



Planning & Development Services

Boise City Hall, 2nd Floor
150 N. Capitol Boulevard
P. O. Box 500
Boise, Idaho 83701-0500

Phone: 208/384-3830
Fax: 208/384-3753
TDD/TTY: 800/377-3529
Website: www.cityofboise.org/pds

6

Planning Division Staff Report

File Number	DRH08-00266
Applicant	Jim Prince
Property Address	1710 North 10 th Street
Public Hearing Date	August 25, 2008
Heard by	Historic Preservation Commission
Analyst	Julie Archambeault
Checked By	Sarah Schafer

Public Notification

Radius notices mailed to adjacent properties: **August 8, 2008**
Staff posted notice on site on: **August 11, 2008**

Table of Contents

1. Project Data and Facts	2
2. Land Use	2
3. Project Proposal	3
4. Ordinance / Standards	4
5. Analysis / Findings	4
6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions	6

1. Project Data and Facts

Applicant/Status	Jim Prince / Owner
Architect/Representative	Catherine Sewell / Platform Architects
Location of Property	1710 North 10 th Street
Size of Property	5,290 sq. ft.
Present Zoning and Land Use	R-1CH (Single Family Residential)
Historic District	North End
Date of Construction	Ca. 1900
Style	Gable front and wing
Status	Contributing
Square Footage of Existing House	908 sq. ft.

Description of Applicant's Request

The applicant is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove trees, demolish a rear addition, construct a first floor addition, a basement, replace windows and construct new openings within existing walls.

2. Land Use

Description and Character of Surrounding Area

The surrounding area is characterized by mature trees and older, single story homes. There is a two-story home to the north that, although modified somewhat, has been two stories since its construction. The street is wide.

Site Characteristics

The site consists of a small single family dwelling with a large front setback. It is landscaped with several trees and lawn.

Special Considerations

None

History of Previous Actions

1912-1949-construction of house
1951-construction of addition

3. Project Proposal

Site Design

Land Use	Existing	Proposed
Percentage of the site devoted to building coverage:	12.5%	23%
Percentage of the site devoted to paving:	1%	1%
Percentage of the site devoted to landscaping:	86.5%	76%
TOTAL	100%	100%

Setbacks

Yard	Required	Proposed for Building	Proposed for Garage
Front (west)	15' (bldg.) 20' (garage)	No change	No change
Side (south)	5' (bldg.) 5' (garage)	14' 8"	No change
Side (north)	5' (bldg.) 5' (garage)	5' 4"	No change
Rear (east)	15' (bldg.) 9' (garage)	15' 1"	No change

Fencing

None

Structure(s) Design

Number and Proposed Use of Buildings	One building exists-a single family dwelling.
Maximum Building Height	14'-existing and proposed
Number of Stories	1-existing and proposed

4. Ordinance / Standards

Section	
11-04-04.01	General Standards
2-18-09	Historic Preservation Ordinance
4.1	Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts
	Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Structures

5. Analysis/Findings

Section 2-18-9 C Demolition or Relocation.

After the designation by ordinance of an historical district, or historical district - residential, no building or structure which is a part of such district shall be demolished or moved until after an application for Certificate of Appropriateness relating to the demolition or moving of such building or structure has been submitted to and approved by the Commission. A Certificate of Appropriateness must be issued prior to the issuance of any building or other permit required by the City for the demolition or moving of any building or structure which is part of an historical district or historical district - residential. A Certificate of Appropriateness shall be required regardless of whether other licenses or permits are required for the moving or demolition of such building or structure.

1. Findings. In order for the Commission to approve a demolition or relocation request at least three (3) out of the five (5) following Findings must be met:

a. That the building, project, site or structure is not classified as contributory to the District.

The site is classified as contributing to the District. The applicant has not met this Finding.

b. That the building, object, site or structure cannot reasonably meet National, State or Local criteria for designation as an historical or architectural landmark.

Neither the site as a whole nor the house individually has enough architectural or historical significance to reasonably meet National, State or Local criteria for designation as an historical or architectural landmark. The applicant has met this Finding.

c. That demolition of the building, object, site or structure would not adversely affect the character of the District and/or the adjacent properties.

The portion of the house to be demolished is a later addition with a lower roof slope and a different pitch than those of the original building. Because it is a later addition that is incongruous with the original building, its demolition will not adversely affect the character of the District or the adjacent properties. The applicant has met this Finding.

d. That the owner has reasonably demonstrated that rehabilitation of the building, object, site or structure would not be economically feasible.

This alternative has not been explored. The applicant has not met this Finding.

e. That plans have been submitted to redevelop the property if the demolition proceeds, and such plans will have a positive effect on the District and/or adjacent properties.

Plans have been submitted to replace the existing addition with a new, larger addition. These plans will have a positive effect on the District. The applicant has met this Finding.

