

# SPINK BUTLER

ATTORNEYS AT LAW

GEOFFREY M. WARDLE  
208.388.3321  
[GWARDLE@SPINKBUTLER.COM](mailto:GWARDLE@SPINKBUTLER.COM)

*Via Contemporaneous Application Submittal ([sschafer@cityofboise.org](mailto:sschafer@cityofboise.org))*

April 26, 2017

Sarah Schafer, Design Review  
City of Boise  
150 N. Capitol Boulevard  
PO Box 500  
Boise, ID 83701

**RE: Design Review Application for 1150 W. Myrtle Street  
SB Matter No. 23297.21**

Dear Sarah,

We are submitting applications for the property at 1150 W. Myrtle Street ("**Site**") for our client BVGC Parcel B, LLC ("**Applicant**"). We are proposing the addition of a drive through window to the previously approved 5,000 square foot retail building on the southeast quadrant of the property that is commonly known as Parcel B, but is now being called Pioneer Crossing.

## **A. Background**

Previously, the Applicant submitted a Design Review application for the larger property as DRH16-00079, which provided for the development of an office building on the southwest quadrant of the Site, a parking garage and commercial mixed use structure on the northeast quadrant of the Site, a retail building on the southeast quadrant of the Site, and all of the perimeter Site improvements for the project. DRH16-00079 was approved subject to certain additional conditions of approval. Thereafter, the Applicant and its affiliate submitted a Design Review application for the construction of a hotel on the northwest quadrant of the Site as DRH16-00328, which was also approved. The garage and hotel are presently under construction.

**MICHAEL T. SPINK** JOANN C. BUTLER **T. HETHE CLARK** GEOFFREY M. WARDLE **TARA MARTENS MILLER**

April 24, 2017  
Sarah Schafer, Design Review  
City of Boise  
Page 2

With this Application, the Applicant is requesting Design Review approval of the final design of the previously approved retail building on the Site, with the drive through that is being simultaneously sought through the Conditional Use Permit ("CUP") application that is transmitted herewith. We believe that this submittal satisfies all outstanding issues with respect to this parcel regarding compliance with the Site specific conditions of approval established in DRH16-00079.

A detailed analysis of the conditional use permit requirements and specific drive through requirements are set forth in the narrative we have provided with that application. We would request that it be incorporated and referenced if Staff has any issues or concerns related to this Application's adherence with the relevant requirements applicable to drive through uses in a C-5 zone.

A detailed presentation of the elements of Parcel B/Pioneer Crossing has been provided in the foregoing design review applications. However, as this Application is requiring a CUP to be heard by the Planning and Zoning Commission, the Applicant will provide some brief background information on this matter.

We would ask that if there are specific concerns with this Application and its compliance with DRH16-00079, that the submittal, approval, and related matters for DRH16-00079 be provided to the Committee. We will as a courtesy briefly address certain issues specifically germane to Design Review approval of the drive through element of this Application.

## **B. Nature of Application**

We are proposing the construction of a Panera Bread Bakery-Café at 1150 W. Myrtle Street. The building is approximately 5,000 square feet on a .83 acre parcel within a larger parcel that is approximately 5 acres in size. This includes a drive through. We believe that this remains consistent with the previously stated scope of design and philosophy of this project in DRH16-00079.

Development of Pioneer Crossing has occurred in consultation with the City of Boise and CCDC. In proposing a development plan for Pioneer Crossing, we have looked to the River Street-Myrtle Street Master Plan and Blueprint Boise to guide the development of the Site. We have also reviewed and incorporated as appropriate, elements of the Downtown Boise Design Review Guidelines, and Downtown Boise Streetscape Standards and Specifications.

With respect to the building approved in DRH16-00079, after visiting with Boise City Staff, we wanted to highlight certain modifications to the building as previously approved:

1. By bringing the building closer than previously proposed to Myrtle Street, we have been able to put the entrance right at the corner of the intersection and to provide a secondary pedestrian access directly onto Myrtle Street.

April 24, 2017  
Sarah Schafer, Design Review  
City of Boise  
Page 3

2. Significant glazing is now oriented to the intersection of Myrtle Street and 11<sup>th</sup> Street together with such additional pedestrian engaging features such as awnings, canopies, and planters.

