

DRH08-00229
Pat Shalz
1004 N. 1004 N. 10th Street

Reason Statement (Approval)

1. In order for the Commission to approve a demolition or relocation request at least three out of the five Findings must be met. (2-18-9C) Three of the five Findings have been met. The garage is not classified as a contributing structure, the demolition of the garage will not adversely affect the District or the adjacent properties and plans have been submitted to redevelop the property if the demolition proceeds and such plans will have a positive effect on the District and/or adjacent properties.
2. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not in a commercial district. This finding is not applicable.
3. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. This application complies with the following guidelines.
 - A. "Maintain a proportional mass, size, and height to ensure the accessory building or dwelling unit is not taller than the primary building on the lot or does not occupy the entire backyard." (6.1.2) The garage will be proportionate to the large house. It will not be taller than the house, nor will it occupy the entire backyard.
 - B. "Subordinate the accessory dwelling unit, accessory building, or garage to the primary residential building on the site by placing the structure to the rear of the lot. Otherwise, consider locating the accessory building, dwelling unit, or garage to the side as long as it is set back substantially." (6.1.3) The garage will be placed at the rear of the lot.
 - C. "Use the same roof form as the existing primary building." (6.1.4) The garage will have the same roof form as the existing primary building.
 - D. "Use similar materials used on the primary existing building." (6.1.5) The garage will use similar materials as those used on the house including wood clad windows, stucco and stone.
 - E. "Design garages so they are alley loaded." (6.1.7) The garage will be alley loaded.
 - F. "Maintain proportional lot coverage as found on the neighboring properties of the same block. Maximum lot coverage of all buildings should not exceed 30% of the total lot area. Minimum open space should be 40% of the total lot area." (6.1.8.) The garage will bring the lot coverage up to 29%.
4. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction.) This application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. This application complies with the following guidelines.

- A. “Removing or radically changing buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished” is not recommended. (pg. 102) The existing garage is not important in defining the overall historic character of the property. Its removal will not diminish that character.
 - B. “Introducing new construction onto the building site which is visually incompatible in terms of size, scale, design, materials, color and texture; which destroys historic relationships on the site; or which damages or destroys important landscape features” is not recommended. (pg. 105) The garage will be visually compatible in terms of size, design and materials.
5. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. The application is not in compliance with the following goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan and the North End Plan.
 - A. The proposed use or design of the property should reflect the character of the adjacent neighborhood and be compatible with it. (p. 17) The design of the garage reflects the character of the property.
 - B. The unique character of the neighborhood should be maintained, including architectural style, sitting on the lots, orientation of the units and landscaping characteristics. (p. 18) The unique character of the neighborhood will be maintained because of the way the architectural details of the garage match those of the house.
6. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the district. The project is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education and cultural aspects of the district because it meets the Standards of the Secretary of the Interior, the goals of the North End Plan and the Guidelines of the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts.
7. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the district and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. **This application does not comply with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the request for any variances.**
2. A contributing building, site, structure or object adds to the historic architectural qualities, historic associations, or archeological values for which a property is significant because (a) it was present during the period of significance, and possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time or is capable of yielding important information about the period, or (b) it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria. The site is listed on the National Register of Historic Places.