



Planning & Development Services

Boise City Hall, 2nd Floor
150 N. Capitol Boulevard
P. O. Box 500
Boise, Idaho 83701-0500

Phone: 208/384-3830
Fax: 208/384-3753
TDD/TTY: 800/377-3529
Website: www.cityofboise.org/pds

3

Planning Division Staff Report

File Number	DRH08-00260
Applicant	Harold and Sarah Wright
Property Address	902 North 20 th Street
Public Hearing Date	August 25, 2008
Heard by	Historic Preservation Commission
Analyst	Julie Archambeault
Checked By	Sarah Schafer

Public Notification

Radius notices mailed to adjacent properties: **August 8, 2008**
Staff posted notice on site on: **August 11, 2008**

Table of Contents

1. Project Data and Facts	2
2. Land Use	2
3. Project Proposal	3
4. Ordinance / Standards	4
5. Analysis / Findings	4
6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions	12

1. Project Data and Facts

Applicant/Status	Harold and Sarah Wright / Owner
Architect/Representative	Renaissance Remodeling
Location of Property	902 North 20 th Street
Size of Property	6,939 sq. ft.
Present Zoning and Land Use	R-1CH (Single-Family Residential)
Historic District	Expanded North End
Date of Construction	1905
Style	Shingle style with Craftsman Influence
Status	Contributing
Square Footage of Existing House	1,349

Description of Applicant's Request
The applicant is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the enclosed front porch, construct a front porch and construct a full basement.

2. Land Use

Description and Character of Surrounding Area
The surrounding area has some modern homes, some historic homes that have lost their integrity and some historic homes with good historic integrity. The area has mature trees along the street.

Site Characteristics
The site is a substandard corner lot with one single family dwelling. Bushes grow along the property line.
Special Considerations
None
History of Previous Actions
1905-Construction of home 1948-Reroof and reside 1955-New front concrete stairs

3. Project Proposal

Site Design

Land Use	Existing	Proposed
Percentage of the site devoted to building coverage:	21%	21.5%
Percentage of the site devoted to paving:	1%	1%
Percentage of the site devoted to landscaping:	78%	77.5%
TOTAL	100%	100%

Setbacks

Yard	Required	Proposed for Building	Proposed for Garage
Front (southwest)	15' (bldg.) 20' (garage)	25'	No garage
Side Street (southeast)	15' (bldg.) 15' (garage)	15'	No garage
Side (northwest)	5' (bldg.) 5' (garage)	19'	No garage
Rear (northeast)	15' (bldg.) 9' (garage)	No change	No garage

Fencing

None

Structure(s) Design

Number and Proposed Use of Buildings	Two buildings exist-a small shed and a single family dwelling.
Maximum Building Height	21'
Number of Stories	1

4. Ordinance / Standards

Section	
11-04-04.01	General Standards
2-18-09	Historic Preservation Ordinance
4.1	Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts
	Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Structures

5. Analysis/Findings

Section 2-18-9 C Demolition or Relocation.

After the designation by ordinance of an historical district, or historical district - residential, no building or structure which is a part of such district shall be demolished or moved until after an application for Certificate of Appropriateness relating to the demolition or moving of such building or structure has been submitted to and approved by the Commission. A Certificate of Appropriateness must be issued prior to the issuance of any building or other permit required by the City for the demolition or moving of any building or structure which is part of an historical district or historical district - residential. A Certificate of Appropriateness shall be required regardless of whether other licenses or permits are required for the moving or demolition of such building or structure.

1. Findings. In order for the Commission to approve a demolition or relocation request at least three (3) out of the five (5) following Findings must be met:

a. That the building, project, site or structure is not classified as contributory to the district.

The site is classified as contributing to the District. The applicant has not met this Finding.

b. That the building, object, site or structure cannot reasonably meet National, State or Local criteria for designation as an historical or architectural landmark.

