



## Planning & Development Services

Boise City Hall, 2nd Floor  
150 N. Capitol Boulevard  
P. O. Box 500  
Boise, Idaho 83701-0500

Phone: 208/384-3830  
Fax: 208/384-3753  
TDD/TTY: 800/377-3529  
Website: [www.cityofboise.org/pds](http://www.cityofboise.org/pds)

# 1

## Planning Division Staff Report

<b>File Number</b>	DRH08-00291
<b>Applicant</b>	Karen and Robert Moore
<b>Property Address</b>	1807 North 19 <sup>th</sup> Street
<b>Public Hearing Date</b>	22 September 2008
<b>Heard by</b>	Historic Preservation Commission
<b>Analyst</b>	Matt Halitsky, AICP
<b>Checked By</b>	Sarah Schafer, Historic Preservation Manager

---

### Public Notification

Radius notices mailed to adjacent properties:  
Staff posted notice on site on:

**5 September 2008**  
**5 September 2008**

---

### Table of Contents

1. Project Data and Facts	2
2. Land Use	2
3. Project Proposal	3
4. Ordinance / Standards	4
5. Analysis / Findings	4
6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions	5

## 1. Project Data and Facts

<b>Applicant/Status</b>	Karen and Robert Moore <i>owners</i>
<b>Architect/Representative</b>	Catherine Scott
<b>Location of Property</b>	1807 North 19 <sup>th</sup> Street
<b>Size of Property</b>	6,100 square feet
<b>Present Zoning and Land Use</b>	R-1CH <i>Single Family Residential with Historic Overlay</i>
<b>Historic District</b>	North End
<b>Date of Construction</b>	1941
<b>Style</b>	National Style
<b>Status</b>	Contributing
<b>Square Footage of Existing House</b>	1,217 square feet (house), 600 square feet (garage)

<b>Description of Applicant's Request</b>
The applicant is proposing to demolish a portion of the existing detached garage and construct a 290 square foot addition, consisting of an accessory dwelling unit.

## 2. Land Use

<b>Description and Character of Surrounding Area</b>
The surrounding neighborhood is a mixture of single and one and one-half story homes, with single-story garages accessed off of a rear alley.

<b>Site Characteristics</b>
The subject property is located on the west side of 19 <sup>th</sup> Street, just north of the intersection with Irene Street. An existing garage currently sits at the rear of the property, accessed via an alley. This garage does not appear on the 1956 Sanborn Maps, and is a contemporary addition to the property. The site is landscaped with mature trees and shrubs.
<b>Special Considerations</b>
None
<b>History of Previous Actions</b>
None

### 3. Project Proposal

#### Site Design

Land Use	Existing	Proposed
Percentage of the site devoted to building coverage:	24%	27%
Percentage of the site devoted to paving:	6%	7%
Percentage of the site devoted to landscaping:	70%	66%
TOTAL	100%	100%

#### Setbacks

Yard	Required	Proposed for Building	Proposed for Garage
Front (east)	15' (bldg.) 20' (garage)	No Change	78'
Side (north)	5' (bldg.) 5' (garage)	No Change	5'
Side (south)	5' (bldg.) 5' (garage)	No Change	20'
Rear (west)	15' (bldg.) 0' (garage)	No Change	No Change

#### Fencing

A six foot tall cedar fence currently encloses the rear yard. The applicant is proposing to replace this wood fence with a six foot tall stucco courtyard wall.

#### Structure(s) Design

Number and Proposed Use of Buildings	One Single-family Dwelling One Detached Garage with ADU
Maximum Building Height	16' 7" to the ridgeline
Number of Stories	One

## 4. Ordinance / Standards

Section	
11-04-04.01	General Standards
2-18-09	Historic Preservation Ordinance
4.1	Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts
	Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Structures

## 5. Analysis/Findings

### Contributing Analysis

**B.C.C Section 2-18-09 (A) (1) (c) states:** *As part of the application process for a Certificate of Appropriateness, the Planning Staff shall confirm the contributing or non-contributing classification of the property based on the criteria set forth in the definitions of Section 2-18-02.*

The subject home was constructed in 1941 and has retained its historic integrity. The massing of the house is the same, and it retains its character defining features such as the clapboard siding and front gable. The property is still contributing.

### Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts, Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Structures

The applicant is proposing to construct a 290-square foot addition to the existing garage to provide an accessory dwelling unit (ADU). A portion of the existing garage will be converted to provide additional living space for the ADU, as well. The design of the ADU is consistent with the residential design guidelines. The height of the addition will match that of the existing garage, which in turn matches the height of the existing home. Lot coverage will not exceed 30-percent, and the addition will not be visible from the public right-of-way (North 19<sup>th</sup> Street). Materials for the proposed addition will match those existing on the garage, hardiboard lap siding with metal clad windows and painted wood trim. Roof pitch will match that existing, while wood brackets and a front gable will provide additional architectural interest and modulation of the front wall plane. The addition can be constructed without the removal of mature trees. The accessory building is clearly subordinate to the main structure and sufficient parking is provided to accommodate both dwelling units. Staff recommends approval of the addition and ADU as proposed. To remain consistent with the zoning ordinance, the new parking area must be paved, with a three-foot landscaping buffer along the south property line in this location.

