

DRH08-00231
Matt Hanrahan
1815 N. 10th Street

Reason Statement (Denial)

1. In order for the Commission to approve a demolition or relocation request at least three out of the five Findings must be met. (2-18-9C) Two of the five Findings have been met. The building is not contributing, and it cannot meet landmark status.
2. The Commission's decision in regard to Certificates of Appropriateness for alterations, as described in 2-18-09 (A), shall be based on six Findings as applicable to that property. (2-18-11 01)
 - A. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not in a commercial district. This Finding is not applicable
 - B. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. This application complies with the following guidelines.
 - a. Use exterior wall materials that are commonly present in the district. (5.6.1.) The metal panels proposed for the building are not commonly present in the District.
 - b. Ensure that the predominant texture of the new building is consistent with the texture of historic materials in the District. (5.6.2.) One of the predominant textures, the metal panels, are not consistent with the texture of historic materials in the District.
 - c. It is generally not appropriate to use prefabricated or metal buildings. (5.6.5.) Metal panels are proposed for the building.
 - d. Use double or single-hung sash windows. Provide windows of overall proportions similar those used on buildings on surrounding sites within the block. (5.7.1.) Most of the windows on adjacent buildings are 1/1 sash windows. There are a variety of windows proposed for the new building, many of which do not have the overall proportions of those on adjacent buildings.
 - e. Use a ratio of wall-to-window or solid-to-void that is similar to that found on other historic buildings within the block and found throughout the district. Provide a pattern of windows and doors on a new building façade, which recalls similar patterns on facades of other buildings in that given district. (5.7.2.) The ratio of wall-to-window found on the proposed building is not similar to those on historic buildings found within the block and throughout the District.
 - f. It is generally not appropriate to erect a new building, which does not maintain the proportions or patterns of windows similar to those in the District. (5.7.8.) The new building does not maintain the proportions or patterns of windows similar to those in the District. They are not as regular or symmetrical as other buildings in the District.

- g. It is generally not appropriate to provide windows of overall proportions that are greatly different from windows on buildings on adjacent sites. (5.7.9.) The proposed building has windows of overall proportions that are horizontal and small-greatly different from the vertical single or double hung windows found on buildings on adjacent sites.
- h. It is generally not appropriate to use window and door types incongruous with the character of the district. (5.7.10.) The window types proposed for the new building are incongruous with the character of the District.
- i. It is generally not appropriate to use multiple window styles throughout a new building. (5.7.12.) There are several window styles throughout the proposed new building.
- j. Add a new building with a roof that relates to the overall size, shape, slope, color, and texture of roofs on adjacent sites or in other areas of the District. Special consideration should be given to front-facing facades. (5.8.1.) The roof of the new building has a very low slope that does not relate to the slope of the roofs on adjacent sites or in other areas of the District.
- k. Maintain roof forms similar to those seen traditionally on the block within pitches of 6:12 or greater. Use shed roofs for some porch additions. (5.8.4.) The pitch of the new roof would be less than 6:12. From the ground, it will look like a flat roof.
- l. It is generally not appropriate to use a roof of a size, shape, or slope not typically seen in the district. (5.8.7.) The low sloping roofline is not a slope typically seen in the district.

C. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction.) This application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. This application complies with the following guidelines.

- a. "Designing new exterior additions to historic buildings or adjacent new construction which is compatible with the historic character of the site and which preserves the historic relationship between the building or buildings and the landscape. (pg.105) The new construction is not compatible with the historic character of the site-it uses a modern design with features that are incongruous with the District like a flat roof, and a variety of window forms.
- b. "Introducing new construction into historic districts that is visually incompatible or that destroys historic relationships within the setting. (pg.108) The new construction is visually incompatible. Its low sloping roof, use of metal panels and various window forms are incongruous with the District.

D. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. The application is in compliance with the following goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan and the North End Plan.

- a. The proposed use or design of the property should reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood and be compatible with it. (p. 17) The proposed use of the property does not reflect the character of the neighborhood and is not compatible with it.
 - b. The unique character of the neighborhood should be maintained, including architectural style, sitting on the lots, orientation of the units and landscaping characteristics. (p. 18) This project will not maintain the unique character of this neighborhood. Its design includes features that are incongruous with the District.
 - c. Protect, enhance and preserve Boise's designated historic Landmarks, properties and districts. Goal 2, page 5-16 This project will not protect, enhance and preserve the North End District. It will place an incongruous structure on a very visible and unique lot.
- E. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the district. The project is not congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education or cultural aspects of the district because it does not comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts and the North End Plan.
- F. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the district and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. This application complies with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the request for any variances.
3. A contributing building, site, structure or object adds to the historic architectural qualities, historic associations, or archeological values for which a property is significant because (a) it was present during the period of significance, and possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time or is capable of yielding important information about the period, or (b) it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria. The building has lost its historic integrity through alteration. It is non-contributing.
4. The Commission's decision in regard to Certificates of Appropriateness for a change in zoning classification or a change in use as described in 2-18-09 (C) above shall be based on the following Findings:
 - A. BCC Section 2-18-11.03(1) states that the request shall support the Boise City Comprehensive Plan goals, objectives and policies contained within Chapter 5/Parks, Recreation and Cultural Resources, and the applicable neighborhood plans.

- a. The proposed use or design of the property should reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood and be compatible with it. (p. 17) The request reflects the character of the adjacent neighborhood by continuing to keep one building on this large lot.
 - b. The unique character of the neighborhood should be maintained, including architectural style, sitting on the lots, orientation of the units and landscaping characteristics. (p. 18) This request will maintain the unique character of this neighborhood by ensuring that the large lot, a unique feature of the neighborhood and the District, is kept whole.
 - c. Protect, enhance and preserve Boise's designated historic Landmarks, properties and districts. Goal 2, page 5-16 This project will protect, enhance and preserve the North End District by continuing the unique nature of this large lot and this neighborhood.
- B. BCC Section 2-18-11.03(2) states that the request will be congruous with the historical, architectural, archeological, educational or cultural significance of the District. The project is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education or cultural aspects of the District because it complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts and the North End Plan.