



## Planning & Development Services

Boise City Hall, 2nd Floor  
150 N. Capitol Boulevard  
P. O. Box 500  
Boise, Idaho 83701-0500

Phone: 208/384-3830  
Fax: 208/384-3753  
TDD/TTY: 800/377-3529  
Website: [www.cityofboise.org/pds](http://www.cityofboise.org/pds)

# 2

## Summary/Reason Statement for DRH08-00171

### Staff's Recommendation

Approval

### Summary

**JANA REPULSKI** requests Historic Preservation approval to demolish the garage and canopy and construct a two car garage with attic storage on property located at 1411 N. 19<sup>th</sup> Street in an R-1CH (Single Family Residential with Historic overlay) zone.

1. In order for the Commission to approve a demolition or relocation request at least three out of the five Findings must be met. (2-18-9C) Four of the five Findings have been met. The outbuildings are not contributing, they cannot meet landmark status, their demolition will not adversely affect the District or the adjacent properties, and the submitted plans will have a positive effect on the District and the adjacent properties.
2. The Commission's decision in regard to Certificates of Appropriateness for alterations, as described in 2-18-09 (A), shall be based on six findings as applicable to that property. (2-18-11 01)
  - A. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not in a commercial district. This finding is not applicable.
  - B. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. This application complies with the following guidelines.
    1. "Maintain a proportional mass, size, and height to ensure the accessory building or dwelling unit is not taller than the primary building on the lot or does not occupy the entire backyard." (6.1.2) The garage will be six feet shorter than the house.
    2. "Subordinate the accessory dwelling unit, accessory building, or garage to the primary residential building on the site by placing the structure to the rear of the lot. Otherwise, consider locating the accessory building,

dwelling unit, or garage to the side as long as it is set back substantially.” (6.1.3) The garage will be placed to the rear of the lot.

3. “Use similar materials used on the primary existing building.” (6.1.5) The new garage will use materials similar to those used on the historic garage, rather than those used on the house. Because the materials used are historically present for the outbuildings on this property, this is congruous.
4. “Match rooflines; vary rooflines as long as the variation is not significant.” (6.1.6) The garage will have a gable roofline similar to that on the primary house.
5. “Design garages so they are alley loaded.” (6.1.7) The garage will be alley loaded.
6. “Maintain proportional lot coverage as found on the neighboring properties of the same block. Maximum lot coverage of all buildings should not exceed 30% of the total lot area. Minimum open space should be 40% of the total lot area.” (6.1.8.) The project will raise the lot coverage from 32.4% to 32.8%. Although this percentage is over the recommended 30%, it is only .4% over the existing percentage. Because the project will only raise the existing percentage by .4%, this overage is congruous.

C. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction.) This application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. This application complies with the following guidelines.

1. Designing required new parking so that it is as unobtrusive as possible, thus minimizing the effect on the historic character of the setting is recommended. (pg. 108) The new parking will be unobtrusive. It will be smaller than the house and will be located at the rear of the lot.
2. Removing or radically changing buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished is not recommended. (pg. 102) The existing outbuildings have been altered in the modern period and are not important in defining the overall historic character of the property. Their removal will not diminish the character of the property.
3. Introducing new construction onto the building site which is visually incompatible in terms of size, scale, design, materials, color and texture; which destroys historic relationships on the site; or which damages or destroys important landscape features is not recommended. (pg. 105) The new construction is visually compatible in terms of size, scale, design, materials, color and texture.

D. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein.

The application is in compliance with the following goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan and the North End Plan.

1. The proposed use or design of the property should reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood and be compatible with it. (p. 17) The design and use of the new building reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood and is compatible with it.
  2. The unique character of the neighborhood should be maintained, including architectural style, sitting on the lots, orientation of the units and landscaping characteristics. (p. 18) The style of the neighborhood will be maintained by this project.
  3. Protect historically and culturally significant resources that contribute to community identity and history. Goal, page 5-12 The property, a historic and culturally significant resource that contributes to community identity and history, will be protected.
- E. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the district. The project is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education or cultural aspects of the district because it complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts and the North End Plan.
- F. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the district and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. This application complies with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the request for any variances.
3. A contributing building, site, structure or object adds to the historic architectural qualities, historic associations, or archeological values for which a property is significant because (a) it was present during the period of significance, and possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time or is capable of yielding important information about the period, or (b) it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria. The property was built during the period of significance and retains its integrity. It is contributing.





