neighboring properties of the same block; maximum lot coverage of all buildings should not exceed 30% of the total lot area. Minimum open space should be 40% of the total lot area. Any exceptions to these percentages will be closely scrutinized.” (4.1.10) The proposal will bring the lot coverage up to 30.5%.

C. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction.) This application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. With the conditions of approval, this application complies with the following guidelines.

- i. “Designing a new addition in a manner that makes clear what is historic and what is new. (pg. 112) Design for the new work may be contemporary or may reference design motifs from the historic building. In either case, it should always be clearly differentiated from the historic building and be compatible in terms of mass, materials, relationship of solids to voids, and color.” (pg. 113) The lowered roofline of the addition clearly marks it as new, while the similar materials and forms make it compatible.
- ii. “Placing a new addition on a non-character-defining elevation and limiting the size and scale in relationship to the historic building.” (pg. 113) The new addition will be placed on the rear elevation and will be smaller in height and width than the historic building.
- iii. “Designing new exterior additions to historic buildings or adjacent new construction which is compatible with the historic character of the site and which preserves the historic relationship between the building or buildings and the landscape. (pg.105) The addition will be compatible with the historic building through the use of similar materials and forms.

D. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. With the conditions of approval, the application is in compliance with the following goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan and the North End Plan.

- i. The unique character of the neighborhood should be maintained, including architectural style, sitting on the lots, orientation of the units and landscaping characteristics. (p. 18) The unique character of the neighborhood will be maintained; the addition will use materials and forms that are compatible with the house and the surrounding neighborhood.
- ii. Protect historically and culturally significant resources that contribute to community identity and history. Goal, page 5-12 The original house will be protected by designing an addition that is compatible.

- E. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the district. With the conditions of approval, the project is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education or cultural aspects of the district because it complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts and the North End Plan.
 - F. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the district and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. This application complies with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the request for any variances.
2. A contributing building, site, structure or object adds to the historic architectural qualities, historic associations, or archeological values for which a property is significant because (a) it was present during the period of significance, and possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time or is capable of yielding important information about the period, or (b) it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria. The property was built during the era of significance and retains its integrity. It is congruous.

Site Specific Conditions of Approval

- 1. Compliance with plans and specifications submitted to and on file in the Planning and Development Services Department dated received May 19, 2008.
- 2. The roof and eaves will match those of the house.
- 3. The windows will be metal clad wood.
- 4. Except for the bathroom window, the new windows will be 1/1.

Standard Conditions of Approval

- 2. The applicant shall comply with the Boise City Fire Code.
- 3. Prior to a Building Permit and prior to any construction on the site, an Erosion and Sediment Control Permit must be obtained from the Building Division of the Planning and Development Services Department.
- 4. No change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall be valid unless in writing and signed by the applicant or his authorized representative and an authorized representative of the City of Boise. The burden shall be upon the applicant to obtain the written confirmation of any change and not upon the City of Boise.

5. Any change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall require the applicant to comply with all rules, regulations, ordinances, plans or other regulatory and legal restrictions in force at the time the applicant or successors in interest advise the City of intent to change the planned use of the property described herein unless a variance in said requirements or other legal relief is granted pursuant to the law in effect at the time the change in use is sought.
6. If the applicant does not act on the Certificate of Appropriateness through the commencement of construction, or extended pursuant to the Boise City Code, within eighteen months, it will become null and void without further notification from this department.
7. The applicant shall be required to obtain a Building Permit prior to the start of construction.

Construction Site Requirements

8. The practices required below are intended to mitigate the impact and disturbance of residential property owners during the construction of adjacent buildings or structures. The following conditions apply to all construction-related activities ranging from grading and demolition activities to final occupancy on any land or parcel falling under the proprietary ownership of the permit applicant.
 - a) Prior to the issuance of a building permit and prior to the commencement of any construction on-site, an Erosion and Sediment Control (ESC) permit must be obtained from the Planning and Development Services Department. No grading, demolition or earth disturbing activities may start until an approved ESC permit and the associated site work or grading permits have been issued.
 - b) Measures shall be taken to manage construction debris and trash on the construction site and efforts shall also be made to provide reasonable controls to minimize fugitive dust on the construction site. Such measures shall include, but are not limited to:
 - Provide suitable containers for solid waste generated by construction activity;
 - Wet demolition of existing buildings;
 - Watering of driving surfaces and earth moving activities;
 - Installation of wind screening around property and each open floor above grade; and
 - Daily broom cleaning of above grade floors, adjacent streets and sidewalks.
 - c) To reduce the noise impact of construction on nearby residential properties, all exterior construction activities shall be limited to the hours between 7:00 a.m. and 7:00 p.m. Monday through Friday and 8:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. for Saturday and Sunday. Low noise impact activities such as surveying, layout and weather

protection may be performed at any time. After each floor of the structure or building is enclosed with exterior walls and windows, interior construction of the enclosed floors can be performed at any time.

- d) A minimum height of six foot (6') rigid security fencing, either wood or metal, shall be installed around the construction site within 30 days of the date when the first city permit is issued on projects where construction activity shall exceed 90 days.
- e) Exterior lighting and other illuminating equipment or materials shall be positioned, shielded, directed and located to not reflect or impact adjacent residential property and streets.
- f) Applicant shall comply with Boise City Fire Department requirements for water, access, and/or other requirements as determined by the Fire Marshal.
- g) Any conditions to be enforced during construction shall remain posted at each street abutting the construction site for the duration of the project. In addition to the posted conditions the permit holder shall also post an 11"x 17" laminated sign containing a project contact phone number, name of project contact and the Boise City contact number, 384-3845, to address issues as they arise. Failure to abide by any conditions set forth shall be grounds for revocation of Conditional Use Permit and/or Building Permits and may be subject the owner or owner's agents to fines and criminal citations.