



Planning & Development Services

Boise City Hall, 2nd Floor
150 N. Capitol Boulevard
P. O. Box 500
Boise, Idaho 83701-0500

Phone: 208/384-3830
Fax: 208/384-3753
TDD/TTY: 800/377-3529
Website: www.cityofboise.org/pds

3

Summary/Reason Statement for DRH08-00172

Staff's Recommendation

Approval

Summary

EVA KEAN requests Historic Preservation approval to demolish the carport on property located at 2126 N. 16th Street in an R-1CH (Single Family Residential with Historic overlay) zone.

1. In order for the Commission to approve a demolition or relocation request at least three out of the five Findings must be met. (2-18-9C) Four of the five Findings have been met. The property is not contributing, the carport cannot meet landmark status, its demolition will not adversely affect the District or the adjacent properties, and the submitted plans will have a positive effect on the District and the adjacent properties.
2. The Commission's decision in regard to Certificates of Appropriateness for alterations, as described in 2-18-09 (A), shall be based on six findings as applicable to that property. (2-18-11 01)
 - A. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not in a commercial district.
 - B. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. This application complies with the following guidelines.
 - ❖ "Maintain proportional lot coverage as found on the neighboring properties of the same block; maximum lot coverage of all buildings should not exceed 30% of the total lot area. Minimum open space should be 40% of the total lot area. Any exceptions to these percentages will be closely scrutinized." (4.1.10) The project will bring the lot coverage down to 15%.
 - C. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable

(preservation, restoration or reconstruction.) This application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. This application complies with the following guidelines.

- ❖ "Removing or radically changing buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished. (pg. 102) The carport is not important in defining the overall historic character of the property.
- ❖ "Removing a historic building, building feature or landscape feature that is important in defining the historic character of the setting." (pg.108) The carport is not important in defining the historic character of the setting.

D. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. The application is in compliance with the following goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan and the North End Plan.

- ❖ The proposed use or design of the property should reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood and be compatible with it. (p. 17) The proposed use of the property will reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood and is compatible with it.

E. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the district. The project is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education or cultural aspects of the district because it complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts and the North End Plan.

F. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the district and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. This application complies with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the request for any variances.

3. A contributing building, site, structure or object adds to the historic architectural qualities, historic associations, or archeological values for which a property is significant because (a) it was present during the period of significance, and possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time or is capable of yielding important information about the period, or (b) it individually meets the

National Register eligibility criteria. The building is not contributing. It has received many alterations.



Planning & Development Services

Boise City Hall, 2nd Floor
150 N. Capitol Boulevard
P. O. Box 500
Boise, Idaho 83701-0500

Phone: 208/384-3830
Fax: 208/384-3753
TDD/TTY: 800/377-3529
Website: www.cityofboise.org/pds

3

Planning Division Staff Report

File Number	DRH08-00172
Applicant	Eva Kean
Property Address	2126 North 16 th Street
Public Hearing Date	June 23, 2008
Heard by	Historic Preservation Commission
Analyst	Julie Archambeault
Checked By	Sarah Schafer

Public Notification

Radius notices mailed to adjacent properties: **June 6, 2008**
Staff posted notice on site on: **June 5, 2008**

Table of Contents

1. Project Data and Facts	2
2. Land Use	2
3. Project Proposal	3
4. Ordinance / Standards	4
5. Analysis / Findings	4
6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions	6

1. Project Data and Facts

Applicant/Status	Eva Kean / Owner
Architect/Representative	Amy Cook / AAC Architecture
Location of Property	2126 North 16 th Street
Size of Property	.21 acres
Present Zoning and Land Use	R-1CH / Single Family Residential
Historic District	North End
Date of Construction	Pre-1912
Style	None
Status	Non-contributing
Square Footage of Existing House	1,892

Description of Applicant's Request

The applicant is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the carport.

2. Land Use

Description and Character of Surrounding Area

The surrounding area lacks the sidewalk, curb and gutter of the rest of the North End. The houses are a mix of sizes, uses and eras. There are many large trees present.

Site Characteristics

The building is a large complex of additions. It sits very close to the neighbor to the north. Landscaping is made up of large trees and lawn.

Special Considerations

None

History of Previous Actions

Pre-1912-Construction of house
Pre-1949-Side porches removed
1950-garage constructed
Pre-1956-Two story addition constructed
1978-Duplex addition constructed

3. Project Proposal

Site Design

Land Use	Existing	Proposed
Percentage of the site devoted to building coverage:	21%	15%
Percentage of the site devoted to paving:	6%	6%
Percentage of the site devoted to landscaping:	73%	69%
TOTAL	100%	100%

Setbacks

Yard	Required	Proposed for Building	Proposed for Garage
Front (southwest)	15' (bldg.) 20' (garage)	No change	No change
Side Street (southeast)	15' (bldg.) 15' (garage)	No change	No change
Side (northwest)	5' (bldg.) 5' (garage)	No change	No change
Rear (northeast)	15' (bldg.) 9' (garage)	No change	No change

Fencing

Chain link lines the perimeter of the rear yard.

