



Planning & Development Services

Boise City Hall, 2nd Floor
150 N. Capitol Boulevard
P. O. Box 500
Boise, Idaho 83701-0500

Phone: 208/384-3830
Fax: 208/384-3753
TDD/TTY: 800/377-3529
Website: www.cityofboise.org/pds

Historic Preservation Commission

Hearing Minutes of April 27, 2009

Commission Members Present Christopher Pooser, Chair, Scott Chandler, Cathy Sewell, Barbara Dawson, Betsy McFadden, Steve Smith, Liz Edrich and Amy Pence-Brown

Members Present Sarah Schafer, Matt Halitsky, Robert Lockward (Legal) and Nicki Heckenlively

DRH09-00075 / Amy Binion

Location: 1223 E. Bannock Street

Requests Historic Preservation approval to replace three side windows with vinyl windows on property located in an R-2H (Combined Residential with Historic Overlay) zone.

MATT HALITSKY: The applicant is proposing to replace three wood windows on the west elevation of the home with vinyl windows. They are the same vinyl windows that you reviewed at last month's worksession. We're recommending approval with the condition that they not be vinyl. Basically the house has a consistent mullion pattern and it was discussed at the worksession that the mullion pattern or mullion patterns at all on that specific vinyl window couldn't be reproduced with the quality expected in the Historic District.

CHAIRMAN POOSER: When you say the March worksession are you talking about the actual window itself that was presented?

MATT HALITSKY: That's correct.

COMMISSIONER DAWSON: The window man was supposed to get back to us with some addresses of properties that we could look at to see the depth and so forth on those windows. We have not heard back.

MATT HALITSKY: I have not heard anything.

COMMISSIONER CHANDLER: What I understand you are objecting to is not necessarily the vinyl portion of it, but the fact that the vinyl window that is proposed does not, in the upper pane, have the three side by side panes with the two mullions. Is that what I'm understanding?

MATT HALITSKY: That's correct. If you recall I believe the mullion was internal to the glass on this specific brand of vinyl window. I recall that the Commission thought they'd be more appropriate for use in replacement windows without a mullion pattern. Since this one is pretty prominent this is why we're recommending the denial.

COMMISSIONER CHANDLER: At this point, what is being proposed is just the three windows along the...I forget what street that is...the rest of the house has the wood windows with the mullion pattern in question, which would remain?

MATT HALITSKY: That's correct.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY

AMY BINION (APPLICANT): I would like to replace the three windows on the west side. They are nonfunctioning and I wanted to replace them with something that wouldn't be extremely expensive. They are on the west side of the house so you can't see them unless you're my neighbor. In the winter you could probably see them. My neighbor is fine with it.

COMMISSIONER McFADDEN: So it's not on the street side of the house?

AMY BINION: No.

COMMISSIONER DAWSON: When I went by the house and I went by on foot it appeared that the windows on the east side, on the other side of the house had been replaced?

AMY BINION: Yes, with wood.

COMMISSIONER DAWSON: And the front windows?

AMY BINION: With wood.

COMMISSIONER McFADDEN: Did you explore sash replacements at all on those particular windows?

AMY BINION: No.

COMMISSIONER McFADDEN: Sometimes that's one option. I don't know if Staff talked about that. Can we talk about that as an option? Where you can just replace the sash, but you don't have to replace the whole window. Many wood window companies offer that now.

AMY BINION: Part of my problem too is that it is a single pane and would it be replacing...

COMMISSIONER McFADDEN: You'd replace the glass. It would be double paned. You'd replace the whole glass without disturbing...from what I understand...I've not done it, but from what I understand you can do this without disturbing the interior trim and such. That might be something you might want to look into.

COMMISSIONER CHANDLER: Essentially the frame stays...the removable part...the sash, which is what goes around the glass, that's what gets replaced. Many of the custom wood window manufacturers will make just the sash to replace that so it is much simpler and cheaper because you're not tearing out things that you have to then build such as your siding, your interior trim and everything else. So even though the sash itself may not necessarily be cheap you save a tremendous amount of labor when it comes to just what is entailed in replacing an entire window. For the most you get the benefits of matching the window pattern or mullions.

AMY BINION: Okay. I'm pretty sure that's what I did to the rest of the house. It was five years ago or so I don't recall.

COMMISSIONER McFADDEN: Those were much more expensive than the window that you're proposing?

AMY BINION: Yes. They were \$1,000 a window or so.

COMMISSIONER McFADDEN: Okay. I guess we have to decide on what is in front of us.

CHAIRMAN POOSER: Matt, in the staff report you had mentioned the Fiberex composite material. Is that what came before us last year?

MATT HALITSKY: That's correct. In that instance you were comfortable allowing that on a more widespread basis. My impression from last month's worksession was that with this specific window you wanted to review it case by case.

PUBLIC PORTION CLOSED

COMMISSIONER CHANDLER: Staff has made a good point as far as the mullion style. Yes, it's not on the street side, but it's still consistent with the home and I don't think it's an unreasonable requirement to keep that same mullion pattern. That is one of the distinctive things with the home. It is an unusual pattern, but it is distinctive and pretty much defines the character of the house. You start changing that even though it is not on a primary façade it would be unfortunate and I'm less concerned about them whether it's vinyl or whatever it is. It's just a mullion pattern and keeping it not with an interior mullion or snap on variety. I support Staff's conclusion on this.

COMMISSIONER DAWSON: I concur with Commissioner Chandler. In view of the fact that all of the other windows have been changed out to wood windows with a 3/1 or 4/1 mullion pattern, the whole home needs to be consistent.

CHAIRMAN POOSER: I agree with those comments. The mullion pattern is important to the home.

COMMISSIONER CHANDLER: I'm trying to figure out exactly what form of a motion to take on this because it would be nice to have something for the applicant to work with. That is what Staff has done here...add a site specific condition rather than denying their application and say approved window materials shall be used for replacement with a mullion pattern to match the existing on the home, which I think is reasonable.

COMMISSIONER CHANDLER MOVED TO APPROVE DRH09-00075 WITH THE SITE SPECIFIC CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL INCLUDING CONDITION 1.A. AND THE STANDARD CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL.

COMMISSIONER DAWSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

ROLL CALL VOTE 8:0. MOTION CARRIES UNANIMOUSLY.