3. As recommended by Staff, further modulation of the roof and elevations has been introduced to provide visual interest and to better define elements of the building.

4. Based upon the concerns with blank walls, additional planters and green screening elements have been added to all four elevations of the building.

5. The drive through facilities and service facilities are now screened by the pergola structure that has been proposed along the north and west elevations of the building.

6. Additional landscaping and screening has been proposed between the parking area and Myrtle Street.

### **C. Design Considerations**

We wanted to briefly identify and discuss certain design considerations related to this Site as a part of the larger Pioneer Crossing development. Panera's design team at NORR provides the following explanation of the design intent and the philosophy behind this Application.

The focus of the building is geared towards the approachability from the pedestrian perspective. Although the site will continue to have a significant presence for the automobile, we feel that the location of the building at the corner of the lot has great potential to expand Boise's downtown pedestrian corridor to the northeast. The design enhances the corner location and encourages pedestrian activity by focusing the main entrance and exterior seating courtyard towards the corner of 11<sup>th</sup> and Myrtle St. Ample sidewalk space and patio dining space complement integral building planters with street trees to provide continuous walkability while softening the hardscape. The variation of building features coupled with green screens and storefront systems work to break up any blank walls and add to our aim of allowing the building to engage at the pedestrian scale along those streets and the Pioneer Corridor. The choice of building material, which include a combination of stucco and face brick colors, work to complement the landscaping and colors associated with the Rocky Mountains. We've also included a pergola structure in our design to screen the proposed drive through from both right-of-ways and have located the most vehicle intensive elements of the project to the interior of the site. Our intention was for this to be done in a way that does not call attention to the drive through, but rather mimics trellis structures commonly seen on exterior seating areas. The wooden structure balances the material palate of the rest of the building creating a cohesive design.

April 24, 2017  
 Sarah Schafer, Design Review  
 City of Boise  
 Page 4

We provide the following additional analysis regarding this Application's design considerations.

**1. Mixed-Use Nature of the Project.** This Application furthers the desired mixed-use nature of this project, by enlivening this area throughout the day and night. This approach is in furtherance of: (a) the mixed use designation for the Site on the future land use map for the Downtown Planning Area; and (b) DT-CCN 1.2 encouraging the development of a vibrant mix of uses in Downtown to support greater activity as set forth in Blueprint Boise, p. DT-9. This is also consistent with the goals of the River Street-Myrtle Street Master Plan, pp. 34-36. Beyond the addition of this Site as a mixed use element to the project, it provides a retail restaurant use that is not presently available in the immediate neighborhood.

**2. Internal Service Drives.** This project utilizes internal service drives, including the drive through facilities to reduce the impact upon the adjoining high speed high volume roadways. This is in furtherance of: (a) DT-CCN 1.4(b) to respect the traditional pattern of lots within blocks to avoid "superblocks"; (b) DT-CCN 1.4(a) to bring the buildings to the street orienting them towards the public sidewalks; (c) DT-CCN 1.5 to avoid strip commercial development; (d) DT-PKG 1 to utilize a mixture of public parking garages, together with on-street parking opportunities, to minimize the size of surface parking lots and to create pedestrian oriented spaces; and (e) DT-C 2.1 to embrace the traditional street grid or facilitating elements that approximate the traditional street grid as set forth in Blueprint Boise, p. DT-9, 11, and 14.

**3. Pedestrian Considerations and the Pioneer Corridor.** This Application refines the previously approved retail building. We will be moving the building closer to the intersection of Myrtle Street and 11<sup>th</sup> Street and orienting the public entrances to that intersection.

This ties together the pedestrian elements of Pioneer Crossing with the Pioneer Corridor and then connecting them to the Simplot facilities to the east. By integrating elements of the Pioneer Corridor on the southeast corner of the Site, we are further extending and enhancing this element to and through the Simplot project, and on into downtown Boise. This is an important connection to facilitate the Pioneer Corridor crossing Myrtle Street. This is in furtherance of: (a) DT-C 1.6 to enhance the pedestrian network downtown; and (b) DT-C 2.7, the Pioneer Corridor specifically upon the occurrence of development as set forth in Blueprint Boise, pp. DT-13 and 14. This is also consistent with the goals of the River Street-Myrtle Street Master Plan, pp. 30-33, 37, 48-53, 65-67, to enhance the Pioneer Corridor as a transportation, recreation, and park facility connecting downtown to the Boise River.

