



## Planning & Development Services

Boise City Hall, 2nd Floor  
150 N. Capitol Boulevard  
P. O. Box 500  
Boise, Idaho 83701-0500

Phone: 208/384-3830  
Fax: 208/384-3753  
TDD/TTY: 800/377-3529  
Website: [www.cityofboise.org/pds](http://www.cityofboise.org/pds)

3

# Planning Division Staff Report

<b>File Number</b>	DRH08-00296
<b>Applicant</b>	St. Joseph's School and the Roman Catholic Diocese of Boise
<b>Property Address</b>	825 West Fort Street
<b>Public Hearing Date</b>	22 September 2008
<b>Heard by</b>	Historic Preservation Commission
<b>Analyst</b>	Matt Halitsky
<b>Checked By</b>	Sarah Schafer

---

## Public Notification

Radius notices mailed to adjacent properties:  
Staff posted notice on site on:

**5 September 2008**  
**5 September 2008**

---

## Table of Contents

1. Project Data and Facts	2
2. Land Use	2
3. Project Proposal	3
4. Ordinance / Standards	4
5. Analysis / Findings	4
6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions	8



### 3. Project Proposal

#### Site Design

Land Use	Existing	Proposed
Percentage of the site devoted to building coverage:	52%	54%
Percentage of the site devoted to paving:	47%	45%
Percentage of the site devoted to landscaping:	<1%	<1%
TOTAL	100%	100%

#### Setbacks

Yard	Required	Proposed for Building	Proposed for Garage
Front (north)	20' (bldg.)	No Change	N/A
Side Street (east)	20' (bldg.)	0'	N/A
Side Street(west)	20' (bldg.)	No Change	N/A
Rear (south)	10' (bldg.)	8'	N/A

A Variance to the east and south setbacks is required.

#### Fencing

No changes to existing fencing are proposed under this application.

#### Structure(s) Design

Number and Proposed Use of Buildings	One Cathedral One Rectory One School with Gymnasium
Maximum Building Height	37' 6" to top of highest parapet wall
Number of Stories	Two

## 4. Ordinance / Standards

Section	
11-04-04.01	General Standards
2-18-09	Historic Preservation Ordinance
2-18-11.04	HD Overlay Zone Findings
	Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Structures

## 5. Analysis/Findings

### Contributing Analysis

**B.C.C Section 2-18-09 (A) (1) (c) states:** *As part of the application process for a Certificate of Appropriateness, the Planning Staff shall confirm the contributing or non-contributing classification of the property based on the criteria set forth in the definitions of Section 2-18-02.*

The St. Joseph Gym Annex was constructed in 1947 and designed by the successor architectural firm to Tourtellotte and Hummel. The property was listed on the National Register of Historic Places in 1982. Although modified several times in its history, the school and annex retain enough architectural integrity and historic significance to remain contributing.

### Section 2-18-9 C Demolition or Relocation.

*After the designation by ordinance of an historical district, or historical district - residential, no building or structure which is a part of such district shall be demolished or moved until after an application for Certificate of Appropriateness relating to the demolition or moving of such building or structure has been submitted to and approved by the Commission. A Certificate of Appropriateness must be issued prior to the issuance of any building or other permit required by the City for the demolition or moving of any building or structure which is part of an historical district or historical district - residential. A Certificate of Appropriateness shall be required regardless of whether other licenses or permits are required for the moving or demolition of such building or structure.*

*1. Findings. In order for the Commission to approve a demolition or relocation request at least three (3) out of the five (5) following findings must be met:*

*a. That the building, project, site or structure is not classified as contributory to the district.*

Both the school and the gymnasium / classroom annex are classified as contributing structures in surveys dating from 1997. The applicant has not met this Finding.

*b. That the building, object, site or structure cannot reasonably meet National, State or Local criteria for designation as an historical or architectural landmark.*

Neither the site as a whole nor the classroom building individually have enough architectural or historical significance to reasonably meet National, State or Local criteria for designation as an historical or architectural landmark.

The applicant has met this Finding.

*c. That demolition of the building, object, site or structure would not adversely affect the character of the District and/or the adjacent properties.*

The proposed demolition is of a small portion of the gymnasium / classroom annex located at the rear of the structure along an alley internal to the campus. Only a small portion is located along 8<sup>th</sup> Street. The new addition will have minimal impact to adjacent properties as the campus itself is institutional in nature, and the development is not readily visible from nearby residences.

The applicant has met this Finding.

*d. That the owner has reasonably demonstrated that rehabilitation of the building, object, site or structure would not be economically feasible.*

This alternative has not been explored. The applicant has not met this Finding.

