

# PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT SERVICES

MAYOR: David H. Bieter | INTERIM DIRECTOR: Jason Blais

May 9, 2019

Laura Mattos Visum Development Group 119 S. Cayuga Street Ithaca, NY 14850 Iaura@visumdevelopment.com

## RE: DRH19-00096 | 600 West Front Street

Dear Applicant:

This letter is to inform you of the action taken by the Boise City Design Review Committee on your request for approval to construct an eight-story mixed-use building with ground floor retail and 75 residential units on property located in a C-5DDC (Central Business with Downtown Design Review and Capital Boulevard Special Design District Overlay) zone.

The Committee, at their hearing of April 10, 2019, voted to **approve** your project. Based on the findings included in the Project Report, the Committee concluded your project complies with Section 11-03-04.12 C (7)(d) of the Zoning Ordinance, the Design Review Guidelines and the goals and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan.

Enclosed is a copy of the Conditions of Approval, as well as the Findings of Fact, included in the Project Report. Please be advised detailed Findings can be reviewed in the Planning and Development Services Department on the 2<sup>nd</sup> floor of City Hall.

May we also take this opportunity to advise you of the following:

- a. This approval will not take effect until after the appeal period has lapsed.
- b. A Building Permit will be required from the Building Division prior to construction.
- c. If this Design Review Permit is not acted upon by the commencement of construction or extended, pursuant to the Boise City Code, within twenty-four months, it will become null and void without further notification from this department.
- d. A decision or condition of a Committee Level Design Review may be appealed to the Planning & Zoning Commission within ten (10) calendar days from the date of the Committee's action. The Appeal must be written, accompanied by the appropriate fee, and submitted to the Boise City Planning and Development Services Department prior to the deadline set forth herein. Appeal Application Forms are available in the Planning Department on the 2<sup>nd</sup> floor of City Hall.

BOISE CITY HALL: 150 N. Capitol Boulevard | MAIL: P.O. Box 500, Boise, Idaho 83701-0500 | P: 208-608-7100 | F: 208-384-3753 | TDD/TTY: 800-377-3529 BOISE CITY COUNCIL: Lauren McLean (President), Elaine Clegg (President Pro Tem), Scot Ludwig, Lisa Sánchez, TJ Thomson, Holli Woodings e. Boise City Council. Once the Council makes a final decision, the landowner may request a regulatory taking analysis for that decision and/or conditions within 28 days following such final decision in accordance with Section 67-8003 of the Idaho Code.

If you have any questions, please feel free to contact me at (208)608-7077.

Sincerely, .n.

Josh Wilson Manager, Design Review and Historic Preservation PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT

JW/nh

cc: Renee Strand | Holst Architecture, Inc. | 110 SE 8<sup>th</sup> Ave. | Portland, OR 97214 <u>rstrand@holstarc.com</u> Cahill Jones | Jones Investment Prop., LLC | 600 W. Front St. | Boise, ID 83702 <u>cahill@bizzprint.com</u> Robert & Patricia Rietveld | 255 S. Capitol Blvd., Apt. 1604 | Boise, ID 83702 <u>rietveld.idaho@gmail.com</u>

Attachments:

- Conditions of Approval
- Findings of Fact



## **Conclusion and Recommended Conditions**

Staff finds the project complies with Sections 11-03-04.12 C (7)(d) of the Zoning Ordinance, the Design Review Guidelines and the goals and policies of the Boise City Comprehensive Plan and would recommend **approval** subject to the following conditions.