A six-foot high courtyard wall is also proposed in the application to replace an existing cedar fence equal in height. This wall will be constructed of cement blocks with a stucco finish. Though a wood or wrought iron fence in this location would be appropriate, staff recommends against the six foot high concrete wall. The massing of such a wall is inconsistent with the design of the historic home, as well as the neighborhood. A more appropriate screening method could be used to provide privacy while maintaining the design aesthetic of the area.

## 6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions

**Pursuant to Boise City Code 2-18-9 A and B of Boise Municipal Code, the proposed development is congruous with the historical, architectural, archeological, educational or cultural aspects of the historic district because:**

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (1995 Edition), the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Districts, the North End Plan and the Boise City Comprehensive Plan are references often utilized by the Historic Preservation Commission to determine whether a change is congruous with the historic and architectural qualities of the historic district.

1. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A* states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not within one of the Commercial Districts therefore this finding does not apply to this application.
2. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B* states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. The application will comply with the requirements of this finding.
3. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C* states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction). This application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. The proposal neither creates a false sense of history, nor detracts from the historic neighborhood as a whole.
4. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D* states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. The application is in compliance with the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan. The proposal promotes redevelopment while retaining the historic integrity of the property and character of the neighborhood.
5. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E* states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or

cultural aspects of the district. As conditioned, this application is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education and cultural aspects of the district.

6. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F* states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the district and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. This application complies with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI without the need for a waiver or variance.

### **Site Specific Conditions of Approval**

1. Compliance with plans and specifications submitted to and on file in the Planning and Development Services Department dated received 22 August 2008, except as expressly modified by the following conditions:
  - a. Pursuant to §11-10-04.02(F), the proposed parking area must be paved.
  - b. A three-foot landscaping buffer is required between the proposed parking area and the side property line.
  - c. The six foot high stucco courtyard wall shall not be constructed. A more appropriate material, such as wood or wrought iron may be used as a privacy fence to enclose the rear yard.

### **Standard Conditions of Approval**

2. The applicant shall comply with the Boise City Fire Code.
3. Prior to a Building Permit and prior to any construction on the site, an Erosion and Sediment Control Permit must be obtained from the Building Division of the Planning and Development Services Department.
4. No change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall be valid unless in writing and signed by the applicant or his authorized representative and an authorized representative of the City of Boise. The burden shall be upon the applicant to obtain the written confirmation of any change and not upon the City of Boise.
5. Any change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall require the applicant to comply with all rules, regulations, ordinances, plans or other regulatory and legal restrictions in force at the time the applicant or successors in interest advise the City of intent to change the planned use of the property described herein unless a variance in said requirements or

other legal relief is granted pursuant to the law in effect at the time the change in use is sought.

6. If the applicant does not act on the Certificate of Appropriateness through the commencement of construction, or extended pursuant to the Boise City Code, within eighteen months, it will become null and void without further notification from this department.
7. The applicant shall be required to obtain a Building Permit prior to the start of construction.

### **Construction Site Requirements**

8. The practices required below are intended to mitigate the impact and disturbance of residential property owners during the construction of adjacent buildings or structures. The following conditions apply to all construction-related activities ranging from grading and demolition activities to final occupancy on any land or parcel falling under the proprietary ownership of the permit applicant.
  - a) Prior to the issuance of a building permit and prior to the commencement of any construction on-site, an Erosion and Sediment Control (ESC) permit must be obtained from the Planning and Development Services Department. No grading, demolition or earth disturbing activities may start until an approved ESC permit and the associated site work or grading permits have been issued.
  - b) Measures shall be taken to manage construction debris and trash on the construction site and efforts shall also be made to provide reasonable controls to minimize fugitive dust on the construction site. Such measures shall include, but are not limited to:
    - Provide suitable containers for solid waste generated by construction activity;
    - Wet demolition of existing buildings;
    - Watering of driving surfaces and earth moving activities;
    - Installation of wind screening around property and each open floor above grade; and
    - Daily broom cleaning of above grade floors, adjacent streets and sidewalks.
  - c) To reduce the noise impact of construction on nearby residential properties, all exterior construction activities shall be limited to the hours between 7:00 a.m. and 7:00 p.m. Monday through Friday and 8:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. for Saturday and Sunday. Low noise impact activities such as surveying, layout and weather protection may be performed at any time. After each floor of the structure or building is enclosed with exterior walls and windows, interior construction of the enclosed floors can be performed at any time.

- d) A minimum height of six foot (6') rigid security fencing, either wood or metal, shall be installed around the construction site within 30 days of the date when the first city permit is issued on projects where construction activity shall exceed 90 days.
- e) Exterior lighting and other illuminating equipment or materials shall be positioned, shielded, directed and located to not reflect or impact adjacent residential property and streets.
- f) Applicant shall comply with Boise City Fire Department requirements for water, access, and/or other requirements as determined by the Fire Marshal.
- g) Any conditions to be enforced during construction shall remain posted at each street abutting the construction site for the duration of the project. In addition to the posted conditions the permit holder shall also post an 11"x 17" laminated sign containing a project contact phone number, name of project contact and the Boise City contact number, 384-3845, to address issues as they arise. Failure to abide by any conditions set forth shall be grounds for revocation of Conditional Use Permit and/or Building Permits and may be subject the owner or owner's agents to fines and criminal citations.