



Planning & Development Services

Boise City Hall, 2nd Floor
150 N. Capitol Boulevard
P. O. Box 500
Boise, Idaho 83701-0500

Phone: 208/384-3830
Fax: 208/384-3753
TDD/TTY: 800/377-3529
Website: www.cityofboise.org/pds

6

Planning Division Staff Report

File Number	DRH08-00204
Applicant	Ben Everson and Dona Horan
Property Address	1020 East Jefferson
Public Hearing Date	July 14, 2008
Heard by	Historic Preservation Commission
Analyst	Julie Archambeault
Checked By	Sarah Schafer

Public Notification

Radius notices mailed to adjacent properties: **June 20, 2008**
Staff posted notice on site on: **June 23, 2008**

Table of Contents

1. Project Data and Facts	2
2. Land Use	2
3. Project Proposal	3
4. Ordinance / Standards	4
5. Analysis / Findings	4
6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions	5

1. Project Data and Facts

Applicant/Status	Ben Everson and Dona Horan / Owner
Architect/Representative	N/A
Location of Property	1020 East Jefferson
Size of Property	5,490 sq. ft.
Present Zoning and Land Use	R-2H
Historic District	East End
Date of Construction	1912
Style	Craftsman / Bungalow
Status	Contributing
Square Footage of Existing House	1,230 sq. ft.

Description of Applicant's Request

The applicant is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct an addition on the rear of the main dwelling, remove two trees and some large shrubs.

2. Land Use

Description and Character of Surrounding Area

The surrounding houses are approximately of the same size and era as the subject house. Large trees and shrubs are plentiful.

Site Characteristics

The site has a single family dwelling at the front of the lot and a small garage at the rear. Landscaping includes trees and large shrubs, some of which will be removed.

Special Considerations

None.

History of Previous Actions

1912-Construction of house

1960-Replace wooden steps with concrete and replace 21' of sidewalk

3. Project Proposal

Site Design

Land Use	Existing	Proposed
Percentage of the site devoted to building coverage:	21.5%	30.5%
Percentage of the site devoted to paving:	1%	1%
Percentage of the site devoted to landscaping:	77.5%	68.5%
TOTAL	100%	100%

Setbacks

Yard	Required	Proposed for Building	Proposed for Garage
Front (south)	15' (bldg.) 20' (garage)	No change	No change
Side (east)	5' (bldg.) 5' (garage)	11'	No change
Side (west)	5' (bldg.) 5' (garage)	11'	No change
Rear (north)	15' (bldg.) 0' (garage)	39'	No change

Fencing

None

Structure(s) Design

Number and Proposed Use of Buildings	Two buildings exist-a single family dwelling and a one story garage.
Maximum Building Height	18'-existing and proposed
Number of Stories	1-existing and proposed

4. Ordinance / Standards

Section	
11-04-04.01	General Standards
2-18-09	Historic Preservation Ordinance
4.1	Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts
	Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Structures

5. Analysis/Findings

Section 2-18-9 (A) (1) (c) Confirmation of Classification

As part of the application process for a Certificate of Appropriateness, the Planning Staff shall confirm the contributing or non-contributing classification of the property based on the criteria set forth in the definitions of Section 2-18-02.

- A. A property is contributing if
1. it was present during the period of significance, AND
 2. it possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time
 - i. Location
 - ii. Design
 - iii. Setting
 - iv. Materials
 - v. Workmanship
 - vi. Feeling-The property expresses of the aesthetic or historic sense of its time.
 - vii. Association-The property retains its direct link with
 3. it is capable of yielding important information about the period OR

The East End's era of significance runs from the first developments in 1890 through the end of the period of rapid growth in 1940. The subject building was constructed around 1912.

Although the porch was enclosed after 1956, the house retains the rest of its original design, its original materials, location, workmanship and its feeling and association. The setting has been compromised by the alteration of some of the surrounding buildings. Otherwise, the property retains its integrity and is contributing.

Discussion

The project is congruous. It will use forms and materials similar to those used on the existing house, it will not rise above the roof height of the current house and it is limited in size and scale to the existing house. The addition will be differentiated from the historic house through the foundation-the old foundation will look different than the new foundation, forming a clear line demarcating the old from the new.

6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions

Pursuant to Boise City Code 2-18-9 A and B of Boise Municipal Code, the request to construct an addition on the rear of the main dwelling, remove two trees and some large shrubs is congruous with the historical, architectural, archeological, educational or cultural aspects of the historic district because:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (1995 Edition), the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Districts, the North End Plan and the Boise City Comprehensive Plan are references often utilized by the Historic Preservation Commission to determine whether a change is congruous with the historic and architectural qualities of the historic district.

1. The Commission's decision in regard to Certificates of Appropriateness for alterations, as described in 2-18-09 (A), shall be based on six findings as applicable to that property. (2-18-11 01)
 - A. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not in a commercial district. This finding is not applicable.
 - B. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. This application complies with the following guidelines.
 - i. "Set back a new addition from the primary façade of the original building to maintain original proportion, massing, size, and scale." (4.1.2) The new addition is set 40' back from the primary façade.
 - ii. "Relate rooflines, the pitch, and orientation of the new addition to the primary building." (4.1.3) The roofline, including its pitch and orientation, will be directly related to that of the primary building.
 - iii. "Use similar materials as found on the original building." (4.1.6) The addition will use materials similar to those found on the original building including wood siding and trim and metal-clad wood or fiberglass windows.
 - iv. The Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts states that it is generally appropriate to "consider ground or basement additions before the addition of dormer(s). Under unique circumstances driven by site constraints, dormer(s) additions should be designed in proportional scale to the original roof and should not visually compete." (4.1.8) The addition is a ground and basement addition.
 - v. "Maintain proportional lot coverage as found on the neighboring properties of the same block; maximum lot coverage of all buildings should not exceed 30% of the total lot area. Minimum open space should

be 40% of the total lot area. Any exceptions to these percentages will be closely scrutinized.” (4.1.10) The lot coverage will be brought up to 30.5%. This is very close to the recommended 30% lot coverage.