## Site Specific Conditions

- 1. Compliance with the plans and specifications submitted to and on file in the Planning and Development Services Department dated received March 13, 2019 and May 1, 2019 (revised elevations and floor plans), except as expressly modified by the following conditions:
  - a. Continue the brick veneer from the east elevation onto the firewall located on the north property line.
  - b. Indicate the location of the trash staging area in front of the building and provide confirmation from Boise City Public Works that the Solid Waste Location and Design Standards have been met.
  - c. Provide confirmation from Boise City Forestry that the *Liriodendron Tulipifera* 'Fastigiata' (Arnold Tulip Tree) is an allowed species in the right-of-way.
  - d. The sidewalk café depicted requires approval by the Boise City Clerk's office.
  - e. Comply with all requirements of the Ada County Highway District (ACHD) in the memo dated May 1, 2019. An Air Rights Agreement shall be obtained from ACHD for the portions of the building which encroach into the right-of-way on 6<sup>th</sup> Street.
  - f. Comply with all requirements of the Idaho Transportation Department (ITD) in the memo dated April 2, 2019. An Air Rights Agreement shall be obtained from ITD for the portions of the building which encroach into the right-of-way on Front Street.
  - g. The suspended pavement systems depicted are required under the hardscape surface. Coordinate design and soil volumes with Boise City Public Works.
  - h. The windows above the ground floor shall be recessed a minimum of two-inches from the façade.
  - i. Comply with comments from Boise Public Works Solid Waste in the memo dated March 20, 2019, which outlines requirements for Internal Solid Waste Rooms.

Revised plans indicating compliance with the above conditions shall be submitted to Planning Staff for approval prior to application for any construction permits.



## **Responsible Agencies and Other Boise City Departments**

- 2. A Building Permit approval is contingent upon the determination that the site is in conformance with the Boise City Subdivision Ordinance. Contact the Planning and Development Services Subdivision Section at (208)608-7089 regarding questions pertaining to this condition.
- 3. Comply with the Building Department comments in the memo dated March 15, 2019.
- 4. The applicant shall comply with the requirements of the Boise City Public Works Department, including but not limited to:
  - . Drainage dated March 15, 2019
  - . Sewers
  - . Street Lights dated March 25, 2019
  - . Solid Waste dated March 20, 2019
  - . Pretreatment dated March 15, 2019

Please contact BCPW at (208)608-7150. All items required by BCPW shall be included on the plans/specifications that are submitted for a Building Permit. Please note that any changes or modifications by the owner to the approved Storm Water Plan must be resubmitted to BCPW for approval.

- 5. Prior to a Building Permit and prior to any construction on the site, an Erosion and Sediment Control Permit must be obtained from the Building Division of the Planning and Development Services Department.
- 6. A Building Permit is contingent upon approval from Boise City Community Forestry for tree planting within rights-of-way, per Title 9, Chapter 16, Section 09-16-05.2. Contact Boise City Community Forestry at (208)608-7700 with questions regarding this condition.
- 7. The applicant shall comply with the Boise City Fire Code.
- 8. Comply with Irrigation District requirements.

## Standard Conditions of Approval

- 9. The applicant is encouraged to participate in a Transportation Demand Management Program which may include the following measures:
  - a. Designation of an Alternative Transportation Coordinator to promote alternatives to automobile transportation to employees. This should be coordinated with ACHD's Commuteride Program and ValleyRide.
  - b. Secure bicycle parking and storage areas.



- c. Establish employee alternative transportation incentive programs which may include discounted or free transit passes for employees, carpool/vanpool matching services through coordination with ACHD Commuteride, and flexible work hours.
- 10. All loading activities and site maintenance (with the exception of snow removal) are limited to Mondays through Fridays between the hours of 7:00 a.m. and 10:00 p.m. and Saturdays and Sundays between the hours of 8:00 a.m. and 8:00 p.m.
- 11. Construction activity on site is restricted to the hours of 6:30 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. Mondays through Fridays and 8:30 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. on Saturdays and Sundays.
- 12. All landscaping areas shall be provided with an underground irrigation system. Landscaping shall be maintained according to current accepted industry standards to promote good plant health, and any dead or diseased plants shall be replaced. All landscape areas with shrubs shall have an approved mulch such as bark or soil aid.
- 13. All landscape trees shall be pruned in accordance with the American National Standards Institute's <u>Standard Practices for Tree Care Operations</u> (ANSI A300 latest edition). No trees on the site shall be topped, headed back, rounded over or otherwise disfigured. Contact Boise City Community Forestry at (208)608-7700 for information regarding tree care operations.
- 14. An approved protective curbing shall enclose all landscape areas where they are adjacent to parking areas or driveways.
- 15. Swales/retention/detention areas shall not be located along the streets, unless it can be shown that landscaped berms/shrubs will screen the swales.
- 16. Vision Triangles as defined under Section 11-012-03 of the Boise City Code shall remain clear of sight obstructions.
- 17. In compliance with Boise City Code, anyone planting, pruning, removing or trenching/excavating near any tree(s) on ACHD or State right-of-ways must obtain a permit from Boise City Community Forestry at least one (1) week in advance of such work by calling (208)608-7700. Species shall be selected from the <u>Boise City Tree Selection Guide</u>.
- 18. Existing healthy trees shall be saved where not in conflict with building locations or required driveways as determined by the Boise City Forester and approved by the Design Review staff. Existing grading shall be altered as little as possible, with a minimum compaction of topsoil within the tree dripline area. Soil sterilants shall not be applied near the dripline of these trees. Pervious paving shall be provided within the dripline area, unless otherwise approved by the Boise City Forester and the Design Review staff, to allow surface air and water penetration to the feeder root zone of trees near paved areas.



