



## Planning & Development Services

Boise City Hall, 2nd Floor  
150 N. Capitol Boulevard  
P. O. Box 500  
Boise, Idaho 83701-0500

Phone: 208/384-3830  
Fax: 208/384-3753  
TDD/TTY: 800/377-3529  
Website: [www.cityofboise.org/pds](http://www.cityofboise.org/pds)

9

# Summary/Reason Statement for DRH08-00230

## Staff's Recommendation

Approval of the rear addition, basement, detached garage and the addition of the chimney.

Denial of the changes to the front door, front porch, garage, removal of the tree and additions to the front façade.

## Summary

**PAT BRONKEN** requests Historic Preservation approval to remodel the structure including but not limited to converting the garage to living space, relocating the front door, add on to the front and rear of the main dwelling, construct a chimney, construct a basement, construct a single-story, single-car garage and remove a tree on property located at 1601 N. 21<sup>st</sup> Street in an R-1CH (Single Family Residential with Historic Overlay) zone.

1. The Commission's decision in regard to Certificates of Appropriateness for alterations, as described in 2-18-09 (A), shall be based on six findings as applicable to that property. (2-18-11 01)
2. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not in a commercial district. This finding is not applicable.
3. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts.

The changes to the front facade do not comply with the Boise City Guidelines.

- a. "Set back a new addition from the primary façade of the original building to maintain original proportion, massing, size, and scale." (4.1.2) The front additions are not set back from the primary façade of the house and change the original massing, proportion, size and scale.
- b. "Construct a new addition that creates an appearance inconsistent with the historic character of the building." (4.1.11) The new additions eliminate the garage, relocate the front door and enlarge the porch and small gable, creating an appearance inconsistent with the historic character of the building.

- c. It is generally not appropriate to “overpower, cover, obscure, or eliminate historically significant architectural, stylistic, or character defining features such as windows, doors, porches, roof lines.” (4.1.12) The alterations eliminate the historically significant architectural, stylistic and character defining features such as the original porch, the existing small gable and the garage.

The addition of the chimney, the detached garage, the rear feature and the basement comply with the Boise City Guidelines.

- a. “Design a new addition to preserve the established massing and orientation of the building and character of the block.” (4.1.1) The chimney, basement, detached garage and rear addition preserve the established massing and orientation of the building and the character of the block.
  - b. “Use similar materials as found on the original building.” (4.1.6) The chimney, the rear addition will use materials similar to those found on the original building including brick, stucco and wood trim.
  - c. “Consider ground or basement additions before the addition of dormer(s). Under unique circumstances driven by site constraints, dormer(s) additions should be designed in proportional scale to the original roof and should not visually compete.” (4.1.8) The rear addition and the basement are a ground and a basement addition.
  - d. “Maintain a proportional mass, size, and height to ensure the accessory building or dwelling unit is not taller than the primary building on the lot or does not occupy the entire backyard.” (6.1.2) The garage will be shorter than the house and will not occupy the entire backyard.
  - e. “Subordinate the accessory dwelling unit, accessory building, or garage to the primary residential building on the site by placing the structure to the rear of the lot. Otherwise, consider locating the accessory building, dwelling unit, or garage to the side as long as it is set back substantially.” (6.1.3) The garage will be placed at the rear of the lot.
  - f. “Use similar materials used on the primary existing building.” (6.1.5) The garage will use materials similar to those found on the original building including stucco and wood trim.
  - g. “Design garages so they are alley loaded.” (6.1.7) The garage will be alley loaded.
4. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction.)

The changes to the front façade are not consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. This application complies with the following guidelines.

- a. "Placing a new addition on a non-character-defining elevation and limiting the size and scale in relationship to the historic building." (pg. 113) The front additions will be placed on a character defining elevation-the primary elevation.
- b. "Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved." (pg. 62) The distinctive features of the garage and the small side oriented front entry will not be preserved. They will be eliminated.
- c. "New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment." (pg. 62) The new work will not be differentiated from the old. There will be no way to tell where the old house stops and the new additions begin.
- d. "Attaching a new addition so that character-defining features of the historic building are obscured, damaged, or destroyed. Designing and constructing new additions that result in the diminution or loss of the historic character of the resource, including its design, materials, workmanship, location, or setting." (pg. 113) The character defining features of the garage, the side oriented front entrance and the small gable will be obscured or lost.
- e. "Removing or radically changing entrances and porches which are important in defining the overall historic character of the building so that, as a result, the character is diminished. (pg. 85) The entrance and the porch, both of which are unique and important in defining the overall historic character of the building, will be radically changed so that the character of the whole is diminished.

The addition of the chimney, the detached garage, the rear feature and the basement are consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.

- a. "Designing a new addition in a manner that makes clear what is historic and what is new. Design for the new work may be contemporary or may reference design motifs from the historic building. In either case, it should always be clearly differentiated from the historic building and be compatible in terms of mass, materials, relationship of solids to voids, and

color.” (pg. 113) The rear addition makes clear what is historic and what is new through the use of broken wall planes and roof planes.

- b. “Placing a new addition on a non-character-defining elevation and limiting the size and scale in relationship to the historic building.” (pg. 113) The rear addition will be placed on the rear elevation and will be shorter and narrower than the historic building.
5. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein.

The changes to the front façade are not in compliance with the following goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan and the North End Plan.

- a. The unique character of the neighborhood should be maintained, including architectural style, sitting on the lots, orientation of the units and landscaping characteristics. (p. 18) The front changes will not maintain the unique character of the neighborhood. The historic façade is part of this unique character-such radical alterations will alter the character of the neighborhood.
- b. Protect historically and culturally significant resources that contribute to community identity and history. Goal, page 5-12 The changes to the front will not protect this historically and culturally significant resource that contributes to community identity and history.

The addition of the chimney, the detached garage, the rear feature and the basement are in compliance with the following goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan and the North End Plan.

- a. The unique character of the neighborhood should be maintained, including architectural style, sitting on the lots, orientation of the units and landscaping characteristics. (p. 18) The changes to the chimney, the detached garage, the rear addition and the basement will have no effect to the unique character of the neighborhood because they will be minimally visible.
- b. Protect historically and culturally significant resources that contribute to community identity and history. Goal, page 5-12 The changes to the chimney, the detached garage, the rear addition and the basement will protect this significant resource through their sympathetic design and adherence to the Boise City Guidelines and Secretary of the Interior’s Standards.

6. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the district. The changes to the front façade are not congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education or cultural aspects of the district because they do not comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts and the North End Plan. However, the other actions are congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education or cultural aspects of the district because they comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts and the North End Plan.
7. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the district and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. **This application does not comply with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the request for any variances.**

The substandard lot ordinance states that the interior side setbacks shall be in accordance with the applicable zone; street side yard setbacks shall be 15 feet for livable space and porches and 20 feet for parking. The setbacks for a standard sized lot in this zone are 20' for the street side and 5' for the interior side. The proposed setbacks for this project are 9' 4" for the street side and 3'6" for the interior side. Both side setbacks will require a variance whether or not this finding of the substandard zoning ordinance is waived.

8. A contributing building, site, structure or object adds to the historic architectural qualities, historic associations, or archeological values for which a property is significant because (a) it was present during the period of significance, and possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time or is capable of yielding important information about the period, or (b) it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria. The structure was constructed during the period of significance and retains its historic integrity.