Neither the site as a whole nor the house individually has enough architectural or historical significance to reasonably meet National, State or Local criteria for designation as an historical or architectural landmark. The applicant has met this Finding.

c. That demolition of the building, object, site or structure would not adversely affect the character of the District and/or the adjacent properties.

The existing addition to the front that will be removed is a later addition and is not compatible with the style of the house. Because of this, its demolition will not adversely affect the character of the District or the adjacent properties. The applicant has met this Finding.

d. That the owner has reasonably demonstrated that rehabilitation of the building, object, site or structure would not be economically feasible.

This alternative has not been explored. The applicant has not met this Finding.

e. That plans have been submitted to redevelop the property if the demolition proceeds, and such plans will have a positive effect on the District and/or adjacent properties.

Plans have been submitted to replace the existing addition with a front porch that matches the style of the house and the district. These plans will have a positive effect on the District. The applicant has met this Finding.

Section 2-18-9 (A) (1) (c) Confirmation of Classification

As part of the application process for a Certificate of Appropriateness, the Planning Staff shall confirm the contributing or non-contributing classification of the property based on the criteria set forth in the definitions of Section 2-18-02.

A. A property is contributing if

1. it was present during the period of significance, AND
2. it possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time
 - i. Location
 - ii. Design
 - iii. Setting
 - iv. Materials
 - v. Workmanship
 - vi. Feeling-The property expresses of the aesthetic or historic sense of its time.
 - vii. Association-The property retains its direct link with
3. it is capable of yielding important information about the period OR
4. it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria

A property is noncontributing if

5. it was not present during the period of significance,
6. due to alterations, disturbances, additions, or other changes, it no longer possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time OR
7. it is incapable of yielding important information about the period OR
8. it does not individually meet the National Register eligibility criteria

The house has been altered since its construction. Between 1912 and 1949, its front porch was removed. After 1956, a small, enclosed entry was constructed. Its cladding and roofing has also been changed. Because of the radical changes to its style, the house is no longer contributing to the District.

Section 11-04-14.03 Development Standards for Substandard Original Lots of Record

A. Setbacks

1. **Front Setbacks:** The front yard setback for livable space and porches shall be within five (5) feet of the average of the front yard setbacks of adjoining properties. However, in no case shall the front setback be less than 10 feet or more than 20 feet. The front setback for parking is 20 feet. Maximum setbacks are required in order to provide a visual and physical relationship to the street and retain room for an open back yard area. If the applicant has multiple contiguous lots, the front setbacks should provide modulation in order to avoid a uniform line of dwellings with identical front setbacks.
2. **Side Setbacks:** Interior side setbacks shall be in accordance with the applicable zone; street side yard setbacks shall be 15 feet for livable space and porches and 20 feet for parking, unless one of the following is applied:
 - a. **Common Lot Line Attached Units** – Up to three (3) units may be attached at the common lot line, provided that the exterior setbacks (unattached side setbacks) adhere to those required by the zone.
 - b. **Detached Units on Contiguous Lots** – When two (2) or more single family units are proposed on contiguous lots, the interior side yard setbacks may be reduced to three (3) feet provided that the exterior setbacks to the development adhere to the setbacks that are required by the zone.
3. **Rear Setbacks:** Rear yard setbacks shall be as required by the zoning district in which the substandard lot is located.

The setbacks are all within requirements.

This requirement has been met.

4. **Garage:** A single story detached garage accessed off of an alley may have a three (3) foot interior side setback.

5. The first story of a two story attached building shall be setback a minimum of five (5) feet from the side property line. The second story of a two story attached building shall be setback a minimum of eight (8) feet from the side property line; provided, bay windows, pop-outs or other architectural appurtenances may be allowed at the five (5) foot setback line in the R-1C zone. All other zones must meet their side yard setback requirements. (See also Section 11-05-05 Boise Municipal Code)

No garage or attached buildings are proposed.

This requirement has been met.

- B. Building height shall not exceed the width of the lot or the maximum height allowed by the zone, whichever is most restrictive.

