



## Planning & Development Services

Boise City Hall, 2nd Floor  
150 N. Capitol Boulevard  
P. O. Box 500  
Boise, Idaho 83701-0500

Phone: 208/384-3830  
Fax: 208/384-3753  
TDD/TTY: 800/377-3529  
Website: [www.cityofboise.org/pds](http://www.cityofboise.org/pds)

# 1

## Planning Division Staff Report

<b>File Number</b>	DRH08-00241
<b>Applicant</b>	Bart and Tracy Cochran
<b>Property Address</b>	1310 North 13 <sup>th</sup> Street
<b>Public Hearing Date</b>	August 11, 2008
<b>Heard by</b>	Historic Preservation Commission
<b>Analyst</b>	Julie Archambeault
<b>Checked By</b>	Sarah Schafer

---

### Public Notification

Radius notices mailed to adjacent properties: **July 25, 2008**  
Staff posted notice on site on: **July 31, 2008**

---

### Table of Contents

1. Project Data and Facts	2
2. Land Use	2
3. Project Proposal	3
4. Ordinance / Standards	4
5. Analysis / Findings	4
6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions	5

## 1. Project Data and Facts

<b>Applicant/Status</b>	Bart and Tracy Cochran / Owners
<b>Architect/Representative</b>	N/A
<b>Location of Property</b>	1310 North 13 <sup>th</sup> Street
<b>Size of Property</b>	5,650 sq. ft.
<b>Present Zoning and Land Use</b>	R-1CH (Single Family Residential)
<b>Historic District</b>	North End
<b>Date of Construction</b>	Ca. 1900
<b>Style</b>	Vernacular w/ Queen Anne
<b>Status</b>	Non-contributing
<b>Square Footage of Existing House</b>	1,700 sq. ft.

### Description of Applicant's Request

The applicant is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness to remodel the main dwelling, including but not limited to the replacement of windows, reconfiguration of the front porch, and the removal of the aluminum siding and restoration of the original siding.

## 2. Land Use

### Description and Character of Surrounding Area

The surrounding block is a mix of sizes and styles. There are single story houses, single family houses, duplexes and 1 ½ story houses. They are all historic and most of them have retained their integrity. There are large trees as well as younger trees, shrubs and grass.

### Site Characteristics

The subject property has a single family dwelling with a modernized porch. Landscaping is fairly young and consists of bushes along the front path and the property lines. Two young trees sit in front of the house.

### Special Considerations

None

### History of Previous Actions

Ca. 1900-Construction of house  
1949-Repair fire damage  
1955-Remove wood floor on front porch and replace with concrete  
1959-Erect block retaining walls in the basement  
1959-Remodel back porch into kitchen, close one door, remodel for one bath

### 3. Project Proposal

#### Site Design

Land Use	Existing	Proposed
Percentage of the site devoted to building coverage:	30%	No change
Percentage of the site devoted to paving:	6%	No change
Percentage of the site devoted to landscaping:	64%	No change
TOTAL	100%	No change

#### Setbacks

Yard	Required	Proposed for Building	Proposed for Garage
Front (southwest)	15' (bldg.) 20' (garage)	19'	No change
Side (southeast)	15' (bldg.) 15' (garage)	10'	No change
Side (northwest)	5' (bldg.) 5' (garage)	22'	No change
Rear (northeast)	15' (bldg.) 9' (garage)	No change	No change

#### Fencing

None

#### Structure(s) Design

Number and Proposed Use of Buildings	Two buildings exist-a garage and a single-family dwelling
Maximum Building Height	23'
Number of Stories	1 ½

## 4. Ordinance / Standards

Section	
11-04-04.01	General Standards
2-18-09	Historic Preservation Ordinance
4.1	Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts
	Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Structures

## 5. Analysis/Findings

### Section 2-18-9 (A) (1) (c) Confirmation of Classification

*As part of the application process for a Certificate of Appropriateness, the Planning Staff shall confirm the contributing or non-contributing classification of the property based on the criteria set forth in the definitions of Section 2-18-02.*