## Planning & Development Services

Boise City Hall, 2nd Floor  
150 N. Capitol Boulevard  
P. O. Box 500  
Boise, Idaho 83701-0500

Phone: 208/384-3830  
Fax: 208/384-3753  
TDD/TTY: 800/377-3529  
Website: [www.cityofboise.org/pds](http://www.cityofboise.org/pds)

# 2

## Planning Division Staff Report

<b>File Number</b>	DRH08-00171
<b>Applicant</b>	Jana Repulski
<b>Property Address</b>	1411 North 19 <sup>th</sup> Street
<b>Public Hearing Date</b>	June 23, 2008
<b>Heard by</b>	Historic Preservation Commission
<b>Analyst</b>	Julie Archambeault
<b>Checked By</b>	Sarah Schafer

---

### Public Notification

Radius notices mailed to adjacent properties: **June 6, 2008**  
Staff posted notice on site on: **June 5, 2008**

---

### Table of Contents

1. Project Data and Facts	2
2. Land Use	2
3. Project Proposal	3
4. Ordinance / Standards	4
5. Analysis / Findings	4
6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions	6

## 1. Project Data and Facts

<b>Applicant/Status</b>	Jana Repulski / Owner
<b>Architect/Representative</b>	Amy Cook / AAC Architecture
<b>Location of Property</b>	1411 North 19 <sup>th</sup> Street
<b>Size of Property</b>	6,100 sq. ft.
<b>Present Zoning and Land Use</b>	R-1CH
<b>Historic District</b>	Expanded North End
<b>Date of Construction</b>	1912
<b>Style</b>	Craftsman / Bungalow
<b>Status</b>	Contributing
<b>Square Footage of Existing House</b>	1,562 sq. ft.

### Description of Applicant's Request

The applicant is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the garage and canopy and construct a two car garage with attic storage.

## 2. Land Use

### Description and Character of Surrounding Area

The surrounding area is made up of houses of a similar age, size and style. The street trees are very large.

### Site Characteristics

The site has a small, single family dwelling and two outbuildings. The property is landscaped with trees, shrubs and a lawn.

### Special Considerations

None

### History of Previous Actions

1912-Construction of house  
1960-Widen and repair landing for steps and repair railing

### 3. Project Proposal

#### Site Design

Land Use	Existing	Proposed
Percentage of the site devoted to building coverage:	32.4%	32.8%
Percentage of the site devoted to paving:	1%	2%
Percentage of the site devoted to landscaping:	66.6%	65.2%
TOTAL	100%	100%

#### Setbacks

Yard	Required	Proposed for Building	Proposed for Garage
Front (southwest)	15' (bldg.) 20' (garage)	No change	91'
Side (southeast)	5' (bldg.) 5' (garage)	No change	5'
Side (northwest)	5' (bldg.) 5' (garage)	No change	24'
Rear (northeast)	15' (bldg.) 10' (garage)	No change	10'

#### Fencing

Existing wood fence to remain.

#### Structure(s) Design

Number and Proposed Use of Buildings	Three buildings exist-one single family residence and two outbuildings.
Maximum Building Height	House-22' 4"; Proposed garage-16' 6"
Number of Stories	1

## 4. Ordinance / Standards

Section	
11-04-04.01	General Standards
2-18-09	Historic Preservation Ordinance
4.1	Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts
	Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Structures

## 5. Analysis/Findings

### Section 2-18-9 (A) (1) (c) Confirmation of Classification

*As part of the application process for a Certificate of Appropriateness, the Planning Staff shall confirm the contributing or non-contributing classification of the property based on the criteria set forth in the definitions of Section 2-18-02.*

- A. A property is contributing if
  - 1. it was present during the period of significance, AND
  - 2. it possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time
    - i. Location
    - ii. Design
    - iii. Setting
    - iv. Materials
    - v. Workmanship
    - vi. Feeling
    - vii. Association
  - 3. it is capable of yielding important information about the period
- B. A property is noncontributing if
  - 1. it was not present during the period of significance,
  - 2. due to alterations, disturbances, additions, or other changes, it no longer possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time OR
  - 3. it is incapable of yielding important information about the period OR

The North End's era of significance runs from the early 20<sup>th</sup> century through the mid-1950s. This building was constructed prior to 1912. The property has not changed since its classification. Although the porch has been enclosed, its design has retained much of its historic integrity. Its location, setting, materials and workmanship have also retained their integrity. The house still expresses the historic sense of its time and retains its direct link with the Craftsman Style. It is contributing.



**Section 2-18-9 C Demolition or Relocation.**

*After the designation by ordinance of an historical district, or historical district - residential, no building or structure which is a part of such district shall be demolished or moved until after an application for Certificate of Appropriateness relating to the demolition or moving of such building or structure has been submitted to and approved by the Commission. A Certificate of Appropriateness must be issued prior to the issuance of any building or other permit required by the City for the demolition or moving of any building or structure which is part of an historical district or historical district - residential. A Certificate of Appropriateness shall be required regardless of whether other licenses or permits are required for the moving or demolition of such building or structure.*

*1. Findings. In order for the Commission to approve a demolition or relocation request at least three (3) out of the five (5) following findings must be met:*

*a. That the building, project, site or structure is not classified as contributory to the district.*

The site, contributes to the District. However, this does not include the outbuildings. The outbuildings have not been classified as contributory to the district. The applicant has met this Finding.