The building height will not be changed. It is 21', which is shorter than both the maximum height allowed by the zone (35') and the width of the lot (55').

This requirement has been met.

- C. Building Size: Residential floor area shall not exceed 55% of the effective lot area on lots with less than 5,000 square feet. "Effective Lot Area" is the gross horizontal area of a lot minus any portion of the lot encumbered by a recorded driveway or road easement. "Residential Floor Area" is the amount of all livable space including basements and bonus rooms.

Residential floor area is 2,698 sq. ft., which is 38% of the lot.

This requirement has been met.

- D. Private Open Space: All substandard lots must provide a minimum of 375 square feet of private open space in the rear yard. This open space must be configured as a 15 foot by 25 foot rectangle and must have a minimum rectangular dimension of 10 feet by 15 feet that is open to the sky. Covered rear porches are allowed to be calculated as part of the private open space area.

Private open space is provided in the rear yard and is a space measuring 44' x 55'.

This requirement has been met.

- E. Landscaping: A landscape plan shall be required. All areas that are not developed with structures, driveways, parking lots, streets, pathways, patios and similar useable areas shall be landscaped. The landscaping shall accomplish the following objectives:
 - shading of parking areas and walkways;

- ground cover consisting of predominantly live planted materials shall be used;
- erosion control;
- and attractive streetscapes and common areas.

Some useable hard scape features (such as pavers, planters, stonework, decks, etc) may be allowed up to 25% of the entire landscaped areas. Plastic or other artificial materials are not allowed. The landscape plan shall include an irrigation system. Xeriscape plans that are consistent with Public Works standards shall be considered acceptable.

Landscaping is congruous for the Historic District and includes bushes, trees and lawn.

This requirement has been met.

F. Parking

1. Each dwelling shall be provided with two (2) off street parking spaces.
2. Vehicular access and parking shall be provided according to the following standards:
 - a. Access to an alley:
 1. All access shall be taken from the alley. Two spaces shall be provided with 22 feet of backup space in accordance with Section 11-10-04.04, Table 12, Boise City Code.
 - b. No access to an alley:
 1. Interior lots with no alley access shall be required to provide a two (2) car attached garage. The applicant shall include design elements that will provide varied rooflines, dormers within the roofline or other architectural treatments that will avoid the appearance of garage domination. The setback of the garage face shall be 20 feet. Driveways for a two car attached garage may not exceed 20 feet in width.
 2. The use of a 10 foot wide shared driveway providing access to rear yard garages that are attached with a common wall on the property line is allowed.

There is currently no garage. This condition is grandfathered in.

This requirement has been met.

G. Right-of-Way Improvement

1. All developments shall provide curb, gutter and sidewalk on the adjacent roadway(s) and, if applicable, the applicant shall provide a paved driveway apron that extends to the edge of the pavement. Waivers or variations to some or this requirement may be granted by the Planning Director based upon local conditions such as the lack of adjacent improvements and/or documented drainage problems that may result from the improvement of the roadway. Any alternative granted through a waiver shall include a curb line or physical barrier to prevent parking adjacent to the right-of-way. If a waiver is granted, the value of the improvements, as estimated by the City of Boise, shall be placed in a Public Rights-of-Way Road Trust deposit for up to ten (10) years to be held by the City of Boise for later improvement of the curb, gutter and sidewalk abutting the site.
2. Dirt or gravel strips in the front yard or undeveloped street right-of-way shall not be permitted. Irrigated landscaping shall be provided in these areas through license agreements with the ACHD. Bonding for landscape improvements may be allowed based on weather related constraints. If ACHD denies the necessary license agreement, the requirement for landscaping shall be waived.
3. If full right-of-way improvement is not feasible and ACHD determines that there is insufficient pavement width for travel lanes with on-street parking, a non-landscaped ACHD-approved shoulder shall be installed that is the minimum width necessary to accommodate parallel parking. Landscaping shall still be required to the edge of the parking shoulder.
4. All right-of-way improvements, license agreements and bonding shall be completed prior to issuance of a Residential Certificate of Occupancy permit for the structure.

