



Planning & Development Services

Boise City Hall, 2nd Floor
150 N. Capitol Boulevard
P. O. Box 500
Boise, Idaho 83701-0500

Phone: 208/384-3830
Fax: 208/384-3753
TDD/TTY: 800/377-3529
Website: www.cityofboise.org/pds

2

Summary/Reason Statement for DRH08-00229

Staff's Recommendation

Denial

Summary

PAT SHALZ requests Historic Preservation approval to demolish the garage and construct a new two-story, two-car garage with the second floor as a studio on property located at 1004 N. 10th Street in an R-1CH (Single Family Residential with Historic Overlay) zone.

1. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not in a commercial district. This finding is not applicable.
2. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. This application does not comply with the following guidelines.

"It is generally not appropriate to add an accessory dwelling unit to a site which does not maintain or blend with the heights of buildings on adjacent sites." (6.1.11) The other garages on the alley line are smaller than the proposed garage.
3. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction.) This application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. This application complies with the following guidelines.

"Designing required new parking so that it is as unobtrusive as possible, thus minimizing the effect on the historic character of the setting. (pg. 108) The new garage will crowd the narrow alley, and will not be unobtrusive.
4. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans

referenced therein. The application is not in compliance with the following goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan and the North End Plan.

A. The proposed use or design of the property should reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood and be compatible with it. (p. 17) The design of the project will not reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood through the placement of a large structure on the alley line.

B. The unique character of the neighborhood should be maintained, including architectural style, sitting on the lots, orientation of the units and landscaping characteristics. (p. 18) The unique character of the neighborhood will not be maintained because of the placement of the large structure on the alley line.

5. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the district. The project is not congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education or cultural aspects of the district because it does not meet the demolition criteria and does not comply with the zoning code in a way that is not appropriate to the Historic District.

6. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the district and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. **This application does not comply with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the request for any variances.**

2. A contributing building, site, structure or object adds to the historic architectural qualities, historic associations, or archeological values for which a property is significant because (a) it was present during the period of significance, and possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time or is capable of yielding important information about the period, or (b) it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria. The site is listed on the National Register of Historic Places.