- A. A property is contributing if
  - 1. it was present during the period of significance, AND
  - 2. it possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time
    - i. Location
    - ii. Design
    - iii. Setting
    - iv. Materials
    - v. Workmanship
    - vi. Feeling-The property expresses of the aesthetic or historic sense of its time.
    - vii. Association-The property retains its direct link with
  - 3. it is capable of yielding important information about the period OR
  - 4. it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria
- B. A property is noncontributing if
  - 1. it was not present during the period of significance,
  - 2. due to alterations, disturbances, additions, or other changes, it no longer possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time OR
  - 3. it is incapable of yielding important information about the period OR
  - 4. it does not individually meet the National Register eligibility criteria

Although the building was constructed in the era of significance, it has lost its historic integrity. Most of its materials have changed including those of its windows, siding and porch. Its window sizes and locations have changed and its porch has been radically altered. It is not contributing.

### **Discussion**

The project proposes to return the porch to a condition very similar to its original configuration as shown in the historic photos. Although the porch will have panels instead of railing and two double hung windows instead of one on either side of the door, it is very close to the original configuration of the porch and the new design is congruous with the adjacent properties and the district. Pairs of double/single windows are common throughout the district. The proposed door matches the historic door, as do the proposed pillars.

Removing the aluminum siding and trim and replacing with wood lap siding and wood trim will also be congruous. These are materials that are original to the home and common throughout the district.

The other notes on the project found on the site plan including changes to the finish of the garage and the landscaping are not included in this project. Staff received no specific information on these items, and they were not advertised.

## **6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions**

**Pursuant to Boise City Code 2-18-9 A and B of Boise Municipal Code, the request to remodel the main dwelling, including but not limited to the replacement of windows, reconfiguration of the front porch, and the removal of the aluminum siding and restoration of the original siding is congruous with the historical, architectural, archeological, educational or cultural aspects of the historic district because:**

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (1995 Edition), the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Districts, the North End Plan and the Boise City Comprehensive Plan are references often utilized by the Historic Preservation Commission to determine whether a change is congruous with the historic and architectural qualities of the historic district.

1. The Commission's decision in regard to Certificates of Appropriateness for alterations, as described in 2-18-09 (A), shall be based on six findings as applicable to that property. (2-18-11 01)
  - a. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not in a commercial district. This finding is not applicable.
  - b. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. This application complies with the following guidelines.
    - i. "Use similar materials as found on the original building." (4.1.6) The changes to the house will use materials including wood siding, wood porch rails and pillars and wood windows, which are materials found on the original building.

- ii. “Maintain proportional lot coverage as found on the neighboring properties of the same block; maximum lot coverage of all buildings should not exceed 30% of the total lot area. Minimum open space should be 40% of the total lot area. Any exceptions to these percentages will be closely scrutinized.” (4.1.10) The project will not change the lot coverage.
- c. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction.) This application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. This application complies with the following guidelines.
  - i. “Removing a historic building, building feature or landscape feature that is important in defining the historic character of the setting.” (pg.108) Neither the existing windows nor the existing porch pillars nor the existing siding are features that are important in defining the historic character of the setting.
  - ii. “Repairing entrances and porches by reinforcing the historic materials. Repair will also generally include the limited replacement in kind-or with a compatible substitute material-of those extensively deteriorated or missing parts of repeated features where there are surviving prototypes such as balustrades, cornices, entablatures, columns, sidelights, and stairs.” (pg. 85)
  - iii. “Creating a false historical appearance because the replaced entrance or porch is based on insufficient historical, pictorial and physical documentation. (pg. 87) The porch is based on historic pictures of the house and porch in their original condition.
  - iv. “Removing or radically changing windows which are important in defining the historic character of the building so that, as a result, the character is diminished. (pg. 81) The existing windows are not important in defining the historic character of the building.
- d. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. The application is in compliance with the following goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan and the North End Plan.
  - i. The proposed use or design of the property should reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood and be compatible with it. (p. 17) The design of the property will reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood through the use of historic materials and features.
  - ii. The unique character of the neighborhood should be maintained, including architectural style, sitting on the lots, orientation of the units and landscaping characteristics. (p. 18) The unique character of the neighborhood will be maintained through the enhancement of the historic architectural style of the house.