Both 10th Street and Sherman Street are improved with curb, gutter and sidewalk.

This requirement has been met.

H. Alternative Building Arrangements

1. Attaching single family units in multiples of two (2) or three (3) on common lot lines is encouraged as a means of creating more substantial structures that will be imitative of standard width single-family homes. Such units remain subject to the general design criteria stated in this Chapter and do not require a planned unit development application.
2. Additional requirements for attached buildings:
 - a. Attached buildings shall be constructed to comply with townhouse construction standards in accordance with the Boise City Building Code.

- b. The Office of the City Attorney shall review and approve all easement agreements an applicant or builder seeks to obtain for the use and maintenance of common facilities such as driveways, parking sites and common party walls. All such easements shall be recorded in the records of Ada County prior to an applicant or builder seeking a building permit under this ordinance.
- c. Adjustments to lot lines and reduction in the number of lots within the same parcel are subject to review and approval pursuant to all applicable Boise City subdivision and zoning regulations. The applicant shall obtain approval from Boise City and record any lot line adjustments or reduction in lots with the Ada County Recorder prior to submission for a building permit.

No alternative arrangements are proposed.

This requirement has been met.

Section 11-04-14.04 Design Guidelines for Substandard Lots

- A. In addition to the development standards described in Section 11-04-14.03 of Boise City Code, the following general design guidelines shall apply to substandard lots. The Design Review Committee and Design Review staff shall take into account the location and design of adjacent buildings, landscaping and right-of-way improvements, and shall apply the following criteria as appropriate:

- 1. Full-length two story structures are not allowed;
- 2. One and a half story structures are the preferred form of development on substandard lots. One and a half story structures will be required when the existing structures adjacent to the proposed development are one story in height.

A one and a half story structure can be defined as:

- a. A structure that has a maximum building height of 18 feet (to the midline of the roof) and includes a daylight basement that is sunk into the ground a minimum of four (4) feet.
- b. A structure that has a maximum building height of 18 feet (to the midline of the roof) and contains the second story within the pitched roofline.

3. Partial two story structures may be allowed when the surrounding properties will not be adversely impacted by such height. The circumstances to be considered shall include: the size and height of the adjacent dwelling units; privacy impacts on adjacent properties; the height, mass, window placement and roofline pitch of the proposed structure; and the overall design of the upper story of the proposed structure. Upper story limitations or setbacks on the new building may be an acceptable means of ensuring compatibility with adjacent structures of smaller size.
4. Front Façade Design Requirements.
 - a. Homes shall have a front door that faces the street. When a unit is built on a corner lot, the door shall face the dominant street.
 - b. In lieu of a street facing front door, the applicant may construct a prominent front porch that is a minimum of six (6) feet in depth and the dwelling shall have a minimum of 25% of the front facade comprised of windows and/or door openings. For homes with front-loaded garages, a garage door shall not count toward the window opening requirements. The garage door shall include design elements such as: panels, windows, trim features, cross members, or other architectural features as determined by the Design Review Committee or Design Review staff.
 - c. Detached dwelling units shall provide a façade that substantially differs from the façade of adjacent structures. Variations in materials alone will not be considered sufficient. The unique façade may be obtained through the use of structural changes or through the use of substantial design elements. In addition to complying with the preceding design guidelines, the front façade shall include multiple design elements such as: multi-paned windows, varied roof lines, dormers, bay windows, wainscoting, a covered front door, a usable front porch or other elements as approved by the Design Review Committee or staff that create a unique façade. Articulated designs may repeat on non-contiguous lots.
 - d. Attached units shall provide modulation and architectural design features to prevent flat façade wall planes.
 - e. Building design shall incorporate quality materials such as brick, stone, stucco, tile, and wood for a significant (35% or more) portion of the façade and second story elements. The presence of such materials on nearby homes shall be reviewed as a guide for appropriate materials to be used on the new dwelling.