*e. That plans have been submitted to redevelop the property if the demolition proceeds, and such plans will have a positive effect on the District and/or adjacent properties.*

Plans have been submitted to reconstruct the classroom annex slightly larger than the original and with two stories. The addition will provide valuable added classroom space as well as an indoor connection to the school proper, without the need of exiting the annex or filing through the gymnasium. The design of the new addition is sensitive to the original 1947 construction by maintaining similar form, height and massing, as well as utilizing a scored stucco finish to blend with the concrete of the gymnasium and stucco finish of the 1991 addition.

The applicant has met this Finding.

**The applicant has met three out of the five findings.**

#### **Section 2-18-11.04 “HD” Overlay Zone - Findings**

The applicant is proposing to demolish approximately 2,357 square feet of the rear of the classroom / gym annex of St. Joseph School and replace it with a two-story 6,903 square foot addition to provide added classroom space. The addition is located at the rear of the structure along an internal alley, with only a small portion visible from North 8<sup>th</sup> Street. As mentioned above, the school is located within the Hays Street Historic District, a residential district, therefore the adopted Commercial Design Guidelines do not apply. As the residential design guidelines most applicable to the development are included within the design review Findings required for the ‘HD’ overlay zone, that is the section of Ordinance used to review this application.

*For projects within an “HD” overlay zone, the following objectives and Findings, in addition to those cited under §2-18-11.01, shall be considered where applicable to the proposal:*

##### *I. Objective – Site Design*

*The application shall be reviewed by the Commission to determine compatibility and impact both on and adjacent to the site as it relates to access, parking lot design, landscaping, grading and storm drainage, and other development of the site. To accomplish said objective, the Commission shall coordinate design input and requirements from other agencies. The decision of the Commission with regards to site design shall be based upon the following Findings as they relate to historic preservation:*

- A. That the site design minimizes impact of traffic on adjacent streets and that the pedestrian and bicyclist have been provided for by requiring sidewalks, landscaping and safe parking lot design as appropriate.*
- B. That the proposed landscaping enhances the historic district and neighborhood with attributes that include, but are not limited to, protection of desirable existing trees, provision of street trees and adequate screening methods where needed to buffer adjacent uses and unsightly areas or features.*
- C. That on-site grading and drainage have been designed so as to minimize off-site impact and provide for erosion control as required by the Boise City Public Works Department, Ada County Highway District and/or other jurisdictional agency.*
- D. That utility service systems and equipment do not detract from the building design or adjacent buildings, and the size and location of all service systems are appropriate and maintainable.*

Both Fort and North 8<sup>th</sup> Streets are currently improved with curb, gutter and sidewalk abutting the site, providing safe pedestrian access to the school and new addition. A metal

gate is also in place that prohibits vehicular traffic from entering the alley during school hours. Although bicycle racks currently exist, staff recommends an advisory condition that the applicant will be responsible for providing bicycle racks as required by §11-10-01(G) of the Zoning Ordinance. One bicycle space is required for every 30 required parking spaces. An increase in traffic is not expected as a result of the current proposal.

Per the submitted site plan, the east stairwell encroaches over the property line and the building wall encroaches into the required 20-foot setback from North 8<sup>th</sup> Street. In addition, the south side of the addition encroaches two feet into the required rear setback. Variances are required for both. A right-of-way vacation of the alley may alleviate the need for a variance for the required rear setback. A license agreement is required by the Ada County Highway District (ACHD) for the stairwell encroachment along the eastern façade. Both the vacation and the license agreement require ACHD approval.

Existing landscaping is located mainly within the ACHD right-of-way, as most of the site not occupied by the existing school complex is paved. This landscaping will be unaffected by the current proposal. No additional landscaping is proposed at this time. Drainage is required to be retained on site and all details are to be reviewed and approved by the Boise City Public Works Department and the Ada County Highway District at time of building permit submittal. All signage requires separate approval. All utility systems are required to be located underground.

