



Planning & Development Services

Boise City Hall, 2nd Floor
150 N. Capitol Boulevard
P. O. Box 500
Boise, Idaho 83701-0500

Phone: 208/384-3830
Fax: 208/384-3753
TDD/TTY: 800/377-3529
Website: www.cityofboise.org/pds

2

Summary/Reason Statement for DRH08-00195

Staff's Recommendation

Approval of reopening the porch and changing the railing.

Denial of changing the roof or raising the chimney.

Summary

JANA REPULSKI requests Historic Preservation approval to reopen the front porch, replace the existing roof structure, change the dutch hip in the rear to a gable, extend the chimney and replace the rear stair railing on property located at 1411 N. 19th Street in R-1CH (Single Family Residential with Historic Overlay) zone.

1. In order for the Commission to approve a demolition or relocation request at least three out of the five Findings must be met. (2-18-9C) Three of the five Findings have been met. The house cannot meet landmark status, the roof's demolition will not adversely affect the District or the adjacent properties, and the submitted plans will have a positive effect on the District and the adjacent properties.
2. The Commission's decision in regard to Certificates of Appropriateness for alterations, as described in 2-18-09 (A), shall be based on six findings as applicable to that property. (2-18-11 01)
 - A. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not in a commercial district.
 - B. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. The new roof does not comply with the following guidelines.
 - a. "Set back a new addition from the primary façade of the original building to maintain original proportion, massing, size, and scale." (4.1.2) The addition will not be set back from the primary façade of the original building.

- b. "Consider ground or basement additions before the addition of dormer(s). Under unique circumstances driven by site constraints, dormer(s) additions should be designed in proportional scale to the original roof and should not visually compete." (4.1.8) The addition is a roof addition, replacing the original roof.
- c. "Overpower, cover, obscure, or eliminate historically significant architectural, stylistic, or character defining features such as windows, doors, porches, roof lines." (4.1.12) The new roof will eliminate the historically significant stylistic relationship between the building and the roofline.
- d. "Remove an entire second floor roof or attic and replace it with a structure that is out of character with the original building." (4.1.13) The proposal will remove the roof and replace it with a structure that is out of character with the original building.

The changes to the porch and railing comply with the following guidelines.

- a. "Use similar materials as found on the original building." (4.1.6) The railing and the porch will use materials similar to those found on the building including metal railing and wood posts.
 - b. "Design a new addition to preserve the established massing and orientation of the building and character of the block." (4.1.1) The porch will preserve the established massing and orientation of the building and character of the block.
- C. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction.) This application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. The changes to the roof do not comply with the guidelines.
- a. "Designing a new addition in a manner that makes clear what is historic and what is new. (pg. 112) Design for the new work may be contemporary or may reference design motifs from the historic building. In either case, it should always be clearly differentiated from the historic building and be compatible in terms of mass, materials, relationship of solids to voids, and color." (pg. 113) The new roof will not be clearly differentiated from the historic building.
 - b. "The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided." (pg. 62) The proposal will alter the roof and its relationship with the building, a feature that characterizes the property.

- c. "Identifying, retaining and preserving roofs-and their functional and decorative features-that is important in defining the overall historic character of the building. (pg. 78) The proposal will change the roof and its relationship to the building. This relationship is important in defining the overall historic character of the building.
- d. "Removing or radically changing buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished. (pg. 102) The proposal will radically change the roof and the way it relates to the building, which is a feature that is important in defining the overall historic character of the property, diminishing the character of the site.

The changes to the porch do comply with the guidelines.

- a. "Repairing entrances and porches by reinforcing the historic materials. Repair will also generally include the limited replacement in kind-or with a compatible substitute material-of those extensively deteriorated or missing parts of repeated features where there are surviving prototypes such as balustrades, cornices, entablatures, columns, sidelights, and stairs." (pg. 85) Reopening the porch will return historic integrity to the house.
- D. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. The application is not in compliance with the following goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan and the North End Plan.
- a. The proposed use or design of the property should reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood and be compatible with it. (p. 17) The new design of the house does not reflect the style of the house or the character of the adjacent neighborhood.
 - b. Protect historically and culturally significant resources that contribute to community identity and history. Goal, page 5-12 The new roof's height is out of character with the house and does not protect this historically and culturally significant resource that contributes to community identity and history.

Reopening the porch is in compliance with the following goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan and the North End Plan.

- a. The proposed use or design of the property should reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood and be compatible with it. (p. 17) The design of the porch is historic and will reflect the style of the house and the character of the adjacent neighborhood.

- b. Protect historically and culturally significant resources that contribute to community identity and history. Goal, page 5-12 The porch will be in character with the house and will protect this historically and culturally significant resource that contributes to community identity and history.
 - E. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the district. Except for the changes to the roof, the project is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education or cultural aspects of the district because it complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts and the North End Plan.
 - F. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the district and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. This application complies with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the request for any variances.
3. A contributing building, site, structure or object adds to the historic architectural qualities, historic associations, or archeological values for which a property is significant because (a) it was present during the period of significance, and possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time or is capable of yielding important information about the period, or (b) it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria. The property has retained its historic integrity and was constructed during the era of significance. It is contributing.