This is intended to better integrate with the Pioneer Corridor and the approved enhancements to that facility. This is in furtherance of: (a) DT-CCN 1.6(a) to provide a physical and psychological connection to adjoining neighborhoods; (b) DT-CCN 1.6(b) to provide walking and bicycle connections between Downtown and adjoining neighborhoods as set forth in Blueprint Boise; and (c) DT-C 2.5 to improve the pedestrian experience on these streets, pp. DT-9 and 14. The result of bringing the building all the way to Myrtle does impact the previously

April 24, 2017  
Sarah Schafer, Design Review  
City of Boise  
Page 5

approved configuration of landscaping on the Site. However, we are able to maintain the originally proposed number of alternating trees along Myrtle. By bringing the building to the street, we are able to extend canopies over the sidewalk, provide glass along most of the Myrtle Street elevation, and have an enlarged patio dining area along 11<sup>th</sup> Street to the north of the approved Pioneer Corridor Plaza. Additional landscape and wall enhancements have been proposed along the previously approved parking area to the west of the building and customers are directed out of the parking area to the pedestrian facilities located along the north service drive and to the south along Myrtle Street.

#### **D. Application of Design Review Standards**

The applicable Design Review standards are set forth in Boise City Code Section 11-03-04.12.C(7)(d). We will address these standards as follows:

**1. Drive Through Considerations.** At the outset, we will first address the relevant provisions of the Boise Downtown Design Standards regarding drive through facilities. Consistent with the provisions of Section 3.3.2 of the Boise Downtown Design Standards, care has been taken to apply those provisions relevant to drive through lanes. The drive through is oriented away from the public right of way and oriented to the interior of the property so that it is not between the building and the street. It has been located behind the building so as to allow for a stronger pedestrian orientation for the building and its entrances on 11<sup>th</sup> Street and Myrtle Street.

By locating the drive through lane to the interior of the Site, concerns with separation from public sidewalks has occurred. Significant attention has been paid to the elevations facing the public streets to enhance the amount of glass, awnings, and canopies adjacent to the streets. Orienting the entrance to 11<sup>th</sup> Street and Myrtle Street ensures that the primary public façades are inviting and not visually obstructed by the drive through facilities.

The required safety enhancements for pedestrians in the interior of the Site have been incorporated. With respect to the interior access drive and the drive through lane, even though the north elevation is not subject to block frontage standards, care has been paid to minimize blank walls. Additionally, interior sidewalks have been separated from the drive through facilities except at the location necessary to connect to the northwest service entrance.

**2. Site Design Requirements.** Pursuant to Section 11-03-04.12.C(7)(d)(i) of the Boise City Code, the design review committee is required to make specific findings regarding Site Design. The specific Site Design requirements will be addressed as follows.

(a) **Traffic Impact.** Section 11-03-04.12.C(7)(d)(i)(A) of the Boise City Code states that in evaluating design, "traffic impact is minimized and the pedestrians and cyclists have been provided for through the use of sidewalks, pathways, landscaping, and safe parking lot design." The use of internal service and access drives have been addressed in DRH16-00079 and in our CUP submittal. Care has been taken with the addition of a drive through to ensure that traffic travels through the Site in a safe and controlled manner. There are

April 24, 2017  
Sarah Schafer, Design Review  
City of Boise  
Page 6

no additional connections to the public streets with the existing service drives and approved access points being utilized. As set forth in the landscape plan and site plan care has been taken to define pedestrian areas and to guide them.

**(b) Landscaping, Stabilization, and Screening.** Section 11-03-04.12.C(7)(d)(i)(B) of the Boise City Code states that in evaluating design “landscaping screens buffer adjacent uses, and screen or conceal unsightly areas.” As set forth in the landscaping plan and the site plan additional screening and landscaping improvements have been proposed. The building itself screens the drive through and service facilities from the public rights of way. Additional care has been taken to enhance areas that may not have originally been screened.