## *II. Objective – Structure Design*

*The design of all proposed buildings shall be reviewed in accordance with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts and/or Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts, as well as the following Findings:*

- A. The mass of the building shall be reviewed for its relationship to other buildings within the historic district and area, and with the use proposed by the applicant.*
- B. The height to width relationship shall be compatible and consistent with the predominant architectural character of the historic district.*
- C. The exterior of the building shall provide shadow relief and design interest compatible with the architectural character of the area.*
- D. The appropriateness of materials and colors shall be reviewed as they relate to building mass, shadow relief and compatibility with other buildings within the historic district and area.*

The portion of the classroom annex the application is proposing to remove is located along the south side of the gymnasium at the rear of the property. A two-story 6,903 square foot classroom addition is proposed in its place. The addition is designed to blend with the

existing gymnasium and the two previous additions to the school. The scale and massing remains the same, with only a small increase in the actual footprint of the structure. As mentioned above, this increase in the footprint will require a variance or vacation of the alley. The eastern wall is proposed in the same location as the original. The height of the proposed addition, though taller than the adjacent gymnasium, is measured at 31' 8 ½ ", roughly a foot higher than the adjacent parapet of the gym. The highest parapet on the school is measured at 37' 6", located along the north façade. Though the addition is taller than the adjacent gymnasium, it does not increase the overall height of the school, and helps to distinguish old from new, consistent with the residential design guidelines and the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. Staff recommends as a condition of approval the proposed skylight be located such that it is not readily visible from the street below.

Scored stucco with aluminum windows are proposed for the addition. The choice of materials and the neutral color are intended to help unify the design aesthetic between the original school, the gymnasium and the various additions throughout the years. The stucco will blend with the 1991 and 2002 additions, as well as complement the concrete construction of the original gym. The existing school contains vinyl windows along the north and west facades, with commercial-grade aluminum windows along the southern elevation of the additions. Staff supports the use of the heavier aluminum windows on the proposed addition, in order to remain consistent with the additions of the past. Although vinyl is noted on the submitted elevations, the applicant has verified that the proposed material is aluminum.

Overall, the proposed addition provides the needed space while at the same time presents a design that does not overpower the original school or gymnasium, maintains the rhythm of the campus, and retains the scale and massing of the school. The materials chosen help unify the design of the overall school, helping to blend the addition at the rear of the structure. The impact of the two-story addition will be minimal to the surrounding neighborhood. Only a small portion is located along North 8<sup>th</sup> Street, and the footprint of the addition is only slightly larger than that portion being removed. The proposed addition complements the school and meets the requirements of the Historic Preservation Ordinance. Staff recommends approval of the application as conditioned.

## 6. Conclusion and Recommended Conditions

**Pursuant to Boise City Code 2-18-9 A and B of Boise Municipal Code, the proposed development is congruous with the historical, architectural, archeological, educational or cultural aspects of the historic district because:**

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (1995 Edition), the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Districts, the North End Plan and the Boise City Comprehensive Plan are references often utilized by the Historic Preservation Commission



to determine whether a change is congruous with the historic and architectural qualities of the historic district.

1. In order for the Commission to approve a demolition or relocation request at least three out of the five Findings must be met (2-18-9C). Three of the five Findings have been met. The property cannot currently meet landmark status, its partial demolition will not adversely affect the District or the adjacent properties, and the submitted plans will have a positive effect on the District and the adjacent properties.
2. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 A* states that the request shall be consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts. This application is not within one of the Commercial Districts therefore this finding does not apply to this application.
3. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 B* states the request shall be consistent with the Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts. Though located within a residential historic district, this application involves an institutional building, for which the residential guidelines are not applicable.
4. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 C* states the request shall be consistent with The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, or other standards as applicable (preservation, restoration or reconstruction). This application is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. The proposal neither creates a false sense of history, nor detracts from the historic structure or neighborhood as a whole.
5. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 D* states the request shall support the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and the plans referenced therein. The application is in compliance with the goals, objectives and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan. The proposal promotes redevelopment while retaining the historic integrity of the property and character of the neighborhood.
6. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 E* states that based on the adopted design guidelines the request will not be incongruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, educational or cultural aspects of the district. As conditioned, this application is congruous with the historical, architectural, archaeological, education and cultural aspects of the district.
7. *BCC Section 2-18-11.01 F* states that the request must comply with the dimensional standards and other applicable requirements of Title XI (Zoning Ordinance) including, but not limited to setbacks, height restricts and parking requirements unless the Commission finds that modifying the standards is necessary to protect the overall characteristics of the district and to comply with the adopted design guidelines. As conditioned, this application complies with all of the dimensional requirements of the underlying zone as laid out in Title XI.

8. *BCC Section 2-18-11.04 (I)* states that the request shall be reviewed to determine compatibility and impact both on and adjacent to the site as it relates to access, parking lot design, landscaping, grading and storm drainage, and other development of the site (Site Design). As conditioned, this application complies with the applicable Findings relating to site design within an HD Overlay.
9. *BCC Section 2-18-11.04 (II)* states that the request is consistent with the Design Guidelines for Boise City's Historic Districts and/or Boise City Design Guidelines for Residential Historic Districts, as well as Findings A-F regarding structure design, including building mass, proportion, design interest, and relationship of exterior materials. As conditioned, the application complies with the applicable Findings related to structure design within an HD Overlay.