5. All buildings shall be oriented toward a public street. When buildings cannot be oriented toward a public street due to inadequate street frontage or similar circumstances, the buildings shall be oriented toward a private street or lane that conforms to City standards.
6. Where front yard driveways are permitted for access, the driveway may be designed with concrete wheel strips or grass pavers that are separated by vegetation.

As the subject parcel is located within a recognized historic district, the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts supersede §11-04-14.04 of the Boise City Code, outlined above.

Discussion

The project proposes to remove the small addition on the front of the house and replace it with a front porch. The addition occurred after 1956 and is not in the style of the house, which has many Queen Anne elements including the two bow windows. It also lacks any of the details found on the rest of the house including the brackets under the eaves or the sandstone foundation. The porch proposed does not match the footprint of the one found on the 1912 Sanborn map. However, its bow shape matches the shape of the two bow windows on the house and rounded porches are a common Queen Anne feature.

The basement is also congruous. It will add square footage to the house without affecting the external appearance of the house.

6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions

Pursuant to Boise City Code 2-18-9 A and B of Boise Municipal Code, the request to demolish the enclosed front porch, construct a front porch and construct a full basement is congruous with the historical, architectural, archeological, educational or cultural aspects of the historic district because:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (1995 Edition), the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Districts, the North End Plan and the Boise City Comprehensive Plan are references often utilized by the Historic Preservation Commission to determine whether a change is congruous with the historic and architectural qualities of the historic district.

1. In order for the Commission to approve a demolition or relocation request at least three out of the five Findings must be met. (2-18-9C) Three of the five Findings have been met. The house cannot meet landmark status, the front addition's demolition will not adversely affect the District or the adjacent properties, and the submitted plans will have a positive effect on the District and the adjacent properties.

2. The Commission's decision in regard to Certificates of Appropriateness for alterations, as described in 2-18-09 (A), shall be based on six findings as applicable to that property. (2-18-11 01)
- A. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not in a commercial district.
- B. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. This application does not comply with the following guidelines.
 - a. "Relate rooflines, the pitch, and orientation of the new addition to the primary building." (4.1.3)
 - b. "Consider ground or basement additions before the addition of dormer(s). Under unique circumstances driven by site constraints, dormer(s) additions should be designed in proportional scale to the original roof and should not visually compete." (4.1.8)
 - c. "Maintain proportional lot coverage as found on the neighboring properties of the same block; maximum lot coverage of all buildings should not exceed 30% of the total lot area. Minimum open space should be 40% of the total lot area. Any exceptions to these percentages will be closely scrutinized." (4.1.10)
- C. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction.) This application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. This application does not comply with the following guidelines.
 - a. "Removing or radically changing buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished is not recommended. (pg. 102) The front addition is not a site feature that is important in defining the overall historic character of the property. Its removal will not diminish the character of the property.
 - b. "Designing and constructing a new feature of a building or site when the historic feature is completely missing, such as an outbuilding, terrace, or driveway. It may be based on historical, pictorial, and physical documentation; or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building or site. (pg. 105) The new porch is a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the site.

- c. “Designing and constructing a new entrance or porch when the historic entrance or porch is completely missing. It may be a restoration based on historical, pictorial, and physical documentation; or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character building.” (pg. 87) The new porch is a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building.
- D. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. The application is in compliance with the following goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan and the North End Plan.
 - a. The unique character of the neighborhood should be maintained, including architectural style, sitting on the lots, orientation of the units and landscaping characteristics. (p. 18) The new porch and the basement will preserve the unique character of the neighborhood by using forms and materials found in the neighborhood and in the district.
 - b. The proposed use or design of the property should reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood and be compatible with it. (p. 17) The proposed design reflects the character of the adjacent neighborhood and is compatible with it. It uses traditional forms and materials.
- E. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the district. The project is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education or cultural aspects of the district because it complies with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts and the North End Plan.
- F. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the district and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. This application complies with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the request for any variances.
- 3. A contributing building, site, structure or object adds to the historic architectural qualities, historic associations, or archeological values for which a property is significant because (a) it was present during the period of significance, and possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time or is capable of yielding important information about the period, or (b) it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria. The structure was constructed during the era of significance. However, it has lost its historic integrity. It is not contributing.