- e. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the district. The project is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education or cultural aspects of the district because it complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts and the North End Plan.
  - f. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the district and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. This application complies with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the request for any variances.
2. A contributing building, site, structure or object adds to the historic architectural qualities, historic associations, or archeological values for which a property is significant because (a) it was present during the period of significance, and possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time or is capable of yielding important information about the period, or (b) it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria. The building has lost its historic integrity through alterations. It is not currently contributing.

### **Site Specific Conditions of Approval**

1. Compliance with plans and specifications submitted to and on file in the Planning and Development Services Department dated received July 8, 2008.

### **Standard Conditions of Approval**

2. The applicant shall comply with the Boise City Fire Code.
3. Prior to a Building Permit and prior to any construction on the site, an Erosion and Sediment Control Permit must be obtained from the Building Division of the Planning and Development Services Department.
4. No change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall be valid unless in writing and signed by the applicant or his authorized representative and an authorized representative of the City of Boise. The burden shall be upon the applicant to obtain the written confirmation of any change and not upon the City of Boise.
5. Any change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall require the applicant to comply with all rules, regulations, ordinances, plans or other regulatory and legal restrictions

in force at the time the applicant or successors in interest advise the City of intent to change the planned use of the property described herein unless a variance in said requirements or other legal relief is granted pursuant to the law in effect at the time the change in use is sought.

6. If the applicant does not act on the Certificate of Appropriateness through the commencement of construction, or extended pursuant to the Boise City Code, within eighteen months, it will become null and void without further notification from this department.
7. The applicant shall be required to obtain a Building Permit prior to the start of construction.

### **Construction Site Requirements**

8. The practices required below are intended to mitigate the impact and disturbance of residential property owners during the construction of adjacent buildings or structures. The following conditions apply to all construction-related activities ranging from grading and demolition activities to final occupancy on any land or parcel falling under the proprietary ownership of the permit applicant.
  - a) Prior to the issuance of a building permit and prior to the commencement of any construction on-site, an Erosion and Sediment Control (ESC) permit must be obtained from the Planning and Development Services Department. No grading, demolition or earth disturbing activities may start until an approved ESC permit and the associated site work or grading permits have been issued.
  - b) Measures shall be taken to manage construction debris and trash on the construction site and efforts shall also be made to provide reasonable controls to minimize fugitive dust on the construction site. Such measures shall include, but are not limited to:
    - Provide suitable containers for solid waste generated by construction activity;
    - Wet demolition of existing buildings;
    - Watering of driving surfaces and earth moving activities;
    - Installation of wind screening around property and each open floor above grade; and
    - Daily broom cleaning of above grade floors, adjacent streets and sidewalks.
  - c) To reduce the noise impact of construction on nearby residential properties, all exterior construction activities shall be limited to the hours between 7:00 a.m. and 7:00 p.m. Monday through Friday and 8:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. for Saturday and Sunday. Low noise impact activities such as surveying, layout and weather protection may be performed at any time. After each floor of the structure or building is enclosed with exterior walls and windows, interior construction of the enclosed floors can be performed at any time.



- d) A minimum height of six foot (6') rigid security fencing, either wood or metal, shall be installed around the construction site within 30 days of the date when the first city permit is issued on projects where construction activity shall exceed 90 days.
- e) Exterior lighting and other illuminating equipment or materials shall be positioned, shielded, directed and located to not reflect or impact adjacent residential property and streets.
- f) Applicant shall comply with Boise City Fire Department requirements for water, access, and/or other requirements as determined by the Fire Marshal.
- g) Any conditions to be enforced during construction shall remain posted at each street abutting the construction site for the duration of the project. In addition to the posted conditions the permit holder shall also post an 11"x 17" laminated sign containing a project contact phone number, name of project contact and the Boise City contact number, 384-3845, to address issues as they arise. Failure to abide by any conditions set forth shall be grounds for revocation of Conditional Use Permit and/or Building Permits and may be subject the owner or owner's agents to fines and criminal citations.