*b. That the building, object, site or structure cannot reasonably meet National, State or Local criteria for designation as an historical or architectural landmark.*

The outbuildings cannot reasonably meet National, State or Local criteria for designation as an historical or architectural landmark. They have been altered and lack historic significance. The applicant has met this Finding.

*c. That demolition of the building, object, site or structure would not adversely affect the character of the District and/or the adjacent properties.*

The outbuildings were altered in the modern era. Because of these alterations, their demolition will not adversely affect the character of the District or the adjacent properties. The applicant has met this Finding.

*d. That the owner has reasonably demonstrated that rehabilitation of the building, object, site or structure would not be economically feasible.*

This alternative has not been explored. The applicant has not met this Finding.

*e. That plans have been submitted to redevelop the property if the demolition proceeds, and such plans will have a positive effect on the District and/or adjacent properties.*

Plans have been submitted to replace the existing garage with a new, larger garage. These plans will have a positive effect on the District. The applicant has met this Finding.

The applicant has met four out of five findings.

### **Discussion**

The new garage meets all Boise City Design Guidelines and Secretary of the Interior's Standards. At 16' 6" tall, it is shorter than the house and it will be placed at the rear of the property. It will be sided with horizontal lap siding, which is a common material for garages in the North End, and it will only increase the lot coverage by .4%. The project is congruous.

## **6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions**

**Pursuant to Boise City Code 2-18-9 A and B of Boise Municipal Code, the request to demolish the garage and canopy and construct a two car garage with attic storage is congruous with the historical, architectural, archeological, educational or cultural aspects of the historic district because:**

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (1995 Edition), the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Districts, the North End Plan and the Boise City Comprehensive Plan are references often utilized by the Historic Preservation Commission to determine whether a change is congruous with the historic and architectural qualities of the historic district.

1. In order for the Commission to approve a demolition or relocation request at least three out of the five Findings must be met. (2-18-9C) Four of the five Findings have been met. The outbuildings are not contributing, they cannot meet landmark status, their demolition will not adversely affect the District or the adjacent properties, and the submitted plans will have a positive effect on the District and the adjacent properties.
2. The Commission's decision in regard to Certificates of Appropriateness for alterations, as described in 2-18-09 (A), shall be based on six findings as applicable to that property. (2-18-11 01)
  - A. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not in a commercial district. This finding is not applicable.
  - B. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. This application complies with the following guidelines.
    1. "Maintain a proportional mass, size, and height to ensure the accessory building or dwelling unit is not taller than the primary building on the lot or does not occupy the entire backyard." (6.1.2) The garage will be six feet shorter than the house.
    2. "Subordinate the accessory dwelling unit, accessory building, or garage to the primary residential building on the site by placing the structure to the rear of the lot. Otherwise, consider locating the accessory building, dwelling unit, or garage to the side as long as it is set back substantially." (6.1.3) The garage will be placed to the rear of the lot.

3. "Use similar materials used on the primary existing building." (6.1.5) The new garage will use materials similar to those used on the historic garage, rather than those used on the house. Because the materials used are historically present for the outbuildings on this property, this is congruous.
  4. "Match rooflines; vary rooflines as long as the variation is not significant." (6.1.6) The garage will have a gable roofline similar to that on the primary house.
  5. "Design garages so they are alley loaded." (6.1.7) The garage will be alley loaded.
  6. "Maintain proportional lot coverage as found on the neighboring properties of the same block. Maximum lot coverage of all buildings should not exceed 30% of the total lot area. Minimum open space should be 40% of the total lot area." (6.1.8.) The project will raise the lot coverage from 32.4% to 32.8%. Although this percentage is over the recommended 30%, it is only .4% over the existing percentage. Because the project will only raise the existing percentage by .4%, this overage is congruous.
- C. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction.) This application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. This application complies with the following guidelines.
1. Designing required new parking so that it is as unobtrusive as possible, thus minimizing the effect on the historic character of the setting is recommended. (pg. 108) The new parking will be unobtrusive. It will be smaller than the house and will be located at the rear of the lot.
  2. Removing or radically changing buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished is not recommended. (pg. 102) The existing outbuildings have been altered in the modern period and are not important in defining the overall historic character of the property. Their removal will not diminish the character of the property.
  3. Introducing new construction onto the building site which is visually incompatible in terms of size, scale, design, materials, color and texture; which destroys historic relationships on the site; or which damages or destroys important landscape features is not recommended. (pg. 105) The new construction is visually compatible in terms of size, scale, design, materials, color and texture.
- D. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. The application is in compliance with the following goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan and the North End Plan.
1. The proposed use or design of the property should reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood and be compatible with it. (p. 17) The design and use of the new building reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood and is compatible with it.