Site Specific Conditions of Approval

1. Compliance with plans and specifications submitted to and on file in the Planning and Development Services Department dated received August 8, 2008.

Standard Conditions of Approval

2. The applicant shall comply with the Boise City Fire Code.
3. Prior to a Building Permit and prior to any construction on the site, an Erosion and Sediment Control Permit must be obtained from the Building Division of the Planning and Development Services Department.
4. No change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall be valid unless in writing and signed by the applicant or his authorized representative and an authorized representative of the City of Boise. The burden shall be upon the applicant to obtain the written confirmation of any change and not upon the City of Boise.
5. Any change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall require the applicant to comply with all rules, regulations, ordinances, plans or other regulatory and legal restrictions in force at the time the applicant or successors in interest advise the City of intent to change the planned use of the property described herein unless a variance in said requirements or other legal relief is granted pursuant to the law in effect at the time the change in use is sought.
6. If the applicant does not act on the Certificate of Appropriateness through the commencement of construction, or extended pursuant to the Boise City Code, within eighteen months, it will become null and void without further notification from this department.
7. The applicant shall be required to obtain a Building Permit prior to the start of construction.

Construction Site Requirements

8. The practices required below are intended to mitigate the impact and disturbance of residential property owners during the construction of adjacent buildings or structures. The following conditions apply to all construction-related activities ranging from grading and demolition activities to final occupancy on any land or parcel falling under the proprietary ownership of the permit applicant.
 - a) Prior to the issuance of a building permit and prior to the commencement of any construction on-site, an Erosion and Sediment Control (ESC) permit must be obtained from the Planning and Development Services Department. No grading, demolition or earth disturbing activities may start until an approved ESC permit and the associated site work or grading permits have been issued.

- b) Measures shall be taken to manage construction debris and trash on the construction site and efforts shall also be made to provide reasonable controls to minimize fugitive dust on the construction site. Such measures shall include, but are not limited to:
 - Provide suitable containers for solid waste generated by construction activity;
 - Wet demolition of existing buildings;
 - Watering of driving surfaces and earth moving activities;
 - Installation of wind screening around property and each open floor above grade; and
 - Daily broom cleaning of above grade floors, adjacent streets and sidewalks.
- c) To reduce the noise impact of construction on nearby residential properties, all exterior construction activities shall be limited to the hours between 7:00 a.m. and 7:00 p.m. Monday through Friday and 8:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. for Saturday and Sunday. Low noise impact activities such as surveying, layout and weather protection may be performed at any time. After each floor of the structure or building is enclosed with exterior walls and windows, interior construction of the enclosed floors can be performed at any time.
- d) A minimum height of six foot (6') rigid security fencing, either wood or metal, shall be installed around the construction site within 30 days of the date when the first city permit is issued on projects where construction activity shall exceed 90 days.
- e) Exterior lighting and other illuminating equipment or materials shall be positioned, shielded, directed and located to not reflect or impact adjacent residential property and streets.
- f) Applicant shall comply with Boise City Fire Department requirements for water, access, and/or other requirements as determined by the Fire Marshal.
- g) Any conditions to be enforced during construction shall remain posted at each street abutting the construction site for the duration of the project. In addition to the posted conditions the permit holder shall also post an 11"x 17" laminated sign containing a project contact phone number, name of project contact and the Boise City contact number, 384-3845, to address issues as they arise. Failure to abide by any conditions set forth shall be grounds for revocation of Conditional Use Permit and/or Building Permits and may be subject the owner or owner's agents to fines and criminal citations.