**(c) Grading and Drainage.** Section 11-03-04.12.C(7)(d)(i)(C) of the Boise City Code states that in evaluating design “on-site grading and drainage have been designed so as to minimize off-site impact.” The original geotechnical plans for the Site and Pioneer Crossing project have been refined. The exterior perimeter improvements are presently under construction consistent with approved plans.

**(d) Signage.** Section 11-03-04.12.C(7)(d)(i)(D) of the Boise City Code states that in evaluating design signage should provide for business identification, minimize clutter, and comply with the sign regulations. We are presently in the process of finalizing a master sign plan for the larger project and have been in consultation with staff regarding the same. The elevations provided with the Application show the proposed location of building signage. All will be compliant with the requirements of the City of Boise.

**(e) Utilities.** Section 11-03-04.12.C(7)(d)(i)(E) of the Boise City Code states that in evaluating design that the size and location of utility systems do not detract from the design of the buildings. All utility and service requirements will be appropriately located and screened within the project. A shared transformer is being relocated to the north side of this Site and integrated in the landscaping screening the drive through facilities.

**(f) Exterior Material.** Section 11-03-04.12.C(7)(d)(ii)(D) of the Boise City Code states that in evaluating the project architecture, that the exterior materials should complement surrounding development in terms of color and relief. The exterior material treatments are discussed in more detail below. The materials are similar to what had previously been proposed, however modifications have occurred in the greater use of brick and canvas awnings.

**(g) Proximity to Residential Property.** Section 11-03-04.12.C(7)(d)(ii)(E) of the Boise City Code states that in evaluating the project architecture, impacts should be minimized on adjoining residential use, including those across a street or an alley. This is addressed in more detail in the CUP application. All residential uses will be more than 300 feet away from the property and screened from the drive through facilities by the building and Myrtle Street.

April 24, 2017  
Sarah Schafer, Design Review  
City of Boise  
Page 7

**3. Structure Design.** Pursuant to Section 11-03-04.12.C(7)(d)(ii) of the Boise City Code, the design review committee is required to make specific findings regarding the architectural design of the buildings. The specific structural design requirements will be addressed as follows. In addition to the previously approved retail building which has been slightly modified and relocated, we are providing a pergola structure for the drive through facilities. The drive through facilities have been placed and oriented to the interior of the Site away from 11<sup>th</sup> Street and Myrtle Street. The pergola structure has a masonry/brick base, and utilizes natural wood to provide screening of the drive through lane, the menu board, and the drive through window. This screening is again oriented primarily to 11<sup>th</sup> Street and Myrtle Street. There is a gap in the structure adjacent to the parking garage to the north to facilitate access to the service entrance and service facilities.

(a) **Mass.** Section 11-03-04.12.C(7)(d)(ii)(A) of the Boise City Code states that in evaluating the project architecture, "building mass should be consistent with development in the immediate area." The mass of this building is essentially the same as what had been proposed in DRH16-00079. It now has significantly more modulation along the roof and the various elevations oriented to the public right of way. It is appropriately sized and does not overwhelm the pedestrian facilities that are being proposed.

(b) **Façades.** Section 11-03-04.12.C(7)(d)(ii)(B) of the Boise City Code states that in evaluating the project architecture, that the height to width relationship is compatible and consistent with architecture in the area. As noted above and as discussed in more detail below, the building façades within the project are compatible with existing development.

(c) **Openings in the Façades.** Section 11-03-04.12.C(7)(d)(ii)(C) of the Boise City Code states that in evaluating the project architecture, façade openings "shall be consistent with the architecture in the area." To the extent possible, we have attempted to ensure that the street elevation is of an appropriate mass and scale and are oriented to the street. Significant amounts of glass are located adjacent to Myrtle Street and 11<sup>th</sup> Street. The entrances have been oriented to the exterior of the Site as well.

(d) **Exterior Material.** Section 11-03-04.12.C(7)(d)(ii)(D) of the Boise City Code states that in evaluating the project architecture, that the exterior materials should complement surrounding development in terms of color and relief. The exterior material treatments are discussed in more detail below. Efforts have been taken to utilize materials that are consistent with existing development while not being redundant or derivative. We are proposing significant use of brick.