- 19. Deciduous trees shall be not less than 2" to 2½" caliper size at the time of planting, evergreen trees 6' to 8' in height, and shrubs 1 to 5 gallons, as approved by the Design Review staff. All plants are to conform to the American Association of Nurseryman Standards in terms of size and quality.
- 20. All surface drainage shall be reviewed and approved by ACHD and BCPW. Perimeter grading shall be designed to match the existing grade of the adjoining properties.
- 21. All parking areas and driveways shall be paved and striped. All accessible spaces and approved compact spaces shall be clearly marked and signed as required. Bicycle parking, as required by Section 11-07-03.3.B of the Boise City Code, shall be provided.
- 22. All Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) requirements shall be met.
- 23. Any outside lighting shall be reflected away from adjacent property and streets. Exterior light fixture details shall be submitted to the Design Review staff for approval prior to issuance of a Building Permit. Impacts on residential areas shall not be permitted.
- 24. The illumination level of all light fixtures shall not exceed two (2) foot-candles as measured one (1) foot above the ground at property lines shared with residentially zoned or used parcels.
- 25. Boise City Fire Department requires water mains, fire hydrants and temporary Fire Department access to be installed, inspected and approved by the Fire Department prior to commencement of combustible construction. Note: Temporary water and temporary access during construction may be permitted upon request to, and approval by, the Fire Department.
- 26. No obstructions (landscaping, signs, fences or other elements) shall encroach upon any required fire access or fire facility.
- 27. All signs will require approval from the Planning and Development Services Department prior to installation.
- 28. Trash receptacles and on-grade and rooftop mechanical fixtures and equipment shall be concealed from public view by use of an approved sight-obscuring method. All screening materials shall be compatible with the building materials/design.
- 29. Utility services shall be installed underground.
- 30. Rain gutters shall be provided on eaves projecting over pedestrian entries and walkways to protect the occupants from undesirable storm runoff. Through-wall mechanical units shall be architecturally integrated into the building design, as approved by the Design Review staff. Roof vents shall be screened or painted to match the roof color.



- 31. No trees within street right-of-ways shall be removed or pruned without approval from Boise City Community Forestry in compliance with Boise City Code. No trees within the property, as shown on the plans and approved by the Design Review Committee or the Design Review staff, shall be removed without the approval of the Design Review Committee or the Design Review staff and in compliance with Boise City Code.
- 32. In the event a tree is removed without prior approval, the tree shall be replaced with a tree with trunk caliper 1.5 times the one removed or with a sufficient number of trees, as approved by the Design Review Committee or the Design Review staff, with a trunk caliper not less than 4" and a total cumulative caliper area equal to 1.5 times the caliper area of the tree(s) removed. Caliper shall be as measured by the American Nurseryman's Association standards. For example, if a 12" caliper tree is removed, it must be replaced with either one 18" caliper tree or three 6" caliper trees or five 4" caliper trees. The replacement requirement may be modified upon a showing made to the Design Review Committee or the Design Review staff of disease or death of the tree which was not caused by neglect.
- 33. An Occupancy Permit will not be issued by the Planning and Development Services Department until all of these conditions have been met. In the event a condition(s) cannot be met by the desired date of occupancy, the Planning Director will determine whether the condition(s) is bondable or should be completed, and if determined to be bondable, a bond or other surety acceptable to Boise City will be required in the amount of 110% of the value of the condition(s) that is incomplete.
- 34. No change in the terms and conditions of this approval shall be valid unless in writing and signed by the applicant or his authorized representative and an authorized representative of Boise City. The burden shall be upon the applicant to obtain the written confirmation of any change and not upon Boise City.
- 35. Any change by the applicant in the planned use of the property, which is the subject of this application, shall require the applicant to comply with all rules, regulations, ordinances, plans, or other regulatory and legal restrictions in force at the time the applicant, or successors of interest, advise Boise City of intent to change the planned use of the property described herein, unless a variance in said requirements or other legal relief is granted pursuant to the law in effect at the time the change in use is sought.