### **Site Specific Conditions of Approval**

1. Compliance with plans and specifications submitted to and on file in the Planning and Development Services Department dated received 26 August 2008, except as expressly modified by the following conditions:
  - a. The applicant must apply for and receive a variance to the required setback from North 8<sup>th</sup> Street.
  - b. The applicant must apply for and receive a setback variance to the rear property line adjacent to the alley, or the alley must be vacated through ACHD.
  - c. The applicant must obtain a license agreement with ACHD for the stairway encroachment along the east façade.
  - d. The applicant must provide adequate bicycle parking consistent with the requirements of the Zoning Ordinance.
  - e. The proposed skylight will be set back such that it is not readily visible from the street.
  - f. The vinyl windows proposed in the submitted elevations shall be aluminum to match those existing on the southern elevation.

### **Standard Conditions of Approval**

2. The applicant shall comply with the Boise City Fire Code.
3. Prior to a Building Permit and prior to any construction on the site, an Erosion and Sediment Control Permit must be obtained from the Building Division of the Planning and Development Services Department.

4. No change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall be valid unless in writing and signed by the applicant or his authorized representative and an authorized representative of the City of Boise. The burden shall be upon the applicant to obtain the written confirmation of any change and not upon the City of Boise.
5. Any change in the planned use of the property by the applicant shall require the applicant to comply with all rules, regulations, ordinances, plans or other regulatory and legal restrictions in force at the time the applicant or successors in interest advise the City of intent to change the planned use of the property described herein unless a variance in said requirements or other legal relief is granted pursuant to the law in effect at the time the change in use is sought.
6. If the applicant does not act on the Certificate of Appropriateness through the commencement of construction, or extended pursuant to the Boise City Code, within eighteen months, it will become null and void without further notification from this department.
7. The applicant shall be required to obtain a Building Permit prior to the start of construction.

### **Construction Site Requirements**

8. The practices required below are intended to mitigate the impact and disturbance of residential property owners during the construction of adjacent buildings or structures. The following conditions apply to all construction-related activities ranging from grading and demolition activities to final occupancy on any land or parcel falling under the proprietary ownership of the permit applicant.
  - a) Prior to the issuance of a building permit and prior to the commencement of any construction on-site, an Erosion and Sediment Control (ESC) permit must be obtained from the Planning and Development Services Department. No grading, demolition or earth disturbing activities may start until an approved ESC permit and the associated site work or grading permits have been issued.
  - b) Measures shall be taken to manage construction debris and trash on the construction site and efforts shall also be made to provide reasonable controls to minimize fugitive dust on the construction site. Such measures shall include, but are not limited to:
    - Provide suitable containers for solid waste generated by construction activity;
    - Wet demolition of existing buildings;
    - Watering of driving surfaces and earth moving activities;
    - Installation of wind screening around property and each open floor above grade; and
    - Daily broom cleaning of above grade floors, adjacent streets and sidewalks.

- c) To reduce the noise impact of construction on nearby residential properties, all exterior construction activities shall be limited to the hours between 7:00 a.m. and 7:00 p.m. Monday through Friday and 8:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. for Saturday and Sunday. Low noise impact activities such as surveying, layout and weather protection may be performed at any time. After each floor of the structure or building is enclosed with exterior walls and windows, interior construction of the enclosed floors can be performed at any time.
- d) A minimum height of six foot (6') rigid security fencing, either wood or metal, shall be installed around the construction site within 30 days of the date when the first city permit is issued on projects where construction activity shall exceed 90 days.
- e) Exterior lighting and other illuminating equipment or materials shall be positioned, shielded, directed and located to not reflect or impact adjacent residential property and streets.
- f) Applicant shall comply with Boise City Fire Department requirements for water, access, and/or other requirements as determined by the Fire Marshal.
- g) Any conditions to be enforced during construction shall remain posted at each street abutting the construction site for the duration of the project. In addition to the posted conditions the permit holder shall also post an 11"x 17" laminated sign containing a project contact phone number, name of project contact and the Boise City contact number, 384-3845, to address issues as they arise. Failure to abide by any conditions set forth shall be grounds for revocation of Conditional Use Permit and/or Building Permits and may be subject the owner or owner's agents to fines and criminal citations.