Structure(s) Design

Number and Proposed Use of Buildings	One building exists-it is the residential building and its connected additions and garage.
Maximum Building Height	No change
Number of Stories	1 ½ -2 (No change)

4. Ordinance / Standards

Section	
11-04-04.01	General Standards
2-18-09	Historic Preservation Ordinance
4.1	Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts
	Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Structures

5. Analysis/Findings

Section 2-18-9 (A) (1) (c) Confirmation of Classification

As part of the application process for a Certificate of Appropriateness, the Planning Staff shall confirm the contributing or non-contributing classification of the property based on the criteria set forth in the definitions of Section 2-18-02.

- A. A property is contributing if
 - 1. it was present during the period of significance, AND
 - 2. it possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time
 - i. Location
 - ii. Design
 - iii. Setting
 - iv. Materials
 - v. Workmanship
 - vi. Feeling-The property expresses of the aesthetic or historic sense of its time.
 - vii. Association-The property retains its direct link with
 - 3. it is capable of yielding important information about the period
- B. A property is noncontributing if
 - 1. it was not present during the period of significance,
 - 2. due to alterations, disturbances, additions, or other changes, it no longer possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time OR
 - 3. it is incapable of yielding important information about the period OR

The building has been altered continually over its life and is not contributing. Alterations include numerous additions, the change of the rear dwelling into a garage and changes to the cladding.

Section 2-18-9 C Demolition or Relocation.

After the designation by ordinance of an historical district, or historical district - residential, no building or structure which is a part of such district shall be demolished or moved until after an application for Certificate of Appropriateness relating to the demolition or moving of such building or structure has been submitted to and approved by the Commission. A Certificate of Appropriateness

must be issued prior to the issuance of any building or other permit required by the City for the demolition or moving of any building or structure which is part of an historical district or historical district - residential. A Certificate of Appropriateness shall be required regardless of whether other licenses or permits are required for the moving or demolition of such building or structure.

1. Findings. In order for the Commission to approve a demolition or relocation request at least three (3) out of the five (5) following findings must be met:

a. That the building, project, site or structure is not classified as contributory to the district.

The site has not been classified as contributory to the district. The applicant has met this Finding.

b. That the building, object, site or structure cannot reasonably meet National, State or Local criteria for designation as an historical or architectural landmark.

The carport cannot reasonably meet National, State or Local criteria for designation as an historical or architectural landmark. It is a modern feature. The applicant has met this Finding.

c. That demolition of the building, object, site or structure would not adversely affect the character of the District and/or the adjacent properties.

The carport was built in the modern era. Because of this, its demolition will not adversely affect the character of the District or the adjacent properties. The applicant has met this Finding.

d. That the owner has reasonably demonstrated that rehabilitation of the building, object, site or structure would not be economically feasible.

This alternative has not been explored. The applicant has not met this Finding.

e. That plans have been submitted to redevelop the property if the demolition proceeds, and such plans will have a positive effect on the District and/or adjacent properties.

Plans have been submitted to replace the carport with a parking pad. Because the plans include the continuation of parking and the loss of the modern carport, these plans will have a positive effect on the District. The applicant has met this Finding.

The applicant has met four out of five findings.

Discussion

This project is congruous. It will remove a modern, incongruous feature from the district. Although it will not be replaced with a structure, the space will be cleaned up for continued use as a parking pad.

6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions

Pursuant to Boise City Code 2-18-9 A and B of Boise Municipal Code, the request to demolish the carport is congruous with the historical, architectural, archeological, educational or cultural aspects of the historic district because:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (1995 Edition), the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Districts, the North End Plan and the Boise City Comprehensive Plan are references often utilized by the Historic Preservation Commission to determine whether a change is congruous with the historic and architectural qualities of the historic district.

1. In order for the Commission to approve a demolition or relocation request at least three out of the five Findings must be met. (2-18-9C) Four of the five Findings have been met. The property is not contributing, the carport cannot meet landmark status, its demolition will not adversely affect the District or the adjacent properties, and the submitted plans will have a positive effect on the District and the adjacent properties.
2. The Commission's decision in regard to Certificates of Appropriateness for alterations, as described in 2-18-09 (A), shall be based on six findings as applicable to that property. (2-18-11 01)
 - A. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not in a commercial district.
 - B. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. This application complies with the following guidelines.
 - ❖ "Maintain proportional lot coverage as found on the neighboring properties of the same block; maximum lot coverage of all buildings should not exceed 30% of the total lot area. Minimum open space should be 40% of the total lot area. Any exceptions to these percentages will be closely scrutinized." (4.1.10) The project will bring the lot coverage down to 15%.
 - C. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction.) This application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. This application complies with the following guidelines.