## Analysis/Findings

## Applicant's Proposal

The applicant has requested approval of an eight-story mixed-use housing development with 75 residential units and ground floor commercial space. The project is located on the northwest corner of Front Street and 6<sup>th</sup> Street at a very prominent intersection in downtown Boise. The footprint of the building covers the small parcel almost completely, and no parking is proposed with the project. The ground floor will house uses including an entrance lobby, a commercial tenant space, a bike room, and utility areas; residential units are located on floors two through eight.

The property is located in the Downtown Planning Area and designated Downtown Mixed Use in Blueprint Boise. This designation is intended to support the various adopted plans and policies for different parts of Downtown. It encourages intense, mixed-use development and refers to the adopted master plans for more detailed guidance. The site is also located within the River Street- Myrtle Street Master Plan (revised plan adopted in 2004). It envisions a compact, urban neighborhood with high density residential, office and neighborhood-oriented retail uses.

## Vehicular/Pedestrian Circulation and Connections

Boise City Code Section 11-03-04.12.C.7.d states:

A. Traffic Impact: That traffic impact is minimized, and the pedestrians and cyclists have been provided for through the use of sidewalks, pathways, landscaping, and safe parking lot design.

The proposed project contains no on-site parking and no vehicular access to the site is proposed. Conditions have been included to ensure the project complies with the adopted Boise Downtown Streetscape Standards, and the project will enhance the pedestrian network through the construction of improvements to the right-of-way streetscapes.

The pedestrian circulation for the site is through a public sidewalk network on the south and east sides of the site. The east side of the site (6th Street) has a sidewalk 11-feet in width. The south side of the site on Front Street has sidewalk varying in width from 19-feet to 25-feet in width. The Streetscape Standards and Specifications are adopted within the Downtown Design Standards and Guidelines, and the proposed sidewalks widths meet or exceed the required standards. There is a bike storage room located on the ground floor of the building with 75 bicycle parking spaces, meeting the full number required for the project. The Boise City Police Department has reviewed this location and has no concerns.

## Service Area Location and Design

The service area for the site is located internal to the building on the ground floor. Boise Public Works Solid Waste has commented that the trash room must comply with Solid Waste Location and Design Standards, which require a staging area for dumpsters on the exterior of the building. The applicant should clarify the location of this area and confirm with Public Works that the location is appropriate.



### Landscape Design

#### Streetscape Design for 6th Street

The frontage on 6<sup>th</sup> Street is designated as the Urban Concrete with Brick streetscape. The design includes a 14-inch curb zone, a 4-foot furnishing zone surfaced with pavers, and a concrete sidewalk that varies in width. The proposed streetscape plan follows the standards as proposed. The street trees proposed on 6<sup>th</sup> Street are *Liriodendron Tulipifera* 'Fastigiata' (Arnold Tulip Tree). The applicant shall confirm with Community Forestry that this is an allowed species or propose an alternative street tree species. Suspended pavement systems have been proposed under the street trees as required.

