



Planning & Development Services

Boise City Hall, 2nd Floor
150 N. Capitol Boulevard
P. O. Box 500
Boise, Idaho 83701-0500

Phone: 208/384-3830
Fax: 208/384-3753
TDD/TTY: 800/377-3529
Website: www.cityofboise.org/pds

5

Planning Division Staff Report

File Number	DRH08-00264
Applicant	Bruce Ballenger & Karen Kelley
Property Address	1503 North 25 th Street
Public Hearing Date	25 August 2008
Heard by	Historic Preservation Commission
Analyst	Matt Halitsky, AICP
Checked By	Sarah Schafer, Historic Preservation Manager

Public Notification

Radius notices mailed to adjacent properties:
Staff posted notice on site on:

8 August 2008
11 August 2008

Table of Contents

1. Project Data and Facts	2
2. Land Use	2
3. Project Proposal	3
4. Ordinance / Standards	4
5. Analysis / Findings	4
6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions	5

1. Project Data and Facts

Applicant/Status	Bruce Ballenger & Karen Kelley / owners
Architect/Representative	N/A
Location of Property	1503 North 25 th Street
Size of Property	9,583 square feet
Present Zoning and Land Use	R-1CH
Historic District	North End
Date of Construction	1910
Style	Craftsman / Bungalow
Status	Contributing
Square Footage of Existing House	3,033 square feet

Description of Applicant's Request
The applicant is proposing to construct two rear dormers, and replace certain second-story windows with wood clad windows of the same size. These windows are indicated on the attached elevations.

2. Land Use

Description and Character of Surrounding Area
The surrounding neighborhood is a mixture of single and one and one-half story homes, with single-story garages accessed off of a rear alley.

Site Characteristics
The subject property is located on the northwest corner of 25 th and Heron Streets. A single-family home with an attached garage currently exists on site. An existing six-foot high cedar fence encloses the rear yard, while mature trees and shrubs adorn the front, side and rear of the home. There will be no removal of landscaping under the current proposal.
Special Considerations
None
History of Previous Actions
1990 – Remodel (per site inventory form)

3. Project Proposal

Site Design

Land Use	Existing	Proposed
Percentage of the site devoted to building coverage:	19%	19%
Percentage of the site devoted to paving:	2%	2%
Percentage of the site devoted to landscaping:	79%	79%
TOTAL	100%	100%

Setbacks

Yard	Required	Proposed for Building	Proposed for Garage
Front (east)	15' (bldg.) 20' (garage)	No Change	No Change
Side Street (south)	15' (bldg.) 15' (garage)	No Change	No Change
Side (north)	5' (bldg.) 5' (garage)	No Change	No Change
Rear (west)	15' (bldg.) 0' (garage)	No Change	No Change

Fencing

A six-foot high cedar fence currently encloses the rear yard.

Structure(s) Design

Number and Proposed Use of Buildings	One single-family dwelling w/ an attached garage
Maximum Building Height	28-feet to the ridgeline (no change)
Number of Stories	Two

4. Ordinance / Standards

Section	
11-04-04.01	General Standards
2-18-09	Historic Preservation Ordinance
4.1	Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts
	Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Structures

5. Analysis/Findings

Contributing Analysis

B.C.C Section 2-18-09 (A) (1) (c) states: *As part of the application process for a Certificate of Appropriateness, the Planning Staff shall confirm the contributing or non-contributing classification of the property based on the criteria set forth in the definitions of Section 2-18-02.*

The subject home was constructed circa 1910, during the period of significance for the North End. The property was deemed contributing in a survey conducted in 2001. Although some alterations have occurred since construction, the structure remains intact and has retained its historic integrity. The massing of the house is the same, and it retains its character defining features, mainly the front porch and dormer as well as the decorative brackets. The property is still contributing.

Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts, Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Structures

The applicant has proposed constructing two shed dormers at the rear of the home, as well as the replacement of two small casement windows along the south elevation. These two windows will be replaced with new wood clad windows with simulated divided lites, the design and size of which shall match that existing. Originally all second-story windows were proposed to be replaced, however certain windows have been crossed out on the attached elevations and those will remain unchanged. Wood clad windows are an appropriate alternative to wood, and as the size and mullion pattern will remain the same as what currently exists, staff recommends approval of the window replacement as proposed.

The two dormers proposed at the rear of the home will match the form of the shed dormer at the front of the home. These dormers will not be seen from the front elevation along 25th Street, and mature trees will help to shield their view from Heron Street. The dormers will feature wood clad windows to match the existing windows along the second story, as well as

the architectural brackets existing on the historic portion of the home. Although the two proposed dormers are different in size, their pattern balances with the existing rear of the home relative to the rear gable at the southwest corner of the structure. This is better seen on the attached photo of the rear elevation, which adds the dimension absent from the submitted elevations. The design of the proposed dormers is consistent with the residential design guidelines and the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. They neither detract from the historic home, nor create a false sense of history. The form matches that of the existing front dormer, and the appropriate use of materials and architectural elements results in an attractive addition to the historic home, that meets the needs of the property owners while maintaining the goals and policies of the Historic Preservation Ordinance. The project does not result in an increase in the footprint of the home, and thus effective lot coverage does not change. Staff recommends approval of the dormers as proposed.