Section 2-18-9 (A) (1) (c) Confirmation of Classification

As part of the application process for a Certificate of Appropriateness, the Planning Staff shall confirm the contributing or non-contributing classification of the property based on the criteria set forth in the definitions of Section 2-18-02.

- A. A property is contributing if
 - 1. it was present during the period of significance, AND
 - 2. it possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time
 - i. Location
 - ii. Design
 - iii. Setting
 - iv. Materials
 - v. Workmanship
 - vi. Feeling-The property expresses of the aesthetic or historic sense of its time.
 - vii. Association-The property retains its direct link with
 - 3. it is capable of yielding important information about the period OR
 - 4. it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria
- B. A property is noncontributing if
 - 1. it was not present during the period of significance,
 - 2. due to alterations, disturbances, additions, or other changes, it no longer possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time OR
 - 3. it is incapable of yielding important information about the period OR
 - 4. it does not individually meet the National Register eligibility criteria

The North End's era of significance runs from the early 20th century through the mid-1950s. This building was constructed between 1912 and 1949, according to the Sanborn Maps. Although it has had a few additions since its footprint appeared on the 1949 Sanborn, those additions have not adversely affected its historic integrity. It is still contributing.

Discussion

The building pictured in the 1903 and 1912 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps are closer to the road and have a different footprint than those on the 1949 and 1956 maps, suggesting that the one shown on the later maps replaced the earlier structure. That structure has received several additions to the side and the rear.

The proposed project will remove the addition on the rear of the structure and construct a larger addition in its place. This addition will have the same main roof height as the original structure, although its wings will be slightly higher than that of the main house. This slight increase in height will be the only place where the addition will be visible.

The addition's materials will match those of the original building. Cement-fiber board siding of the same reveal as that of the existing wood siding will be used and metal clad wood windows will match the wood windows currently existing.

New windows will be installed on the north elevation and four windows will be replaced on the south elevation. These windows will be metal clad wood windows and will be congruous in design and scale with those currently on the house.

Two of the trees on the property sit within the footprint of the new addition. These trees have a small diameter. Also, there are several other trees of similar size or larger on the property. Because the trees are not large and because there are others on the property, this action will not adversely affect the property.

A new basement will be put in under the new addition. This basement will add square footage to the house without affecting the exterior appearance.

The project is congruous.

6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions

Pursuant to Boise City Code 2-18-9 A and B of Boise Municipal Code, the request to remove trees, demolish a rear addition, construct a first floor addition, a basement, replace windows and construct new openings within existing walls is congruous with the historical, architectural, archeological, educational or cultural aspects of the Historic District because:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (1995 Edition), the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Districts, the North End Plan and the Boise City Comprehensive Plan are references often utilized by the Historic Preservation Commission to determine whether a change is congruous with the historic and architectural qualities of the Historic District.

1. In order for the Commission to approve a demolition or relocation request at least three out of the five Findings must be met. (2-18-9C) Three of the five Findings have been met. The building cannot meet landmark status, the addition's demolition will not adversely affect the District or the adjacent properties, and the submitted plans will have a positive effect on the District and the adjacent properties.
2. The Commission's decision in regard to Certificates of Appropriateness for alterations, as described in 2-18-09 (A), shall be based on six findings as applicable to that property. (2-18-11 01)
 - A. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not in a commercial district.
 - B. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. This application does not comply with the following guidelines.
 - a. "Set back a new addition from the primary façade of the original building to maintain original proportion, massing, size, and scale." (4.1.2) The new addition will be set 25' back from the primary façade.
 - b. "Relate rooflines, the pitch, and orientation of the new addition to the primary building." (4.1.3) The rooflines, pitch and orientation of the new addition will be related to those of the primary building.
 - c. "Use similar materials as found on the original building." (4.1.6) The materials used on the addition will be similar to those found on the original building and will include metal clad wood windows and cement fiber board siding.
 - d. "Consider ground or basement additions before the addition of dormer(s). Under unique circumstances driven by site constraints, dormer(s) additions should be designed in proportional scale to the original roof and should not visually compete." (4.1.8) The additions are ground and basement additions.
 - e. "Maintain proportional lot coverage as found on the neighboring properties of the same block; maximum lot coverage of all buildings should not exceed 30% of the total lot area. Minimum open space should be 40% of the total lot area. Any exceptions to these percentages will be closely scrutinized." (4.1.10) The lot coverage will be brought up to 23%.
 - C. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction.) This application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. This application does not comply with the following guidelines.
 - a. "Designing new exterior additions to historic buildings or adjacent new construction which is compatible with the historic character of the site and which preserves the historic relationship between the building or buildings and the landscape. (pg.105) The addition is compatible with the existing building. It will use forms and materials similar to those used on the original building.