- C. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction.) This application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. This application complies with the following guidelines.
- i. “Designing a new addition in a manner that makes clear what is historic and what is new. (pg. 112) Design for the new work may be contemporary or may reference design motifs from the historic building. In either case, it should always be clearly differentiated from the historic building and be compatible in terms of mass, materials, relationship of solids to voids, and color.” (pg. 113) The new addition will be compatible through the use of similar materials. However, it will be differentiated through the joining of the new foundation to the old.
 - ii. “Placing a new addition on a non-character-defining elevation and limiting the size and scale in relationship to the historic building.” (pg. 113) The addition will be placed on the rear elevation and will be limited in height and width in relationship to the historic building.
 - iii. “Designing new exterior additions to historic buildings or adjacent new construction which is compatible with the historic character of the site and which preserves the historic relationship between the building or buildings and the landscape.” (pg.105) The addition is compatible with the historic character of the site through the use of similar materials and forms.
- D. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. The application is in compliance with the following goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan and the East End Plan.
- i. Maintain the character of the East End by recognizing its unique amenities and natural features, encouraging appropriate infill development, and allowing development in adjacent areas that does not negatively impact the existing neighborhood. Pg 2-1 The addition maintains the character of the East End by maintaining the historic integrity of the original house.
 - ii. Protect historically and culturally significant resources that contribute to community identity and history. Goal, page 5-12 The addition protects the contributing house through its congruous design and materials.
- E. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the district. The project is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education or cultural aspects of the district because it complies with the

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts and the East End Plan.

- F. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the district and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. This application complies with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the request for any variances.
2. A contributing building, site, structure or object adds to the historic architectural qualities, historic associations, or archeological values for which a property is significant because (a) it was present during the period of significance, and possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time or is capable of yielding important information about the period, or (b) it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria. The structure was constructed during the era of significance and retains its historic integrity. It is contributing.

Site Specific Conditions of Approval

1. Compliance with plans and specifications submitted to and on file in the Planning and Development Services Department dated received June 11, 2008.

Standard Conditions of Approval

2. The applicant shall comply with the Boise City Fire Code.
3. Prior to a Building Permit and prior to any construction on the site, an Erosion and Sediment Control Permit must be obtained from the Building Division of the Planning and Development Services Department.
4. No change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall be valid unless in writing and signed by the applicant or his authorized representative and an authorized representative of the City of Boise. The burden shall be upon the applicant to obtain the written confirmation of any change and not upon the City of Boise.
5. Any change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall require the applicant to comply with all rules, regulations, ordinances, plans or other regulatory and legal restrictions in force at the time the applicant or successors in interest advise the City of intent to change the planned use of the property described herein unless a variance in said requirements or other legal relief is granted pursuant to the law in effect at the time the change in use is sought.

6. If the applicant does not act on the Certificate of Appropriateness through the commencement of construction, or extended pursuant to the Boise City Code, within eighteen months, it will become null and void without further notification from this department.
7. The applicant shall be required to obtain a Building Permit prior to the start of construction.

Construction Site Requirements

8. The practices required below are intended to mitigate the impact and disturbance of residential property owners during the construction of adjacent buildings or structures. The following conditions apply to all construction-related activities ranging from grading and demolition activities to final occupancy on any land or parcel falling under the proprietary ownership of the permit applicant.
 - a) Prior to the issuance of a building permit and prior to the commencement of any construction on-site, an Erosion and Sediment Control (ESC) permit must be obtained from the Planning and Development Services Department. No grading, demolition or earth disturbing activities may start until an approved ESC permit and the associated site work or grading permits have been issued.
 - b) Measures shall be taken to manage construction debris and trash on the construction site and efforts shall also be made to provide reasonable controls to minimize fugitive dust on the construction site. Such measures shall include, but are not limited to:
 - Provide suitable containers for solid waste generated by construction activity;
 - Wet demolition of existing buildings;
 - Watering of driving surfaces and earth moving activities;
 - Installation of wind screening around property and each open floor above grade; and
 - Daily broom cleaning of above grade floors, adjacent streets and sidewalks.
 - c) To reduce the noise impact of construction on nearby residential properties, all exterior construction activities shall be limited to the hours between 7:00 a.m. and 7:00 p.m. Monday through Friday and 8:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. for Saturday and Sunday. Low noise impact activities such as surveying, layout and weather protection may be performed at any time. After each floor of the structure or building is enclosed with exterior walls and windows, interior construction of the enclosed floors can be performed at any time.
 - d) A minimum height of six foot (6') rigid security fencing, either wood or metal, shall be installed around the construction site within 30 days of the date when the first city permit is issued on projects where construction activity shall exceed 90 days.

- e) Exterior lighting and other illuminating equipment or materials shall be positioned, shielded, directed and located to not reflect or impact adjacent residential property and streets.
- f) Applicant shall comply with Boise City Fire Department requirements for water, access, and/or other requirements as determined by the Fire Marshal.
- g) Any conditions to be enforced during construction shall remain posted at each street abutting the construction site for the duration of the project. In addition to the posted conditions the permit holder shall also post an 11"x 17" laminated sign containing a project contact phone number, name of project contact and the Boise City contact number, 384-3845, to address issues as they arise. Failure to abide by any conditions set forth shall be grounds for revocation of Conditional Use Permit and/or Building Permits and may be subject the owner or owner's agents to fines and criminal citations.