2. The unique character of the neighborhood should be maintained, including architectural style, sitting on the lots, orientation of the units and landscaping characteristics. (p. 18) The style of the neighborhood will be maintained by this project.
  3. Protect historically and culturally significant resources that contribute to community identity and history. Goal, page 5-12 The property, a historic and culturally significant resource that contributes to community identity and history, will be protected.
- E. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the district. The project is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education or cultural aspects of the district because it complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts and the North End Plan.
- F. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the district and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. This application complies with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the request for any variances.
3. A contributing building, site, structure or object adds to the historic architectural qualities, historic associations, or archeological values for which a property is significant because (a) it was present during the period of significance, and possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time or is capable of yielding important information about the period, or (b) it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria. The property has retained its historic integrity and was constructed during the era of significance. It is contributing.

### **Site Specific Conditions of Approval**

1. Compliance with plans and specifications submitted to and on file in the Planning and Development Services Department dated received May 16, 2008.

### **Standard Conditions of Approval**

2. The applicant shall comply with the Boise City Fire Code.
3. Prior to a Building Permit and prior to any construction on the site, an Erosion and Sediment Control Permit must be obtained from the Building Division of the Planning and Development Services Department.

4. No change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall be valid unless in writing and signed by the applicant or his authorized representative and an authorized representative of the City of Boise. The burden shall be upon the applicant to obtain the written confirmation of any change and not upon the City of Boise.
5. Any change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall require the applicant to comply with all rules, regulations, ordinances, plans or other regulatory and legal restrictions in force at the time the applicant or successors in interest advise the City of intent to change the planned use of the property described herein unless a variance in said requirements or other legal relief is granted pursuant to the law in effect at the time the change in use is sought.
6. If the applicant does not act on the Certificate of Appropriateness through the commencement of construction, or extended pursuant to the Boise City Code, within eighteen months, it will become null and void without further notification from this department.
7. The applicant shall be required to obtain a Building Permit prior to the start of construction.

### **Construction Site Requirements**

8. The practices required below are intended to mitigate the impact and disturbance of residential property owners during the construction of adjacent buildings or structures. The following conditions apply to all construction-related activities ranging from grading and demolition activities to final occupancy on any land or parcel falling under the proprietary ownership of the permit applicant.
  - a) Prior to the issuance of a building permit and prior to the commencement of any construction on-site, an Erosion and Sediment Control (ESC) permit must be obtained from the Planning and Development Services Department. No grading, demolition or earth disturbing activities may start until an approved ESC permit and the associated site work or grading permits have been issued.
  - b) Measures shall be taken to manage construction debris and trash on the construction site and efforts shall also be made to provide reasonable controls to minimize fugitive dust on the construction site. Such measures shall include, but are not limited to:
    - Provide suitable containers for solid waste generated by construction activity;
    - Wet demolition of existing buildings;
    - Watering of driving surfaces and earth moving activities;
    - Installation of wind screening around property and each open floor above grade; and
    - Daily broom cleaning of above grade floors, adjacent streets and sidewalks.

- c) To reduce the noise impact of construction on nearby residential properties, all exterior construction activities shall be limited to the hours between 7:00 a.m. and 7:00 p.m. Monday through Friday and 8:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. for Saturday and Sunday. Low noise impact activities such as surveying, layout and weather protection may be performed at any time. After each floor of the structure or building is enclosed with exterior walls and windows, interior construction of the enclosed floors can be performed at any time.
- d) A minimum height of six foot (6') rigid security fencing, either wood or metal, shall be installed around the construction site within 30 days of the date when the first city permit is issued on projects where construction activity shall exceed 90 days.
- e) Exterior lighting and other illuminating equipment or materials shall be positioned, shielded, directed and located to not reflect or impact adjacent residential property and streets.
- f) Applicant shall comply with Boise City Fire Department requirements for water, access, and/or other requirements as determined by the Fire Marshal.
- g) Any conditions to be enforced during construction shall remain posted at each street abutting the construction site for the duration of the project. In addition to the posted conditions the permit holder shall also post an 11"x 17" laminated sign containing a project contact phone number, name of project contact and the Boise City contact number, 384-3845, to address issues as they arise. Failure to abide by any conditions set forth shall be grounds for revocation of Conditional Use Permit and/or Building Permits and may be subject the owner or owner's agents to fines and criminal citations.