(e) **Proximity to Residential Property.** Section 11-03-04.12.C(7)(d)(ii)(E) of the Boise City Code states that in evaluating the project architecture, impacts should be minimized on adjoining residential use, including those across a street or an alley. This is an urban setting located within the C-5 zone. This is addressed in more detail in the CUP application. All residential uses will be more than 300 feet away from the property and screened from the drive through facilities by the building and Myrtle Street.

April 24, 2017  
Sarah Schafer, Design Review  
City of Boise  
Page 8

**3. Consistency with Adopted Plans and Design Guidelines.** Pursuant to Section 11-03-04.12.C(7)(d)(iii) of the Boise City Code, the design review committee is required to make specific findings regarding the consistency of the project with plans and design guidelines previously adopted by Boise City.

**(a) Application to Buildings.** In developing the design of the Office Building and the Retail Building, the following design elements have been specifically addressed:

**(i) High Visibility Street Corners and Gateway Sites.** Consistent with the provisions of Sections 3.4.2 and 3.5 of the Boise Downtown Design Standards, special attention has been afforded to the corner of 11<sup>th</sup> Street and Myrtle Street. We have brought the building closer to Myrtle Street than previously approved in DRH16-00079. This permits us to provide for a larger outdoor seating area on the northeast side of the building and also allows us to put the primary entrance at the corner of 11<sup>th</sup> Street and Myrtle Street integrated with the enlarged pedestrian plaza that connects the Pioneer Corridor with the pedestrian facilities across 11<sup>th</sup> Street at JUMP.

**(ii) Service Area Location and Design.** Consistent with the provisions of Section 3.6 of the Boise Downtown Design Standards, we will screen service areas from adjoining roadways and properties. The drive through facilities and service facilities are oriented towards the parking garage and away from Myrtle Street and 11<sup>th</sup> Street. Obviously, all buildings have service facilities, so they are not prohibited, rather they need only be designed and screened consistent with the requirements of the Design Standards. The screening for the trash enclosure has been designed to integrate with the other screening and finished Site improvements. Additional screening of the parking area, drive way areas, and drive through by landscaping enhancements have been proposed as part of this application, further screening all service and drive through facilities from Myrtle Street.

**(iii) Architectural Character.** Consistent with the provisions of Section 4.1 of the Boise Downtown Design Standards, the building elements of the project on the Site have been designed to promote original and distinctive building designs. We have retained a modern design, making extensive use of brick, glass, natural wood, and stucco. Stucco is being utilized to provide additional contrast and color.

**(iv) Building Massing and Articulation.** Consistent with the requirements of Section 4.2 of the Boise Downtown Design Standards, we have designed the building elements of the project to comply, to the extent possible, with the stated goals of the Boise Downtown Design Standards. We have brought the Retail Building closer to Myrtle Street. We would remind you that it



April 24, 2017  
Sarah Schafer, Design Review  
City of Boise  
Page 9

is set back somewhat from the intersection of 11<sup>th</sup> and Myrtle to facilitate the enhancement of the pedestrian connection between the Pioneer Corridor and Simplot projects.

(v) **Building Materials.** We have also sought to provide additional variation through the proposed materials and color. As noted above, we have sought to provide variety of textures and colors and to ensure that the placement of materials comply with the requirements of the Boise Downtown Design Standards and provide visual relief.

(vi) **Blank Wall Treatments.** Along Myrtle Street and 11<sup>th</sup> Street, we avoid blank walls through the use of glass, variation in materials, and appropriate landscaping. The wall located on the north of the building is interior to the Site, is screened by the pergola structure, and has additional elements to minimize blank screens. We have appropriately screened them and minimized blank walls.

#### E. Accompanying Materials

In support of this Application for a Design Review approval of the two hotels and parking garage, as well as the overall Site design, we are transmitting this analysis together with the following documents for the various buildings:

- Site Plan
- Fire Service Plan
- Landscape Plan
- Floor Plan
- Elevations, Perspectives, and Materials for the Building
- Color Photographs of the Site and Site Perspectives
- Affidavit of Legal Interest

We look forward to presenting the Application to the Design Review Committee and look forward to its review of this project.

Sincerely,



Geoffrey M. Wardle  
GMW:g  
Attachments