6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions

Pursuant to Boise City Code 2-18-9 A and B of Boise Municipal Code, the proposed development is congruous with the historical, architectural, archeological, educational or cultural aspects of the historic district because:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (1995 Edition), the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Districts, the North End Plan and the Boise City Comprehensive Plan are references often utilized by the Historic Preservation Commission to determine whether a change is congruous with the historic and architectural qualities of the historic district.

1. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A* states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not within one of the Commercial Districts therefore this finding does not apply to this application.
2. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B* states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. The application will comply with the requirements of this finding.
3. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C* states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction). This application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. The proposal neither creates a false sense of history, nor detracts from the historic neighborhood as a whole.
4. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D* states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. The application is in compliance with the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City

Comprehensive Plan. The proposal promotes redevelopment while retaining the historic integrity of the property and character of the neighborhood.

5. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E* states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the district. This application is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education and cultural aspects of the district.
6. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F* states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the district and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. This application complies with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the need for a waiver or variance.

Site Specific Conditions of Approval

1. Compliance with plans and specifications submitted to and on file in the Planning and Development Services Department dated received 25 July 2008.

Standard Conditions of Approval

2. The applicant shall comply with the Boise City Fire Code.
3. Prior to a Building Permit and prior to any construction on the site, an Erosion and Sediment Control Permit must be obtained from the Building Division of the Planning and Development Services Department.
4. No change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall be valid unless in writing and signed by the applicant or his authorized representative and an authorized representative of the City of Boise. The burden shall be upon the applicant to obtain the written confirmation of any change and not upon the City of Boise.
5. Any change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall require the applicant to comply with all rules, regulations, ordinances, plans or other regulatory and legal restrictions in force at the time the applicant or successors in interest advise the City of intent to change the planned use of the property described herein unless a variance in said requirements or other legal relief is granted pursuant to the law in effect at the time the change in use is sought.
6. If the applicant does not act on the Certificate of Appropriateness through the commencement of construction, or extended pursuant to the Boise City Code, within

eighteen months, it will become null and void without further notification from this department.

7. The applicant shall be required to obtain a Building Permit prior to the start of construction.

Construction Site Requirements

8. The practices required below are intended to mitigate the impact and disturbance of residential property owners during the construction of adjacent buildings or structures. The following conditions apply to all construction-related activities ranging from grading and demolition activities to final occupancy on any land or parcel falling under the proprietary ownership of the permit applicant.
 - a) Prior to the issuance of a building permit and prior to the commencement of any construction on-site, an Erosion and Sediment Control (ESC) permit must be obtained from the Planning and Development Services Department. No grading, demolition or earth disturbing activities may start until an approved ESC permit and the associated site work or grading permits have been issued.
 - b) Measures shall be taken to manage construction debris and trash on the construction site and efforts shall also be made to provide reasonable controls to minimize fugitive dust on the construction site. Such measures shall include, but are not limited to:
 - Provide suitable containers for solid waste generated by construction activity;
 - Wet demolition of existing buildings;
 - Watering of driving surfaces and earth moving activities;
 - Installation of wind screening around property and each open floor above grade; and
 - Daily broom cleaning of above grade floors, adjacent streets and sidewalks.
 - c) To reduce the noise impact of construction on nearby residential properties, all exterior construction activities shall be limited to the hours between 7:00 a.m. and 7:00 p.m. Monday through Friday and 8:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. for Saturday and Sunday. Low noise impact activities such as surveying, layout and weather protection may be performed at any time. After each floor of the structure or building is enclosed with exterior walls and windows, interior construction of the enclosed floors can be performed at any time.
 - d) A minimum height of six foot (6') rigid security fencing, either wood or metal, shall be installed around the construction site within 30 days of the date when the first city permit is issued on projects where construction activity shall exceed 90 days.

- e) Exterior lighting and other illuminating equipment or materials shall be positioned, shielded, directed and located to not reflect or impact adjacent residential property and streets.
- f) Applicant shall comply with Boise City Fire Department requirements for water, access, and/or other requirements as determined by the Fire Marshal.
- g) Any conditions to be enforced during construction shall remain posted at each street abutting the construction site for the duration of the project. In addition to the posted conditions the permit holder shall also post an 11"x 17" laminated sign containing a project contact phone number, name of project contact and the Boise City contact number, 384-3845, to address issues as they arise. Failure to abide by any conditions set forth shall be grounds for revocation of Conditional Use Permit and/or Building Permits and may be subject the owner or owner's agents to fines and criminal citations.