- ❖ “Removing or radically changing buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished. (pg. 102) The carport is not important in defining the overall historic character of the property.
 - ❖ “Removing a historic building, building feature or landscape feature that is important in defining the historic character of the setting.” (pg.108) The carport is not important in defining the historic character of the setting.
- D. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. The application is in compliance with the following goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan and the North End Plan.
- ❖ The proposed use or design of the property should reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood and be compatible with it. (p. 17) The proposed use of the property will reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood and is compatible with it.
- E. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the district. The project is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education or cultural aspects of the district because it complies with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts and the North End Plan.
- F. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the district and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. This application complies with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the request for any variances.
- G. A contributing building, site, structure or object adds to the historic architectural qualities, historic associations, or archeological values for which a property is significant because (a) it was present during the period of significance, and possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time or is capable of yielding important information about the period, or (b) it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria. The building is not contributing. It has received many alterations.

Site Specific Conditions of Approval

1. Compliance with plans and specifications submitted to and on file in the Planning and Development Services Department dated received May 19, 2008.

Standard Conditions of Approval

2. The applicant shall comply with the Boise City Fire Code.
3. Prior to a Building Permit and prior to any construction on the site, an Erosion and Sediment Control Permit must be obtained from the Building Division of the Planning and Development Services Department.
4. No change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall be valid unless in writing and signed by the applicant or his authorized representative and an authorized representative of the City of Boise. The burden shall be upon the applicant to obtain the written confirmation of any change and not upon the City of Boise.
5. Any change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall require the applicant to comply with all rules, regulations, ordinances, plans or other regulatory and legal restrictions in force at the time the applicant or successors in interest advise the City of intent to change the planned use of the property described herein unless a variance in said requirements or other legal relief is granted pursuant to the law in effect at the time the change in use is sought.
6. If the applicant does not act on the Certificate of Appropriateness through the commencement of construction, or extended pursuant to the Boise City Code, within eighteen months, it will become null and void without further notification from this department.
7. The applicant shall be required to obtain a Building Permit prior to the start of construction.

Construction Site Requirements

8. The practices required below are intended to mitigate the impact and disturbance of residential property owners during the construction of adjacent buildings or structures. The following conditions apply to all construction-related activities ranging from grading and demolition activities to final occupancy on any land or parcel falling under the proprietary ownership of the permit applicant.
 - a) Prior to the issuance of a building permit and prior to the commencement of any construction on-site, an Erosion and Sediment Control (ESC) permit must be obtained from the Planning and Development Services Department. No grading, demolition or earth disturbing activities may start until an approved ESC permit and the associated site work or grading permits have been issued.
 - b) Measures shall be taken to manage construction debris and trash on the construction site and efforts shall also be made to provide reasonable controls to minimize fugitive dust on the construction site. Such measures shall include, but are not limited to:
 - Provide suitable containers for solid waste generated by construction

- activity;
 - Wet demolition of existing buildings;
 - Watering of driving surfaces and earth moving activities;
 - Installation of wind screening around property and each open floor above grade; and
 - Daily broom cleaning of above grade floors, adjacent streets and sidewalks.
- c) To reduce the noise impact of construction on nearby residential properties, all exterior construction activities shall be limited to the hours between 7:00 a.m. and 7:00 p.m. Monday through Friday and 8:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. for Saturday and Sunday. Low noise impact activities such as surveying, layout and weather protection may be performed at any time. After each floor of the structure or building is enclosed with exterior walls and windows, interior construction of the enclosed floors can be performed at any time.
- d) A minimum height of six foot (6') rigid security fencing, either wood or metal, shall be installed around the construction site within 30 days of the date when the first city permit is issued on projects where construction activity shall exceed 90 days.
- e) Exterior lighting and other illuminating equipment or materials shall be positioned, shielded, directed and located to not reflect or impact adjacent residential property and streets.
- f) Applicant shall comply with Boise City Fire Department requirements for water, access, and/or other requirements as determined by the Fire Marshal.
- g) Any conditions to be enforced during construction shall remain posted at each street abutting the construction site for the duration of the project. In addition to the posted conditions the permit holder shall also post an 11"x 17" laminated sign containing a project contact phone number, name of project contact and the Boise City contact number, 384-3845, to address issues as they arise. Failure to abide by any conditions set forth shall be grounds for revocation of Conditional Use Permit and/or Building Permits and may be subject the owner or owner's agents to fines and criminal citations.