

DRH08-00256
Teresa Harrington
1503 N. 17th Street

Reason Statement (Denial)

Pursuant to Boise City Code 2-18-9 A and B of Boise Municipal Code, the request to remove a tree and modify the roof in order to incorporate a second floor is congruous with the historical, architectural, archeological, educational or cultural aspects of the Historic District because:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (1995 Edition), the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Districts, the North End Plan and the Boise City Comprehensive Plan are references often utilized by the Historic Preservation Commission to determine whether a change is congruous with the historic and architectural qualities of the Historic District.

1. The Commission's decision in regard to Certificates of Appropriateness for alterations, as described in 2-18-09 (A), shall be based on six Findings as applicable to that property. (2-18-11 01)
 - A. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not in a commercial district.
 - B. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. This application does not comply with the following guidelines.
 - a. "Design a new addition to preserve the established massing and orientation of the building and character of the block." (4.1.1) The proposal will change the established massing of the building by making it appear more elongated.
 - b. "Designing a new addition in a manner that makes clear what is historic and what is new." (pg. 112) The jog in the roofline aids in making clear what is historic and what is new. Removing this jog will make this line less clear.
 - C. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction.) This application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. This application does not comply with the following guidelines.

- a. "Designing new exterior additions to historic buildings or adjacent new construction which is compatible with the historic character of the site and which preserves the historic relationship between the building or buildings and the landscape. (pg.105) The jog in the roofline ensures that the addition is compatible with the historic character of the site. Removing it will make the house uncharacteristically long, which is not compatible with the historic character of the site.
 - b. It is not recommended to "construct a new addition that creates an appearance inconsistent with the historic character of the building." (4.1.11) Removing the jog in the roofline will create an appearance inconsistent with the historic character of the building by creating an unusual proportion.
 - c. "Radically changing, damaging, or destroying roofs which are important in defining the overall historic character of the building so that, as a result, the character is diminished" is not recommended. (pg. 78) Removing the jog in the roof will radically change the roofline by extending it in a way that is not right for the style of the house. The roof is important in defining the historic character of the building, and this action will diminish that historic character.
 - d. "Removing or radically changing buildings and their features or site features which are important in defining the overall historic character of the property so that, as a result, the character is diminished is not recommended. (pg. 102) The large tree is a site feature that is important in defining the overall historic character of the property. Its removal will diminish the character of the property.
- D. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. The application is in compliance with the following goals and objectives of the Comprehensive Plan and the North End Plan.
- a. The unique character of the neighborhood should be maintained, including architectural style, sitting on the lots, orientation of the units and landscaping characteristics. (p. 18) Removal of the tree and the jog in the roof will not maintain the architectural style of the house or the landscaping characteristics of the lot or the neighborhood.
 - b. Protect historically and culturally significant resources that contribute to community identity and history. Goal, page 5-12 The project will not protect this historically or culturally significant resource.
- E. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the district. The project is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education or cultural aspects of the district because it complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts and the North End Plan.

- F. BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the district and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. This application complies with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the request for any variances.
2. A contributing building, site, structure or object adds to the historic architectural qualities, historic associations, or archeological values for which a property is significant because (a) it was present during the period of significance, and possesses historic integrity reflecting its character at that time or is capable of yielding important information about the period, or (b) it individually meets the National Register eligibility criteria. The structure was constructed during the era of significance and has retained its compatibility. It is contributing.