#### Streetscape Design for Front Street

The frontage on Front Street is designated as the Urban Concrete streetscape. The design includes a 14-inch curb zone, a 4-foot furnishing zone, and a concrete sidewalk that varies in width. The proposed streetscape plan varies slightly from the standards as proposed, with a raised patio and concrete planters proposed in the right-of-way of Front Street. This variation is allowable and will help to meet existing grade, provide a buffer for pedestrians from the high traffic volumes on Front Street, and create an attractive retail space patio. The planters must be approved by Idaho Transportation Department. The street trees proposed on Front Street are *Ginkgo Biloba* 'Autumn Gold' (Autumn Gold Ginkgo), which are approved for use within the right-of-way. Suspended pavement systems have been proposed under the street trees as required.

#### Grading and Drainage

Boise City Code Section 11-03-04.12.C.7.d states:

B. That on-site grading and drainage have been designed so as to minimize off-site impact and provide for erosion control.

The grading and drainage will be reviewed by Boise City Public Works at the time of building permit along with the Ada County Highway District and ITD to ensure all drainage is contained on site and street sections meet all agency requirements.

## <u>Signage</u>

Boise City Code Section 11-03-04.12.C.7.d states:

C. Signage: That signs provide for business identification minimizes clutter and comply with the sign regulations.

Signs require submittal of a separate sign application. The project must comply with all ordinance regulations in effect at the time the sign application is submitted.

#### **Utilities**

Boise City Code Section 11-03-04.12.C.7.d states:

B. Utilities: That utility systems do not detract from building design and that their size and location are appropriate and maintainable.



<u>Downtown Design Standards and Guidelines Section 4.2.7 Rooftop mechanical areas</u> <u>states:</u> All buildings must design rooftop mechanical and other related technical equipment/materials in an integrated, coherent manner consistent with the composition below them. All vertical screening elements must incorporate high quality cladding materials the same or similar to the type of materials use for the walls below.

There are a number of mechanical units proposed on the roof of the structure. The submitted drawings indicate that the screen will be the full height of the mechanical units and will be constructed of a metal composite panel in color consistent with the exterior of the building.

## Structure Design

Material Location	Type/Color
Roof:	TPO (or similar) / White
	Greenroof w/ Pavers
Exterior Walls:	Architectural Concrete / Smooth / Natural
	Brick / Smooth and Velour /Dark Gray
	Viroc Cement Panels / Ochre
	Stucco / Smooth and Raked / Light Gray
	Metal Composite Panel / Black
Windows:	Aluminum Storefront / Black
	Commercial Vinyl / Black
Soffit and Fascia:	Metal / Black
	Precast Coping / Acid Etched / Dark Gray
	Brick / Dark Gray
Other:	Metal Screen Panel / Perforated / Black and Ochre
	Painted Steel Guardrails / Black and Ochre

#### Building Design and Materials

## **Building Design Summary**

The proposed building is an 8-story mixed use housing project with 75 units and ground floor commercial space. The building generally uses a simple form and pallet of materials, relying on window patterning, material changes, cantilevered building masses, and accent colors to provide design interest and create shadow lines. The design successfully utilizes these techniques to create a varied building mass which prevents sterile, box-like appearance and provides visual interest on all elevations.

At the ground level, full height storefront windows have been featured prominently at the corner of Front and 6<sup>th</sup> Streets, coinciding with the commercial tenant space and residential lobby. The building takes advantage of the location at a prominent intersection, addressing the public realm with transparency and a building overhang which combine to engage the pedestrian and create a strong street presence. The cantilevered building masses on both 6<sup>th</sup> Street and Front Street contain living space on the second through eighth floors, providing an opportunity for balconies at the edge of the mass which are angled to meet the building face and provide an interesting building shape on the most prominent elevation.





6th Street and Front Street



North Elevation



At the rear, to the north, the building steps back 10-feet on floors two through eight to create a modulated building form, provide private second floor patios, and allow for increased window openings due to a larger building wall separation from the property line. At the portion of the building near 6<sup>th</sup> Street on the north elevation there is an area of firewall, due to the proximity to the north property line. The create a cohesive material palette and consistent of application of materials, this wall should be finished with the brick veneer to carry on the concept of two building masses- a contemporary design addressing the streets and a more traditional design addressing the historically significant properties to the north.

Overall the building design provides changes in materials and varied building forms through offset wall planes, which prevents a box-like structure and provides design interest on all four sides of the building.