- b. “Removing or radically changing buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished is not recommended. (pg. 102) The trees are not sites feature whose removal will diminish the character of the property.
 - c. “Designing a new addition in a manner that makes clear what is historic and what is new. (pg. 112) Design for the new work may be contemporary or may reference design motifs from the historic building. In either case, it should always be clearly differentiated from the historic building and be compatible in terms of mass, materials, relationship of solids to voids, and color.” (pg. 113) The new addition will be compatible through the use of similar materials and forms. It will be differentiated through the use of slightly higher eaves.
 - d. “Placing a new addition on a non-character-defining elevation and limiting the size and scale in relationship to the historic building.” (pg. 113) The addition will be placed on the rear of the building and limited in width and height to that of the original building.
- D. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. The application is in compliance with the following goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan and the North End Plan.
 - a. The unique character of the neighborhood should be maintained, including architectural style, sitting on the lots, orientation of the units and landscaping characteristics. (p. 18) The project will protect the unique character of the neighborhood by using additions that will not be visible from the road.
 - b. Protect historically and culturally significant resources that contribute to community identity and history. Goal, page 5-12 The project will protect this historically or culturally significant resource.
- E. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the district. The project is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education or cultural aspects of the district because it complies with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts and the North End Plan.
- F. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the district and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. This application complies with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the request for any variances.

3. A contributing building, site, structure or object adds to the historic architectural qualities, historic associations, or archeological values for which a property is significant because (a) it was present during the period of significance, and possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time or is capable of yielding important information about the period, or (b) it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria. The structure was constructed during the era of significance and has retained its compatibility. It is contributing.

Site Specific Conditions of Approval

1. Compliance with plans and specifications submitted to and on file in the Planning and Development Services Department dated received July 28, 2008.

Standard Conditions of Approval

2. The applicant shall comply with the Boise City Fire Code.
3. Prior to a Building Permit and prior to any construction on the site, an Erosion and Sediment Control Permit must be obtained from the Building Division of the Planning and Development Services Department.
4. No change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall be valid unless in writing and signed by the applicant or his authorized representative and an authorized representative of the City of Boise. The burden shall be upon the applicant to obtain the written confirmation of any change and not upon the City of Boise.
5. Any change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall require the applicant to comply with all rules, regulations, ordinances, plans or other regulatory and legal restrictions in force at the time the applicant or successors in interest advise the City of intent to change the planned use of the property described herein unless a variance in said requirements or other legal relief is granted pursuant to the law in effect at the time the change in use is sought.
6. If the applicant does not act on the Certificate of Appropriateness through the commencement of construction, or extended pursuant to the Boise City Code, within eighteen months, it will become null and void without further notification from this department.
7. The applicant shall be required to obtain a Building Permit prior to the start of construction.

Construction Site Requirements

8. The practices required below are intended to mitigate the impact and disturbance of residential property owners during the construction of adjacent buildings or structures. The following conditions apply to all construction-related activities ranging from grading and demolition activities to final occupancy on any land or parcel falling under the proprietary ownership of the permit applicant.

- a) Prior to the issuance of a building permit and prior to the commencement of any construction on-site, an Erosion and Sediment Control (ESC) permit must be obtained from the Planning and Development Services Department. No grading, demolition or earth disturbing activities may start until an approved ESC permit and the associated site work or grading permits have been issued.
- b) Measures shall be taken to manage construction debris and trash on the construction site and efforts shall also be made to provide reasonable controls to minimize fugitive dust on the construction site. Such measures shall include, but are not limited to:
 - Provide suitable containers for solid waste generated by construction activity;
 - Wet demolition of existing buildings;
 - Watering of driving surfaces and earth moving activities;
 - Installation of wind screening around property and each open floor above grade; and
 - Daily broom cleaning of above grade floors, adjacent streets and sidewalks.
- c) To reduce the noise impact of construction on nearby residential properties, all exterior construction activities shall be limited to the hours between 7:00 a.m. and 7:00 p.m. Monday through Friday and 8:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. for Saturday and Sunday. Low noise impact activities such as surveying, layout and weather protection may be performed at any time. After each floor of the structure or building is enclosed with exterior walls and windows, interior construction of the enclosed floors can be performed at any time.
- d) A minimum height of six foot (6') rigid security fencing, either wood or metal, shall be installed around the construction site within 30 days of the date when the first city permit is issued on projects where construction activity shall exceed 90 days.
- e) Exterior lighting and other illuminating equipment or materials shall be positioned, shielded, directed and located to not reflect or impact adjacent residential property and streets.
- f) Applicant shall comply with Boise City Fire Department requirements for water, access, and/or other requirements as determined by the Fire Marshal.
- g) Any conditions to be enforced during construction shall remain posted at each street abutting the construction site for the duration of the project. In addition to the posted conditions the permit holder shall also post an 11"x 17" laminated sign containing a project contact phone number, name of project contact and the Boise City contact number, 384-3845, to address issues as they arise. Failure to abide by any conditions set forth shall be grounds for revocation of Conditional Use Permit and/or Building Permits and may be subject the owner or owner's agents to fines and criminal citations.