## **Building Materials**

Boise City Code 11-03-04.12 C (7)(d) states: Exterior materials that complement surrounding development in terms of color and relief should be utilized.

Section 4.4 Building Materials of the Downtown Design Standards and Guidelines provides direction on materials.

<u>4.4.1 Quality building materials.</u> Utilize building materials that convey a sense of quality and permanence. Specifically, buildings within the Downtown Core (area between 3rd, 16th, Washington, and the river) and all multi-story commercial and mixed-use building shall utilize natural stone, brick, decorative concrete, and/or metal together with required window area into the building's base. The base includes the first floor for the buildings six stories or less, and at least the first two floors for taller buildings.

Departure: Departures will be considered provided the base material meets the intent of the standards.

The main materials used on this building are concrete composite panels, brick, and stucco. The wall plane breaks between the masses on the upper floors are also used as material breaks, providing order and consistency with the building material application. The stucco is used as a secondary material on the north and west elevations and is meant to pay homage to the Basque Block to the north. The ground floor has large areas of aluminum storefront window systems and provides a quality base to the building. The proposed dark brick with ochre accents is a rich color palette and will complement the surrounding area. The materials and color palette are consistent with the contemporary design of the building and are appropriate.

## **Building Massing and Articulation**

Boise City Code 11-03-04.12 C (7)(d) states: The height to width relationship should be compatible and consistent with the architecture in the area.



The structure is 90-feet to the top of the parapet wall, with the elevator overrun and mechanical screens extending slightly higher. The design of the building uses modulated wall planes to break up the perceived massing with simple forms and a consistent application of materials. The massing is similar to recently approved and constructed buildings in the vicinity and is of a scale anticipated in the vicinity of the downtown core. Buildings which occupy less than a quarter-block are exempt from any tower massing standards/separations until above the tenth floor. The proposed structure is eight stories in height and is therefore exempted.

## 4.2.3 Façade Articulation

1. Storefronts and other buildings with non-residential uses on the ground floor shall include at least three articulation features every 50-feet (maximum) to create a pattern of small storefronts.

- a. Window fenestration patterns and/or entries;
- b. Use of weather protection features;
- c. Use of vertical piers/columns;
- d. Change in building material or siding style;
- e. Vertical elements such as lighting or art element;
- f. Providing vertical building modulation of at least 12 inches in depth if tied to a change in roofline modulation;
- g. Other design techniques that effectively reinforce a pattern of small storefronts.



Window fenestration patterns, weather protection, vertical modulation, and material changes are used consistently throughout the structure, meeting the articulation requirements.

## 4.2.4 Articulated building entries

The primary building entrance shall be designed as a clearly defined and demarcated standout architectural feature of the building. Such entrances should be easily distinguishable from regular storefront entrances on the building.



The primary resident entries for the structure are easy to distinguish for the pedestrian through the corner storefront and prominent building overhangs.

### Shadow Relief and Architectural Details

Boise City Code 11-03-04.12 C (7)(d) states:

Openings in the facade shall be consistent with the architecture in the area. (For example, balconies, bays, and porches are encouraged with a minimum of monotonous flat planes to provide shadow relief).

The design of the building is a departure from traditional building design but is consistent with recent architecture in the area. The openings in the building are like many of the new structures within the downtown. The windows are set within the wall plane and a minimum two-inch reveal from the surrounding wall plane should be required. These punched window openings are appropriate and consistent with the overall design of the downtown and with recently constructed buildings. Texture and architectural detailing have been provided throughout the building with the proposed materials, including brick, composite metal panels, and the use of an ochre accent color on the building, which contrasts with the dark brick. The proposed cantilevered living space over 6<sup>th</sup> Street and Front Street will add an additional depth and modulation to the building and create shadow lines.

#### **Building Design Summary**

The design will contain appropriate colors, materials, fenestration and architectural details for the building type and location. Each of these elements will break up the massing of the structure, provide an additional depth of character through shading and relief and provide architectural design interest to the building. Based on the preceding analysis and the suggested conditions of approval, the proposal will integrate well with the other developments that are present within the downtown area and will comply with Boise City Code Section 11-03-04.12.C.7.d.

